

CONTENTS

	PAGE
The Challenge of Training for Non-Routine Tasks David L. G. Jacobs	177
Death and Transfiguration Ellen B. Rhudy and Philip D. Yaney	183
Hawaii Overcomes Its Unusual Recruiting Problems Norman Sharpless	188
Personnel Implications of Police-Fire Integration Robert A. Earle	192
Development of a Standard Staffing Program William Brody	197
Progress—But from a Firm Foundation Robert A. Gross	203
Preretirement Counseling Programs: Six Different Approaches . . . Maurice F. Ronayne	206
A Guide for Maintaining Uniform Discipline Alvin Karp	211
Making a Good Recruiting Program Better Harry P. Petrie and Sid Panush	216
Research and Results Cecil E. Goode	222
Around the Personnel World	225
Personnel Opinions	232
"In drafting personnel legislation, what are the pertinent factors to be considered in deciding whether the position of personnel director should or should not be in the classified service?"	
The Bookshelf	237
"Constructing Evaluation Instruments" . . . "Modular Management and Human Leadership" . . . "Prolonged Illness—Absenteeism" . . . "Leader Behavior: Its Description and Measurement" . . . "Ideal and Practice in Public Administration" . . . "The Foundation for Research on Human Behavior" . . . Book and Pamphlet Notes . . . "Communicating Personnel Policy" (An Annotated Bibliography, Library, U.S. Civil Service Commission).	
Personnel Literature	251

Public Personnel Review

The quarterly journal of the Public Personnel Association provides a medium for the publication of factual material, and for materials that may represent divergent ideas, judgments, and opinions. The views expressed in articles and other contributions are those of the authors, and may not be construed as reflecting the views of the Association or the editors unless so stated.

Subscription Rates. U. S. and Canada, \$6.50 per year; foreign \$7.50; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Prices on back issues quoted on request.

All correspondence regarding manuscripts, subscriptions, and advertising should be addressed to the editorial and business offices of *Public Personnel Review*, Room 456, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois.

editorial

To Be or Not To Be—Independent

JULY, 1958, the midpoint in the Diamond Jubilee year celebrating the inauguration of civil service in the United States, offers an occasion for re-examining a fundamental concept upon which civil service systems in the United States rest. This basic concept: a civil service agency properly should be independent of other government departments. The concept and its converse implications hold meaning for systems of public personnel management in other countries as well as in the United States.

Traditional civil service systems in the United States were designed to rid the public service of spoils politics and to put the selection of competent government personnel on a competitive basis without political pull or discrimination. To achieve their goals, public personnel agencies initially were established as independent organizations which were in a position to control, to check, and to serve as watchdogs over executive agencies. Moreover, as the field of personnel management flourished, additional functions of classification, training, pay, employee relations—to mention but a few—were assumed by the independent civil service commissions and personnel boards.

In recent years several significant happenings in public management have raised serious doubts about the suitability of the independent personnel agency in our rapidly changing political and administrative environment. Hoover Commissions in the federal government of the United States, "little Hoover" commissions in state governments, and state legislatures have taken action to change the character of the independent civil service agencies and to create, within operating departments of government, a personnel department designed to *serve* executives and managers rather than *control* them.

The proposals made by various official committees and commissions in both federal and state governments of the United States follow a common pattern. Principal features

of this pattern are: a single director of personnel; a personnel department within the executive branch of the government; a personnel division within a division of administration; an advisory rather than an administrative or policy-making type of personnel board or civil service commission; in some cases, a personnel agency with functions limited to review, appeals, and other activities related to making the agency a "watchdog" of the merit system.

Efforts to create a civil service and personnel system as a *part* of rather than *apart from* management resulted in actual changes in the structure and organization of the personnel function. No assessment of public personnel developments can ignore the reality of these administrative changes. Such changes can be cited by chapter and verse.

In Kansas and Rhode Island, advisory personnel bodies were created and the personnel management functions were placed in departments of administration responsible to the Governor. Illinois, the most recent state to completely overhaul its personnel system, now supports a watchdog civil service commission and an operating personnel department in the Governor's office.

Many city governments operating under the council-manager form have created a separate department of personnel in which the director reports to the manager. Some of these manager cities have advisory personnel boards or commissions operating within the framework of line management; others continue to have a civil service commission functioning independently but paralleling and in some instances duplicating the personnel programs in the city manager's office.

The trend toward integrating personnel with over-all management has now entered the U. S. federal government scene by way of Senator Joseph S. Clark's proposal to reorganize the functions of the U. S. Civil Service Commission—making them largely advisory—and to establish a personnel department under a personnel administrator appointed by and holding office at the will of the President. Significantly, this proposal has the wholehearted support of the National Civil Service League, which was re-

(Continued on page 219)

Meet the Authors

William Brody

... author of *Development of a Standard Staffing Pattern* is Director of Administration of the Philadelphia Department of Public Health. He has been Director of Personnel for various agencies including the U. S. Economic Stabilization Agency, the National War Labor Board, and the New York City Health Department, and recently served as Assistant to the Executive Director of the National Jewish Hospital at Denver. He has taught courses in public administration and public personnel administration at Johns Hopkins University, College of the City of New York, and Hunter College; his publications include *Personnel Administration in Public Health Nursing* and articles appearing in *Public Personnel Review* and other professional periodicals. He has just completed a special project for the American Hospital Association.

Robert A. Earle

... author of *Personnel Implications of Police-Fire Integration* is Director of Personnel, City of Fort Lauderdale, Fort Lauderdale, Florida, where he has participated in formulating and installing a modified form of co-operative police-fire service. He entered the field of municipal personnel administration in 1949 and has served in his present position since 1955. He received his Bachelor of Science Degree from the University of Washington and did graduate work in psychology. He has served as an abstractor for Public Personnel Review for the past two years.

Robert A. Gross

... author of *Progress—But From a Firm Foundation* is Chief, Classification and Compensation, Department of Personnel, St. Louis. He received his Bachelor's degree in Public Administration from Washington University in 1948 and has had graduate work in political science there. He has been Chief, Classification and Compensation, in

the Department of Personnel, City of St. Louis, since 1952. He was previously employed as Administrative Analyst, City and County of Denver, 1948-50, and Director of Research, St. Clair County (Illinois) Taxpayer's Association, 1950-52. He has also served as consultant to the East St. Louis, Illinois, Chamber of Commerce and as Research Director for the Citizen's Fact-Finding Committee of East St. Louis.

David L. G. Jacobs

... author of *The Challenge of Training for Non-Routine Tasks* is lecturer at the Traffic Institute, Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois. He holds a Master of Arts degree in Economics from the University of Missouri. Mr. Jacobs has been active in the field of training and industrial education since 1951. The area of experience covers training work as a staff member of a university, in government, and in private industry. His experience at the Traffic Institute includes both the development of training material and the conducting of courses in the field of Police Personnel Administration. He is, and has been since 1953, a member of the evening division faculty at Illinois Institute of Technology where he teaches courses in Personnel Administration and Human Relations.

Alvin Karp

... author of *A Guide for Maintaining Uniform Discipline* is Personnel Officer for the Los Angeles County Department of Charities, employing 14,000 persons, and consisting of six hospitals, six welfare bureaus, and two camps for indigent homeless men. He has worked for Los Angeles County for 10 years, 3 years in his present position and 7 in the Los Angeles County Chief Administrative Office, having started there as an administrative intern. He holds a Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of California at Los Angeles, has completed graduate work in public administra-

tion at the University of Southern California, and has served as guest lecturer both at East Los Angeles Junior College and U.C.L.A.

Sid Panush

. . . co-author of *Making a Good Recruiting Program Better* is in charge of the Recruitment Services Unit of the Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission. He has worked in all phases of the recruitment field for several years and is the Chairman of the Recruitment Committee of the Southern California Personnel Association.

Harry P. Petrie

. . . co-author of *Making a Good Recruiting Program Better* is Secretary and Chief Examiner, Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission. He is permanent chairman of the Los Angeles County Personnel Council, president of the County Personnel Administrators Association of California, and is a member of the County's Finance Committee, the Loyalty Check Committee, the Salary and Personnel Practices Committee, and the Personnel Directors Council of Metropolitan Los Angeles. Mr. Petrie has instructed in personnel at the University of Southern California's School of Public Administration, in federal government training programs, and in various courses for the U.S. Army. As Colonel Petrie in World War II, he was awarded the Legion of Merit.

Ellen B. Rhudy

. . . co-author of *Death and Transfiguration* is assistant to head, Wage and Classification Branch, Industrial Relations and Manpower Division, Bureau of Ships, Navy Department. Mrs. Rhudy, a graduate of the College of William and Mary, entered the Navy's classification program in 1944. After two years in the Area Wage and Classification Office, Norfolk, she joined the staff of the Wage and Classification Division, Office of Industrial Relations. In 1956 she transferred to her present position in the Bureau of Ships, where she is primarily responsible for the classification programs of the 11 U. S. Naval Shipyards.

Maurice F. Ronayne

. . . author of *Preretirement Counseling Programs: Six Different Approaches* is Chief, Procedures & Methods Division of the U. S. Federal Mediation & Conciliation Service. Early this year he helped to set up the first FMCS preretirement counseling program. Mr. Ronayne earned his AB from Colby College in 1951 and four years later received his AM in Personnel Administration from The American University. At present, he is continuing his studies at American University as a Ph.D. candidate in the School of Government and Public Administration.

Norman Sharpless

. . . author of *Hawaii Overcomes Its Unusual Recruiting Problems* is Recruiting and Examining Supervisor of the Hawaii Civil Service Department. His background includes an MA from Temple University where he was a graduate assistant in psychology. This led to an assignment with the Pennsylvania State Civil Service Commission and eventual appointment as its Chief of Personnel Examinations. After seven years with that agency he succumbed to the lure of the islands in 1955. He has been an active participant in public personnel institutes and conferences and is a member of the Society for Personnel Administration.

Philip D. Yaney

. . . co-author of *Death and Transfiguration* is head, Wage and Classification Branch, Industrial Relations and Manpower Division, Bureau of Ships, Navy Department. Mr. Yaney, a graduate of the University of Pittsburgh, has been working for the Navy Department in a variety of capacities since 1941. In his present position he has responsibility for the wage and classification programs in the field activities of the Bureau of Ships. Immediately prior to assuming his present position he was Staff Assistant for Manpower Utilization. He has also been employed in the Navy Department's Office of Industrial Relations on several occasions. In his most recent position there he was responsible for the classification standards program of the Navy.

The Challenge of Training for Non-Routine Tasks

David L. G. Jacobs

How to train the new employee who must exercise considerable judgment in varied situations far removed from close supervision.

MUCH HAS BEEN WRITTEN in recent years about supervisory and employee training in both industry and government. The preponderance of current literature considers problems faced when training employees for specific duties. Industry hires a man to run a machine and immediately the training problem becomes definitive. This man is then taught how to operate the machine. He may later pick up additional skills and learn to operate more machines, but each training situation is a definitive one. An organization hires a retail clerk to sell a product or a series of products. This man learns about the products his company sells. He is taught how to open and close a sale. This situation is also definitive but less so than the machine operator.

The Versatile Employee

But for the many industrial and government positions which are not so definitive, training is more difficult. In many job classifications, employees are required to possess or acquire a variety of skills. Such jobs require the employee to use considerable judgment as he will face many different situations. The task of training such personnel is further complicated when one considers that most of their work is accomplished without immediate supervision. Such a situation multiplies the complexity and difficulty of the training problem. Claim adjusters, complaint investigators, field installation engineers, building inspectors, safety engineers, firemen, and policemen, are examples of the "versatile" employee.

The job of the "versatile" employee is more complex than that of a machine operator or retail clerk. The "versatile" employee meets many different situations each day.

Take, for example, as we had to, the job of a police officer. He deals with people un-

der extremely varied situations, most of which are stressful: an accident, a burglary, and even the citing of a traffic violator. The officer must be given a working knowledge of many techniques. He must be taught that the method and technique used in any situation is dictated to a great extent by the particular situation.

The work done at the Northwestern University Traffic Institute in trying to solve such a problem for police traffic accident investigators is submitted as an example of a method which may be of interest to many who are faced with similar problems in other fields.

Establishing Criteria for Complex Tasks

A vital problem in dealing with this type of training situation is development of an adequate job breakdown. Now, unlike simple definitive jobs, investigators and similar employees do work which requires several large groups of skills. Much time and effort is required to analyze the duties of police traffic accident investigators and establish criteria for successful performance of the individual parts of their complex tasks.

After extensive study and consultation with members of the Institute staff and top management personnel of various police departments, it was determined that the field of police accident investigation could be broken down into six general groups of knowledge and skill:

1. Background knowledge for accident investigation
2. Activities intended to keep the accident from getting worse
3. Getting facts
4. Recording facts
5. Figuring out what happened
6. Followup or resulting duties.

The first and last of these would be common to many non-routine duties. The middle four are very highly specialized.

The Basic Training Manual

The development work which began with the determination of these six general groups of activity for the job classification of police accident investigator terminated with the publication of the *Traffic Accident Investigator's Manual for Police*. This comprehensive, operational-level manual contains over 600 pages in 35 units or chapters. The subjects covered vary from less technical ones such as handling fires to highly technical ones such as accident reconstruction.

But it soon became evident that the manual was not enough. Frequent association with various law enforcement agencies brought out the fact that the manual was being used far less effectively than it could be. There was general agreement among those concerned that the manual could be more effective if the police training officer was supplied with specific training methods and materials which could be adapted to the needs of a particular department. Thus was born the idea for an instructor's guide and other supplementary material to complement the manual.

Planning for a Wide Variety of Training Situations

We were, from the beginning, faced with two special problems of equal importance which would not generally be met in training men for a single organization. First of all, we had only general knowledge of the ability of the personnel who were to conduct the training. Certainly it would vary greatly. Second, we realized that the duties of an accident investigator varied greatly from department to department. They may vary even within a single department. The skills required of such personnel may vary from merely general reporting of circumstances to highly specialized work such as analysis of causes.

Given such a framework, our task was to develop a guide that could meet these diverse situations. It had to be flexible yet comprehensive. Developing training material to meet these needs was a real challenge. We could find no suitable patterns to follow,

although we would have welcomed such help.

Selection of the Instructors

We knew that, in most instances, instructors are chosen from police ranks. In some cases such personnel are given additional training in the techniques of teaching. Generally speaking, however, it was found that the men who are selected for training duties are chosen by the same method as for any other police duty.

No great effort is made to select an officer who possesses special teaching aptitudes. Nor is any particular effort made to give the man selected the necessary tools. The individual selected for duty as a training officer is generally told that, beginning on a certain date, he will be responsible for training in his department.

The Instructor's Guide

First, therefore, we had to develop a basic Instructor's Guide. Its function is to explain planning and the setting up of a tailor-made training program in accident investigation to meet the needs of a particular department. The instructor is given specific information and examples on:

1. Deciding what subjects to teach
2. Planning the course
3. Teaching principles
4. Preparation for teaching
5. Training aids available.

Form for Evaluating Training Needs

Most of the training officers do not know how to evaluate training needs. Therefore, an extensive form was developed to aid them in evaluating the need for training together with detailed instructions on its use. It is an important instrument in "Deciding What Subjects To Teach."

The training officer is cautioned not to begin planning the program without first sitting down and completing this form with his Chief and those who direct work of investigators. The result is that policy-forming people play an important function in the designing of the training program. This is as it should be.

Our training-needs form has two parts. The first helps to define the group that will

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

be trained. Will they be recruits, or clerks, or specialized accident investigators? What general knowledge do they have to begin with?

The second part considers duties and abilities for work in connection with accidents. Possible duties are divided into eight classes which are in turn subdivided into various operational functions. These eight classes are an extension of the six groups of activities which constitute, specifically, the job of a police traffic accident investigator. The subdivision into the various operational functions merely divides and defines the job duties listed under the eight general classes.

Thus, in the first class, "Handle the emergency," we find such operational functions as "Recognize and deal with potential fire hazards," "Extinguish fires in motor vehicles," "Give general first aid," etc. There

is a specific reference, whenever possible, to a definite unit of the Manual for each of the operational functions or duties and abilities. A diverse task involves a long and complex description of duties.

Management Must Help Evaluate Form

The training officer and his superiors enter on the form for evaluation of training needs the desired level of ability of the group being considered for training for each possible duty (see Chart A). Management must at least go over the form to mark duties and abilities which the group being considered for training "Must know." Preferably, management should also mark "Would find it helpful to know," "Would like to know," and "Need not know."

The duties and abilities checked as the "Must know" are the bull's-eye of the train-

CHART A

Duties and Abilities (Continued)								
Possible Duties in Accident Investigation	Unit reference	Importance of duty				Present level		
		Must know	Helpful to know	Like to know	Need not know	Presumably no ability	Ability not sufficient	Entirely adequate
Examine drivers for intoxication and other contributing conditions	34	✓					✓	Comp
Make test skids to measure slipperiness of road surface	42B	✓					✓	Abr.
Estimate speed from skidmarks in simple cases	52B			✓				O
Understand main principles of accident reconstruction	53A			✓				Min.
Measure road for scale map or accident diagram	41B		✓					Abr.
Draw scale diagram of location to show condition after accident	41C			✓				O
Reconstruct accident to determine violations if necessary	53C				O			O
Recognize hit-and-run situations and initiate investigation	63A	✓					O	O
Conduct special hit-and-run investigation activities	63B				O			O
Seek special clues to hit-and-run vehicles	35	✓						Abr.
Recognize motor-vehicle homicide situations	66		✓					Abr.
Recognize reckless driving situations in accidents	62							
Recognize vehicle theft and other criminal accident situations	62							

The Director of Training, in conference with top management, marks the knowledge and ability needs and the present competence of the group to be trained. Results: the current training need of the group is defined in the last column of this form. The above is only part of a six-page form.

ing target. Such duties and abilities are, therefore, of paramount importance. The duties and abilities which fall into the three remaining types form the outer rings of the training target.

Next, management goes through the form a second time marking it to show in what duties the men to be trained either have "Entirely adequate ability," "Not sufficient

ability," or "Presumably no ability," for each of the jobs. Those aspects of the job which have been checked as "Must know" and for which "No ability" is shown will naturally make up the core of the training program. When this, the second part of the form, is completed, we have, in effect, a kind of job description and training target for the group being considered.

CHART B

Example C

Schedule of Subjects for Police Course in DATA GATHERING and TAKING ENFORCEMENT ACTION

Objective

This course will equip the student to do what is necessary for accident investigation squad work in a city.

1. Protect life and property
2. Summon necessary assistance
3. Answer pertinent questions
4. Observe and note final positions of units involved and significant marks left on the road by the accident
5. Make proper report of the accident
6. Notify next of kin in accidents with death or serious injury
7. Make simple speed estimates
8. Take enforcement action needed
9. Prepare case for prosecutor
10. Appear in court as witness

Students

Students are recruits with basic police training but no previous accident investigation experience.

Limitations

Students will not be trained to analyze accidents for causes.

Time

Total student time required is approximately 62 hours. Twenty-three hours of this is in class.

Schedule of Subjects for Course in

DATA GATHERING and TAKING ENFORCEMENT ACTION

Subject and Unit Number from Manual	Parts and Abbrevia- tions	Student Hours				
		TOTAL for Subject	Reading and Study	Class		Problems, Exercises, Field Work
				Lecture, Demon- stration	Discus- sion, Review	
TOTAL time by kind of activity		62:00	19:30	6:10	17:05	19:15
11. Accidents and Their Causes.	Complete	4:00	1:00		1:00	2:00
12. Investigation	A & B Abridged	3:00	1:00		2:00	
13. Legal Responsibility.	A & B Minimum	2:00	1:00	:30	:30	
14. Preparation	Part A Minimum	:30	:15		:15	
15. Accident Investigation Patrol.	Complete	:30	:15		:15	
Planning		5:00	1:30		1:00	2:30

The planning agreement reached between training and top management results in a proposed schedule of student hours to meet the course requirements.

Schedule Set Up by Instructor

After management completes the evaluation, the training officer selects subjects that must be in the program and decides the degree to which they must be taught to accomplish the objectives established.

This "Proposed Schedule of Subjects for Course in . . ." which he now sets up is based upon the policies expressed on the duties and abilities form. The schedule begins with a brief statement of the objective of the particular training program. It lists, subject by subject, in terms of *student hours*, the time probably needed by the student in reading and studying, lecture and demonstration, review and discussion, problems, exercises, and field work. The subject times are then added to get total student time.

Management Reviews Suggested Schedule

This schedule is then presented to management for inspection and review. Any adjustments—some are sure to be necessary—are made at this time by agreement with these top-level officials. Changes may be dictated by the lack of time or unavailability of teaching personnel.

The important idea is that management is fully aware of the extent and intensiveness of planned training and does not expect more of the people doing the training than they can deliver. The elimination or modification of any subject is accomplished with the full knowledge and consent of top administrative and operational officers. This completes the evaluation and developmental phase of the training program.

To further aid the instructor an outline has been developed for each job area or unit. It is specifically tied in with the comparable unit in the Manual and includes suggestions for abbreviating training. Each outline gives the objectives of each unit together with prerequisite knowledge needed and any special teaching methods available.

Use of Abbreviated Training

Abbreviations of many units have been suggested for different degrees of training. Use of abbreviated training will depend upon the needs of students and time available for training. For example, if the investigator will not be required to take pic-

tures, we might decide that photography would be an unimportant aspect of accident investigation training; therefore, the investigator needs only minimum training in that subject. Minimum training in one subject allows more time for thorough training in other units considered more important for him. Some units cannot be abbreviated. The student is given all or none of such a unit. Three degrees of completeness are recognized:

1. *Complete training* which consists of all parts of the units. It is generally used for developing expert and specialized investigators.

2. *Abridged training* consists of less material. It will give the student a working knowledge of the unit.

3. *Minimum training* contains only the highlights of each unit. It is designed to be used when either detailed knowledge is not required, due to the nature of the student's future responsibility, or where time available is severely limited.

Information concerning the use of the degrees of training, together with the suggested reading assignments, are included for each individual unit in the Instructor's Guide.

Training Aids Should Be Provided

A general instructor's guide for planning and teaching methods is not enough, especially if the instructors are limited both in the time and ability available for their work. Effective instruction requires more than reading and lecturing. Exercises, problems, and demonstrations are needed to develop proficiency.

If such training aids are not provided, the instructor may not develop his own and so training quality will suffer.

If they are provided, the instructor can then give his full time to adapting the material to his specific needs and to preparation for instruction. Thus, the special training aids will greatly increase the quality of instruction.

In addition to the instructor's guide and to go with it, therefore, review and discussion questions were made up for each unit based on the basic text material in the *Ac-*

cident Investigator's Manual. Each question has a specific Manual paragraph reference given with it. Thus, neither instructor or student will have difficulty in finding the correct answer.

More important still are the 57 special training aids, especially developed to go with this Guide. Each contains necessary Instructor's Notes and, where needed, student material. The Instructor's Notes spell out in great detail the use of the training aid being considered. Additional copies of the various special training aids for student use can be obtained from the Traffic Institute. Answer sheets for the instructor are included wherever possible. These special training aids make use of a variety of training techniques such as role playing, field investigation, completion of forms, case study, and special problems and exercises.

The training aids are published in loose-leaf form so that the instructor can take out those needed to make up his own class workbook. Modifications and additions will regularly be made both by the Institute staff and by the individual instructor as a consequence of use over a period of time.

The Pattern May Be Modified

Thus we have set up a pattern for the instructor to modify for his own specific needs in training people with extremely varied duties. Important parts of this pattern are the procedure for evaluating the training needs themselves and the underlying job analysis.

Realization that instruction will be used in a wide variety of training situations has resulted in developing material with greatest possible flexibility. Thus the instructor can select the specific units his men need, or, if necessary, parts of such units. It is felt that flexibility can be achieved without sacrificing essential elements for which training is being given. As stated previously the training guide, and materials developed to go with it, is not all inclusive. Modifications and additions will be made as a result of experience; but it is an attempt to meet a problem of preparing training material for job situations which are not definitive. The problem of training for these non-definitive job situations is not insurmountable. The challenge can be met. Our approach to this problem is submitted as an example of how this challenge was met.

Fringe Benefits for Retired Employees . . .

Governor Averell Harriman, in ceremonies at the Capitol today, personally enrolled the first retired State employee in a new program extending the State's health insurance plan to persons who retired from the civil service before December 5, 1957, the date the original plan became effective. The dependents of retired workers are also covered.

The first applicant to be signed was 84-year-old Dr. Emmeline M. Moore, former Chief Aquatic Biologist of the Conservation Department. Dr. Moore was with Conservation from 1920 until her retirement in 1944.

In his remarks to an audience of State Department heads, legislators, employee organization representatives, and others, Governor Harriman expressed his hope that similar plans designed to protect the health of older persons would be adopted by private businesses.

Both the retirees and the State will share in the cost. Benefits included in the plan are up to 120 days of hospitalization in semi-private accommodations, therapeutic and diagnostic services normally provided by hospitals, and basic surgical and in-hospital medical care.—From a New York State Department of Civil Service news release dated March 26, 1958.

Death and Transfiguration

Ellen B. Rhudy and Philip D. Yaney

A reply to H. D. McInnis' article, "Death of a Program," published in the October, 1957, Public Personnel Review.

WITHOUT THE AID of a miracle drug, oxygen tent, or even divine prayer, the position classification program of the Navy Department is, somehow, very much alive. Indeed, it has not even been at the brink of death. The present state of health is an evolutionary development which is both timely and sound in the administration of this major program.

Readers of Mr. H. D. McInnis' article "Death of a Program" in the October, 1957, issue of *Public Personnel Review* were left with the impression that the Department of the Navy had taken an ill-considered action in changing its method of classification administration—an action which, in Mr. McInnis' words, might possibly prove to be "... a grievous and costly mistake"; an action which, he feels, was taken on the basis of a false theory without regard for the success or failure of the program so drastically repudiated.

Responsibility for personnel administration within the Department of Defense is normally delegated through the chain of command to the head of each field establishment or local command. This means that the head of each field establishment is delegated the authority and responsibility for all the day-to-day operating decisions in personnel administration, subject to policy control and review from higher echelons.

The Navy's Exceptional Department

Until 1956, position classification administration within the Department of the Navy was the most conspicuous exception to this pattern. Authority for the classification of civilian positions in the Navy was retained by the central civilian personnel office, the Office of Industrial Relations. This office, through 11 subordinate offices (called Area Wage and Classification Offices), located in

areas of greatest Navy civilian employee concentration, was responsible for the classification of all positions subject to the Classification Act of 1949. Responsibility for all other aspects of civilian personnel administration, however, conformed to the general pattern throughout the Department of Defense. In 1956, the Assistant Secretary of the Navy (Personnel and Reserve Forces) delegated authority for position classification to Navy Bureau Chiefs so that they might in turn delegate this authority to local command levels, thus bringing classification within the normal pattern of administrative responsibility and authority.

Summing Up "Death of a Program"

The reading audience will recall that "Death of a Program" summarized its arguments in these propositions:

1. That the Department of the Navy abandoned its centralized system of classification administration without considering whether that system was or was not performing effectively.
2. That this action was based on the theory that the authority for classification administration should be an integral element of the authority of activity heads to direct personnel administration programs for their activities.
3. That this theory is open to serious question with respect to
 - (a) the assumption that classification is an element of personnel administration;
 - (b) the assumption that an administrator can legitimately use the classification process in any way differently from the way in which it may be used by an outside authority; and

- (c) the assumption that classification is a "tool" of management.

The present article contends that, whatever the theoretical arguments put forward to justify the change in classification administration, this change was based upon the very practical fact that the centralized system of classification administration in the Department of the Navy was not working satisfactorily. It is not our intention to tilt lances with Mr. McInnis over the theories which support or oppose the proposition that classification administration should be an integral element of line authority. Some brief comment on this may not be out of place, however, before proceeding with the main argument.

"Death of a Program" advances three objections to the proposition that authority for the classification of positions should be delegated to the heads of activities: (1) classification is not an element of personnel administration; (2) the classification process can operate legitimately only in the way it had been operating under AWCOs; and (3) classification is a "control" on management, not a "tool" of management.

The Other Side of "Death"

With respect to objection (1), it must be noted that the classification process *is* more closely related to personnel administration than to any other management function; it is but one of several means to an end (effective personnel administration), not in itself a discrete management function with independent organizational status. In so far as the manner in which classification is performed—objection (2)—there is no disagreement that this is the crucial issue. However, even though the results may be the same under both schemes of organization, it does matter how these results are achieved and who is responsible for taking the necessary action. The argument advanced in objection (3)—whether classification is a "tool" or a "control"—is irrelevant, since it is both. The fact that classification must be done in certain ways makes it a control, but it is also a tool, since its main purpose is to facilitate other management processes. While each of these points might be elaborated upon, to do so would take us rather far

from the main argument, which is whether the centralized classification system was providing satisfactory classification service.

Birth of a Program

Adequate consideration of this subject makes it necessary to examine the historical development of the AWCO system and compare the situation which led to its establishment in 1943 to the situation existing in 1956. Whatever the theoretical views of those who created the system, there were very practical reasons for the action taken to establish it in 1943.

At that time, the Navy Department was undergoing an enormous expansion. Prior to and during the early part of World War II, position classification for the Navy's far-flung field establishment was performed from Washington by mail. With the mushrooming growth of established activities and the proliferation of new ones, coupled with the need for prompt service, the system was rapidly deteriorating from the barely sufficient to the completely inadequate.

Some decentralization of responsibility and function was badly needed. And while this much was obvious, there was no readily available means to accomplish this decentralization.

Field activities were almost completely lacking in staff organizations of any kind. They were already so occupied with the organizational problems of accelerated wartime growth that the adding of a new function, for which they had neither the organization nor the trained personnel, would have been at best an unpromising solution.

Furthermore, the significant headquarters-field channels of communication and organization in the Navy Department were then primarily within the military chain of command, and no adequate management structure existed through which those in charge of the civilian personnel program in Washington could direct, promote, and control a new classification program for the field except in the most tenuous and roundabout manner.

In this context the decision was taken to establish branch offices of the central personnel office in the areas of greatest Navy field activity concentration. By this means the necessary decentralization was achieved,

while at the same time the benefits of central control for the establishment of an entirely new program were retained. And these benefits were substantial.

It was necessary to recruit and train a staff of technicians, to develop classification standards, to devise classification tools, techniques, and procedures, to introduce the program throughout the Navy's field activities, and to do all this with a maximum of productivity and a minimum of time. The method chosen seemed to offer the best prospects for success within the existing organizational environment. Whatever views those who made this decision may have had on organizational theory and on the nature and function of the classification process, there seems little doubt that they found a practicable solution to a practical problem.

Years of Growth

During the 13-year period from 1943 to 1956, the organization of the Navy Department underwent a number of changes and developments. By 1956 it was certainly time to inquire whether and to what extent the situation which led to creation of the AWCOs in 1943 still existed and whether, in the organizational environment existing in 1956, the AWCO system was the best method of classification administration. The present organizational environment within the Department of the Navy does offer some significant points of difference from the situation existing in the latter years of World War II.

In 1945 Secretary James Forrestal issued General Order No. 19, and, for the first time, Navy Bureaus were assigned management responsibility for field activities. Under this stimulus, and under the prior stimulus of wartime growth, bureaus and field activities made rapid strides in effecting administrative improvements. Modern management methods were adopted and comprehensive industrial relations programs were installed. The solution of the problems created by wartime expansion and the development of a more efficient organization for the business management of the Navy Department eliminated the reasons for creation of the AWCO system.

The Maverick

There remained, however, a centralized system of classification administration which bypassed the normal bureau-field activity chain of management control, and which did not conform to the normal pattern of maximum delegation of authority to lower command levels. Such a system may continue to exist, of course, if it works satisfactorily, but upon it is placed the onus of continually proving that it is the best of all systems if it is to justify its failure to conform to the normal pattern of organization.

In addition to these considerations, there are a number of difficulties associated with the administration of a centralized classification program in a large, widely-dispersed organization. Unless sufficient offsetting advantages can be demonstrated for a centralized system, these difficulties produce inadequacies in the program which will, sooner or later, be considered unacceptable. The chief of these are given below, without attempting to assess their relative significance.

First: The normal staffing pattern for the AWCOs is the employment of trainees at the entrance level (GS-5) and their gradual development and promotion to positions of leadership in the program. It is almost impossible for such persons, regardless of intelligence, to acquire from the outsider more than an imperfect understanding and appreciation of the problems and point of view of those in the field establishments which they service.

On the other hand, there is a reluctance on the part of the field activity officials to place their entire confidence in persons not members of their own organization, who do not share responsibility either for the work of that organization or for its management control. These attitudes inevitably create tensions and frictions and result in a loss in over-all efficiency. This is not meant to disparage or to discount in any way the integrity, intelligence, or good will of either AWCO or activity personnel. However, this segregation of responsibility between two groups of people, this organizational separation, inevitably creates problems of communication and understanding which would not exist to nearly the same extent under a more normal organizational arrangement.

Why Position Classification?

Second: Position classification is a device for systematizing and improving the management of an organization. Positions do not exist to be classified; positions are classified because doing so proves useful, particularly in the employment, development, and promotion of employees, in the organization of work, and the setting of pay. To be of maximum utility, classification must be carefully integrated with these other management processes. Separation of responsibility for classification from the locus of other management responsibility makes this integration unnecessarily difficult to accomplish.

Third: Under a centralized system, inadequate recognition is given to the need for providing program control and leadership at the operating level. A successful classification program needs more than a mechanism for putting the right classification on a position. This is even more the case where the classification system is of a type requiring extensive maintenance (as in the federal government), and where the organization is relatively dynamic (as in the Department of the Navy). It was not possible for an outside organization such as an AWCO, organizationally and sometimes geographically removed from an activity, to provide the program leadership required. The decision about the classification of a position is only one step in a series of important and interrelated management processes.

The classifying of positions does not in itself constitute a classification program. Experience within the Navy Department during the past 10 years has clearly demonstrated that while the AWCOs could classify positions, they could not operate classification programs for the activities within their jurisdiction.

All but the smallest activities found it necessary to employ staff specialists to provide advice and assistance to supervisors and management officials on classification problems, to assist in the preparation of position descriptions, to explain the possibilities, objectives, and limitations of the classification function, to integrate classification with other management and personnel functions, and to represent the activity in dealings with

the AWCO. By 1956 all of the major bureaus had established formal programs covering these processes, thus creating two sets of staff groups, both providing classification services to activities.

Evolution and Experience

The Secretary's decision to delegate classification authority to local commands, when viewed in this context, does not appear to be an abrupt departure from or reversal of the then-existing system. Instead it was the next logical step in an evolution which had been under way since the close of World War II.

The writers are in excellent position to comment upon the practical results of the decentralization of classification authority to naval field activities. The Bureau of Ships has under its management control 11 naval shipyards, 1 repair facility, and 6 major research and development laboratories (as well as a number of lesser activities), which have now operated their own classification programs for periods ranging from 1 year to 18 months. Through the media of routine post-audits, visits to these activities, frequent conferences with the administrators of the activity classification programs, and discussions with the commanding officers and key operating personnel of the activities, the authors have been able to formulate some rather definite impressions concerning the effectiveness of the present operation.

The Judgment

First, supervisors and management officials are relying more and more on activity classification staffs for advice and assistance. Although there may be various reasons for this trend, two appear to be paramount: the fact that classification has now become an integral part of the activity industrial relations "team," and the fact that program direction and control are received from the management control bureau rather than from a staff office.

Second, the number of appeals filed by employees and commands has been drastically reduced. During the calendar year 1957 only 14 appeals from classification actions taken in the 18 major BuShips activities previously mentioned were submitted to the

Bureau of Ships. A superficial examination of this figure might lead to the conclusion that there has been a wholesale giveaway of grades at the activity level, but a check of activity records reveals that this is not so. The simple explanation is that the classification actions taken by activity classifiers are more palatable to activity personnel than those taken by an outside agency.

Third, activity classification staffs are rendering better classification service than was possible under the centralized AWCO system. This is evidenced not only by such an obvious criterion as reduced processing time on classification actions but also by less spectacular but equally important features such as increased assistance in position description preparation with a resulting elimination of non-pertinent material and

an encouraging reduction in length; a more flexible and personalized maintenance review procedure which is producing, for the first time, an entree to an acceptance by the production shops; and classification determinations based upon the first-hand knowledge which can come only from close day-by-day acquaintance with the working situations and operations being evaluated.

With such demonstrated results now a matter of record, it is difficult to agree with Mr. McInnis' conclusion that "it is possible that a grievous and costly mistake has been made." On the contrary, it would appear that a program which has made such sound advances in little more than a year of operation is well on the way to paying handsome dividends to the entire naval industrial relations program in the years to come.

How Are Your New Employees Treated? . . .

As a substitute clerk (with the United States Railway Mail Service), which I was, one can be shifted around to new work details three or four times in a single night. There were quite a number of utterly different jobs that had to be learned.

I found that I had to ask to have many things explained to me, and some of them I had to have explained five or six times. Usually there were both white and colored fellows that I could have asked. But I fell into the preference of asking the colored fellows when I could, because they didn't begrudge helping you and didn't get grouchy if you didn't pick it up the first time they explained it.

. . . frequently enough I happened to be the only white worker in an otherwise all-Negro crew. The crew . . . was the only work group I've ever joined as a green newcomer without being slyly taken advantage of and loaded up with the dirty work.

Quite the other way around. My co-workers did all they could to make the work easy for me. They didn't hold back their secrets, but taught me right away the best way. . . . In a very inconspicuous way they absorbed some of the work load that was properly my share. Most remarkable of all, they did not even complain about my mistakes.

Yet I wouldn't say I was singled out for unusual courtesy. They were just as co-operative . . . with one another.—John J. Mahoney reporting in *Work*, January, 1958.

Hawaii Overcomes Its Unusual Recruiting Problems

Norman Sharpless

A one-application, one-examination program helps solve difficulties of small staff covering large territory.

AS DO MANY small central public personnel agencies, the Territory of Hawaii Department of Civil Service must continually meet the problem of recruiting and examining for a full-coverage merit system with a staff of only modest size. There are some 1000 classes in the jurisdiction and a total of 6200 employees.

The personnel procurement problem is aggravated due to the geographical composition of the territory, which includes seven inhabited islands in a chain some four hundred miles long. Although daily airline and mail service is available to six of the islands, there are many isolated areas with low population density. Of nearly 550,000 inhabitants, 80% are located on one island and nearly 300,000 are in Honolulu, the one major metropolitan area.

Staffing of territorial agencies on the other islands is a particularly knotty problem for the department and one which necessitates repeated examining efforts. Further, the department makes available technical examination service for three county jurisdictions with some 3,000 employees. This service is without fee in compensation for the counties providing application intake and test-monitoring services.

The nationwide shortage of trained personnel in technical and professional occupations is heightened in Hawaii by its insular locations. For some professions no college curricula is offered in the islands, and for others the supply of graduates is inadequate. As a result, many operating departments have established trainee positions to which college graduates are appointed and where they receive on-the-job training.

University of Hawaii officials had commented on the difficulties experienced by their graduates interested in a career in government service. Upon graduation, many of

these young people were faced with the realization that recruitment was not "open" for the occupational specialties of their interest. Other graduates found to their dismay that even though recruitment was being conducted for classes in their fields of specialization it was necessary to submit an application for each class and to participate in a separate examination for each. Confronted with time-consuming, traditional civil-service procedures required by government and the inducements of higher salaries and ease of application offered by other employers, the choice made by many of these graduates is obvious.

Two Problems—Single Solution

Early in 1956 the department considered the joint problems of meeting its examination workload and bringing into the territorial service the best of the islands' college-trained young people.

It seemed apparent that the solution lay in a one application—one examination recruiting program timed prior to graduation. However, territorial operating departments did not possess the resources to provide a generalized management trainee program similar to that of the federal government and some of the larger local jurisdictions on the mainland. For a number of reasons, many peculiar to the jurisdiction, it was not feasible to create a single "entrance" class or even several of such classes which could be used as a broad avenue for recruiting and placement. Most of these hurdles stemmed from classification and compensation difficulties. There were also the problems of overcoming precedent and overcoming the tendency of some operating departments to prefer a specialized recruiting and examining program for classes peculiar to their own departments.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

A study was made of the class specifications for a number of the entrance level classes in technical and professional occupational areas. Many of these required college specialization while a few required merely graduation from a college without restriction as to college major.

The study indicated striking similarities in the knowledges and skills required. Even some of the differences were more apparent than real. For example, many of the specifications required of applicants the ability to read and interpret laws, rules, and regulations governing the specific program of the department in which the classes were found. Therefore, on an *a priori* basis, it was determined that the abilities of applicants for all classes containing such a requirement could be adequately sampled and reliably measured by a carefully designed test segment on reading comprehension.

Similarly, other common or "core" areas were located. Most of these were deemed to be factors usually included in standardized intelligence tests. Further investigation indicated that such specialized knowledges as were required were related in nearly all instances to the college curricula specified for the classes.

The decision was then made to design a written test to cover the core areas for all such classes and to recognize specialized subject matter areas by selective certification of names from the eligible list according to college major. Such a procedure would avoid classification and compensation hurdles and yet permit college students to participate in one examination program for entrance into a number of classes in the territorial government.

Format of the Examination

The examination as developed consisted of two booklets of multiple-choice items. Booklet A, "Ability To Learn," included three 30-item 20-minute timed sub-tests covering verbal analogies, numerical progressions, and figure analogies. Booklet B, a power test with a 4-hour time limit, entitled "Acquired Skills," included five 30-item sub-tests covering interpretation of charts and graphs, vocabulary, English grammar and allied materials, reading comprehension, and

general information about Hawaiian government and socio-economic conditions.

Each of the 240 items in the battery was prepared specifically for this examination, and each item was reviewed by three psychometricians before inclusion. The test booklets were administered experimentally to in-service employees who had college training and brief employment records.

Inaugurating the Pilot Program

A pilot recruiting and examining program, The Territorial Service Entrance Examination, was inaugurated in April, 1956, for study purposes. The program included then only four classes: Personnel Aid, Librarian Aid, Social Worker I, and Employment Interviewer I. Modest recruiting efforts on the University of Hawaii campus included the usual announcement bulletin and an advertisement in the student weekly. Of the 147 candidates applying, 128 reported for the examination session.

The mean score on Booklet A was 44.6, and on Booklet B the mean score was 72.5. For the purpose of establishing some prestige for the examination program, the cutting scores were set purposely high. To qualify on the examination, candidates were required to answer correctly at least 45 of the 90 questions in Booklet A and 75 of the 150 questions in Booklet B. A candidate was eliminated through failure to qualify on either booklet. Thirty-eight candidates met these standards and were placed on the eligible list.

Appraisal of the Pilot Program

An appraisal of the effectiveness of this pilot program was made in three areas. First, the reaction of the students was obtained through "casual" interviews immediately following the examination and through "feedback" from University of Hawaii officials. The general reaction from the students was highly favorable but some specific criticisms were received centering around the fatigue factor and on the close timing of the sub-tests in Booklet A.

Second, an item analysis was made of the test questions using the high-low 27% method and utilizing the Item Analysis Table of Chung-Teh Fan (Educational Testing Service). Responses were tabulated for

all choices for all items. Questions with item discrimination below $r + .20$ were re-written or were discarded.

The third appraisal was a followup four months later on the use of the list. Thirty names had been certified to the operating departments and 12 persons had received appointments. Of the remaining 9 names on the list, 4 were unavailable for appointment and 5 had not been reached for certification. There was a highly favorable reaction of departmental officials. In one agency, out-right skepticism changed to enthusiasm so that when the list was exhausted of names for that agency, the civil service office was asked to refer, for provisional appointment, those persons who "just failed" the entrance examination.

The Second Pilot Program

In April, 1957, a second recruiting program was conducted at the University of Hawaii for the purpose of refining the examining techniques and the processing machinery. The same recruiting efforts used in the 1956 pilot study were again utilized. Results were quite similar, with 148 applicants accepting and 141 reporting for the test session.

The examination consisted of the 1956 test booklets with approximately 30% of the test questions revised or replaced based on the item analysis. Some extension was made in the timing of Booklet A. The means for the 1957 edition were 47.7 for Booklet A and 73.4 for Booklet B.

Considerable thought was given to the question of the eventual use of the list when the cutting scores were established. It was decided to set cutting scores which would permit use of the examination on a broad entrance basis and to study possible effects prior to final development of the program. With this reasoning, critical scores were dropped to approximately one sigma below the mean on each booklet (40 on Booklet A and 58 on Booklet B). However, candidates were still required to qualify on both tests; 107 so qualified.

Appraisal of the Second Pilot Program

Appraisal of the second program followed along the lines of the original study. The students reacted better to the new timing on

Booklet A but complained of fatigue resulting from the nearly 5½ hours over-all time for the session. An item analysis following the original method was performed, and the test was shortened by 60 items (20 on Booklet A and 40 on Booklet B).

As the least discriminating items in each test segment were deleted, it was assumed that the shorter edition would be a more effective selection instrument. However, to determine that the two editions did not differ materially, another study was performed in which the answer sheets of the entire candidate group for 1957 were re-scored for only those items which remained in the shortened edition. A Pearson correlation of $r + .930$ ($PEr = \pm .039$) was obtained for the two forms of Booklet A and a correlation of $r + .895$ ($PEr = \pm .039$) was obtained for Booklet B.

Also, Pearson correlation coefficients were computed between the scores obtained on various sub-tests. The largest coefficient was $r + .408$ ($PEr = \pm .050$) between reading comprehension and language (English grammar, composition, and spelling). The lowest coefficient was $r + .155$ ($PEr = \pm .058$) between reading comprehension and analytical ability (interpretation of charts and graphs).

Even such segments as vocabulary and verbal analogies produced a coefficient as low as $r + .329$ ($PEr = \pm .053$). On the other hand, each test segment correlated highly with the total score while Booklet A and Booklet B scores produced a coefficient of only $r + .335$ ($PEr = \pm .049$).

Therefore, it was concluded that each sub-test and each booklet was measuring independently, and that each was contributing to the total prediction score.

Six months after list establishment, a study was made of its effectiveness. The list had been extended to include additional classes, and 67 names had been referred for employment. Twenty-eight persons had been selected, and reaction from the operating departments was highly favorable.

There was, however, the feeling on the part of one department that the caliber of the persons selected was higher than required for the positions, and that promotional opportunities might not be forthcoming soon

enough to hold the employees. Following the statistical analysis and discussions with departmental officials, it was concluded that the program could best serve as a broad-base recruiting effort to fill entrance-level professional and technical classes.

Accordingly, its use was extended to 21 classes covering virtually all the avenues through which college graduates are ordinarily recruited. Such diverse classes as Budget Aid, Entomologist I, Recreation Leader, and Wildlife Biologist were included.

It was decided that, to be effective and to justify the investment in the program, the list should provide an adequate supply of available and qualified personnel for all these classes throughout the year. For this reason, the program was planned for a continuous recruitment basis with an additional investment to be made selling the attractions of the territorial service to college seniors.

The Current Program

In January, 1958, the Territorial Service Entrance Examination program was opened with recruitment activities directed both at the University of Hawaii seniors and at Hawaii students at mainland colleges.

Attractive posters were printed in several colors for college bulletin boards.

A multilithed illustrated "letter" was mailed to all seniors at the local university.

The student weekly of the University of Hawaii cooperated by printing feature stories on selected students from the previous graduating class who had secured employment with the territory through this examination. The program has also received faculty endorsement and support.

Hawaiian clubs at 21 mainland universities were contacted for their assistance in calling the program to the attention of their seniors. A kit containing posters, brochures and applications was forwarded to each club.

The Hawaii Visitors Bureau made available its list of "Hawaiian Ambassadors"—their student contacts at mainland colleges—and promotional material was mailed to them. As a part of the program, such students were offered the opportunity to have the test administered at the campus of their colleges.

The first test administration using the short form was scheduled for mid-February and was designed primarily for January, 1958, and Summer, 1957, graduates who had not participated previously. At this writing, over 100 such persons are scheduled to participate. No final figure is available for the number of forthcoming Summer, 1958, graduates, as recruiting is continuing both in the islands and on the mainland. However, the interest far exceeds that of the two previous years and is heightened by the publicity being given to the much wider range of occupations now included.

Conclusions Are Favorable

Two years of cautious experimentation have convinced the designers of the soundness of using intelligence and aptitude testing, together with certification of names based on college training, as selection instruments for entrance-level professional and technical classes. The reactions from the campus and the appraisals from the operating departments have been encouraging.

Extension of the use of the 1957 list has already been accomplished and is proving effective. For example, college trained young men are now being recruited at the entrance level into the sanitation inspection program of the Department of Health for the first time. Seven have been so employed in recent months. Study is continuing on the feasibility of extending the list to other entrance classes.

From a pragmatic standpoint, the program is highly attractive to the civil service department as the investment in this one examination program is far less than the investment necessary for 21 such examinations. Further, there is a growing prestige for this program which is believed beneficial to both the civil service agency and the operating departments. Also, since the entrance examination is a broad-based program not legally tied in to any specific class or classes, it does not preclude a special announcement for a specific class when such necessity arises, or a promotional examination is deemed advisable.

It is believed that this multi-purpose, single-examination, college recruiting program has great promise for meeting recruiting needs in Hawaii.

Personnel Implications of Police-Fire Integration

Robert A. Earle

More and improved services at least cost is the goal; introducing the program and gaining acceptance are the hurdles.

GROWING RECOGNITION of the unity of purpose of modern police and fire activities has led an increasing number of municipalities to consider ways and means of integrating their police and fire services into a single operation. Spurred on by the need for more and improved services, the cities are taking a long hard look at these traditionally separate activities. The inherent economic loss due to the idle time of standby emergency personnel, coupled with evidence that the traditional setup of separate operations is no longer in tune with the times, has prompted the municipalities to investigate the possibilities of obtaining better manpower utilization through improved organization.

Both Services Have Same Basic Purpose

Modern communication systems and fast vehicular transportation have revolutionized the police services and, to a lesser degree, the fire services. With protection of life and property as the basic purpose of both services and with primary emphasis on prevention, it is no longer desirable nor is it necessary for men to sit and wait for emergencies to happen. Modern radio communications have made it possible for them to go about the performance of other duties while waiting for an emergency call.

Population growth, increasing police activities, and shorter working hours for policemen and firemen have contributed to the need for expanded police and fire activities. Many cities, compelled to expand these basic services, can do so only at the expense of other municipal services. Municipalities, therefore, are interested in police and fire integration as a logical means of expanding and improving these basic services at the least cost.

Opposition to Integration

This interest in integrated services is not without opposition; vigorous and compelling arguments are advanced from both police and fire sources. The argument is advanced that it is beyond the capabilities of an individual to achieve competence in both fields. It is contended that the degree of specialization demanded of modern police and fire organizations makes a merger of these two operations infeasible. It is argued that the apparent idle time of a fireman or a police officer is an illusion—that the proper performance of a police or fire officer's duties requires the full time services of a trained man.

Whatever the arguments pro and con, the fact is that a number of municipalities have successfully combined police and fire services to some degree. Some have achieved complete integration of services; others have achieved what is called partial integration of services; still others have achieved what might be termed co-operative services.

Police-fire integration is not a new concept. Some forms of combined service operations have been in effect in this country for more than 40 years. Until recent years, however, these types of operations had been confined to the smaller community. Under the stimulus of economic pressure, the interest of some of the larger communities has been aroused and, within the last decade, several municipalities of substantial size have combined their police and fire services to some degree.

Complete Integration

Complete integration of police-fire services is generally understood to mean the consolidation of the traditionally separate departments of police and fire into a single

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Department of Public Safety. This department is staffed with public safety officers who perform both police and fire duties. All public safety officers during their tour of duty are responsible for normal police activities and, in addition, are responsible for fire prevention and inspection, rescue, and all fire calls within a prescribed area.

Partial Integration

Partial integration is very much like complete integration except that some personnel are engaged in standby duties. The two departments are consolidated into a single Department of Public Safety, but separate divisions of police and fire are retained.

Public safety officers, trained in both police and fire functions, are assigned to either of the two divisions. Officers assigned to the police division act primarily as police officers with the added responsibility of assisting and co-operating in firefighting activities. Officers assigned to the fire division act as standby personnel to man the fire apparatus. They may perform police station-house duties while on standby status. Fire division assignments are kept to a minimum since additional emergency manpower is available from the police division.

Integration Plus Segregation

Another form of integration, which may be termed co-operative police-fire services, retains the separate departments of police and fire. The duties of one of the services, generally the police service, are expanded to include some of the activities normally considered to be the responsibility of the other service. The expanded duties of a police officer under this form may include the responsibility for fire prevention or smoke investigations, emergency rescue, and firefighting.

Normal police patrol activities are directed by police superiors. When responding to fire calls, these officers receive direction from fire superiors and remain under fire direction until released.

The primary purpose of these various forms of police-fire integration is the same: to provide maximum protection of life and property at the least cost. Whatever the form, mobile patrol officers are generally

the first to arrive at the scene of a fire emergency. These officers, properly trained and equipped, are capable of handling many small fires without assistance. In the case of larger fires, they are able to take the necessary preliminary steps in fighting the fire. With the arrival of fire-fighting equipment, they join in fighting the fire as members of the fire-fighting crew.

Until recently, municipal personnel officers have had little or no reason to concern themselves with the personnel problems involved in police-fire integration. During this past year, however, two municipalities with populations in excess of 100,000 have entered into a program of co-operative police-fire services. If this is the beginning of a trend—and the success achieved indicates that it may be—the personnel problems of combining the operations will be of considerable concern to a number of municipal personnel agencies.

Civil Service and Pensions

As the first step in a contemplated changeover, consideration must be given to civil service and pension statutes. The limitations imposed by these statutes may dictate the form and degree of integrated services possible of achievement.

One Ohio municipality, faced with a ruling from the state attorney general that the two departments of police and fire could not be merged because of limitations in civil service and pension statutes, overcame these difficulties by eliminating a fire department altogether. With the fire-fighting function assigned to police officers, this city has a completely integrated police and fire service. This was made possible by the state attorney general recognizing, in the same opinion in which he ruled out a merger of departments, that nothing in the statutes forbids the employment of men for work both as policemen and firemen.

This particular solution is not one which would be practical for many cities. It does, however, illustrate the point that these difficulties can be resolved. In particular, it suggests the possibility of extending the functions of either or both of the two services to include some of the functions being performed by the other service. This exten-

sion of functions is the plan which was mentioned earlier as co-operative police-fire services and is probably the one which will appeal to the larger municipalities.

Personnel Problems Involved

As the next step in implementing a program of integrated police-fire services, the technical determinations must be made regarding classification, employee status, promotional opportunities, pay, and training. In addition, there should be consideration of the recruitment policies which have been in effect for the separate departments of police and fire, the selection processes employed, and of employee attitudes. Previous recruitment policies may not be compatible with the requirements of an integrated operation. Personnel selection may have been on the basis of criteria tailored too specifically to the needs of more limited operations. Incompatible employee attitudes may have developed which even the most intensive training will be unable to overcome.

Classification

Ideally, the installation of complete police-fire integration will be accompanied by the establishment of an entirely new classification series. As an example, one city with the entering class of Public Safety Officer advances its series through Public Safety Lieutenant, Public Safety Captain, Division Commander, Assistant Chief, and Chief of Public Safety. Specialized activities, such as Fire Prevention Inspector or Detective, are by assignment from the various classes. Employees of all classes are expected to engage in emergency activities of either a police or fire nature.

The problem of employee status in a changeover from the traditional police and fire classification series to a public safety series should be relatively simple. The customary practice of maintaining parallel class levels in the semimilitary separate police and fire organizations should permit the consolidation of classes at the various levels. Present employees can then retain full title to positions at the same level in the new series.

Where state or local statutes require the employment of police and fire officers from

separate lists, or where separate pension systems have been established, a clear-cut, public safety class series may not be possible. Complete integration of police and fire services may still be achieved but a solution other than consolidating classes must be found.

Some cities have solved this problem by retaining the separate identities of police and fire officers, but the duties of both have been expanded to include the duties of the other. As with the public safety officer, policemen-firemen are trained for the full performance of police-fire duties and perform these duties as a part of their normal function. New appointments are made either as police or fire officers and pension participation is in accordance with the appointment. The promotional sequence may be in either the traditional police or fire series or it may be in an integrated series such as Police-Fire Lieutenant, Police-Fire Captain, Assistant Director of Public Safety, and Director of Public Safety.

Under the co-operative services plan, there should be no question of employee status nor any need for classification action of any sort other than to revise the class specifications involved to include the expanded duties. Firemen are still firemen and policemen remain policemen, although either or both may perform some of the duties of the other. Promotional opportunities remain within the separate departments and specialized assignments are made on a departmental basis.

Pay

Additional pay is usually provided officers participating in a program of integrated police-fire services.

In those municipalities with completely or partially integrated services, pay levels are set somewhat higher than would be the case with the traditional separate departments of police and fire. This higher pay is in recognition of the broader scope of dual positions.

In those municipalities with a co-operative service program, this higher pay is awarded, not only in recognition of the broader scope of activities, but also as an incentive to encourage participation. Under

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

the co-operative services program, the higher pay is awarded either upon entering the program or after successful completion of the required training and assignment to a dual position.

Where pay differentials are in effect between single and dual positions, the assignment of an officer to a dual position is not considered a promotion. This assignment is made and the additional pay provided in the same way that many cities assign police officers to motorcycle duty and provide additional compensation for the performance of this duty.

Recruitment

Applicants for the police and fire services are ordinarily recruited as trainees with qualification standards developed around citizenship, age, educational achievement, height, weight, and physical agility. In some cases, however, different standards are established for the two services. It may be desirable, where some form of police-fire integration is contemplated, to relate the standards for both services to the highest duties likely to be performed.

An excellent discussion of the procedures for recruiting policemen and firemen was published in the April issue of the *Public Personnel Review*.^{*} The procedures detailed in this article are as applicable to recruiting for an integrated service as for the separate services.

The examination process should also be extended to take into account the broader scope of activities of policemen-firemen. This is being done in some instances by simply adding some measure of mechanical aptitude to the test battery previously developed for police officers. If the tests available through the Public Personnel Association are being used, it may be feasible to administer both the police and fire tests as the written part of the examination. One municipality uses as a written examination for public safety officers a battery of tests which includes the Army General Classifica-

tion Test, a test of mechanical comprehension, and a test of practical judgment.

Training

The quality of the training program developed to meet the needs of an integrated service is probably the biggest single factor contributing to the effectiveness of the combined operation. The content, the quality of instruction, and the timing of the various phases should be given careful and thorough consideration. The officers entering into the program are going to be assuming new responsibilities and undertaking new tasks. Top performance will be expected of them and if they are to deliver top performance, they must be given proper training. Even though preventive activities are basic, the possibility of being called upon to meet an emergency situation must not be overlooked and it is the training for emergency situations which should be given priority.

One training program which has been advanced as meeting the requirement of transition from separate to integrated services includes, in broad outline, the following:

I. First phase:

A. Inductive training for new employees.

1. Police problems: arrests, basic laws and ordinances, traffic control.
2. Firefighting, rescue work.

B. Retraining for present employees.

1. Elementary firefighting for policemen.
2. Elementary police methods for firemen.

II. Second phase:

A. Advanced training for new employees.

B. Advanced training for veteran employees.

III. Third phase:

A. Specialized training.

B. Administrative and supervisory training.

IV. Fourth phase:

A. A continuous in-service and refresher program.

^{*} Robert W. Coppock and Barbara Brattin Coppock, "A Step-by-Step Method for Recruiting Policemen and Firemen," *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1958, p. 97.

There are very few cities with no training resources available from within their own boundaries and many cities have well-developed police and fire training programs in effect. Generally these training resources, supplemented by state and national programs, can be utilized to do the required training job. Co-operative training agreements may also be entered into with neighboring municipalities.

A Word of Caution

The integration of police-fire services, whether complete, partial, or co-operative, should not be undertaken hastily even though the technical personnel aspects are easily worked out. The real job, and one in which the personnel agency can play an effective role, is gaining acceptance of the change. There is understandable opposition. Police-fire integration is a departure from the customs and traditions derived from a long history of separate police and fire departments. These customs and traditions can be overcome but only by an effective selling job.

References

A SURVEY OF POLICE AND FIRE INTEGRATION. Management Information Service Report No. 165, October 1957, International City Managers' Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois. (Available only to cities subscribing to this service.)

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 83RD ANNUAL CONFERENCE. International Association of Fire Chiefs, 232 Madison Avenue, New York 16, New York.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS AND QUESTIONNAIRE INFORMATION. Cities of: Sunnyvale, California; Fort Lauderdale, Florida; Evanston, Illinois; Park Forest, Illinois; Glencoe, Illinois; Highland Park, Illinois; Dearborn, Michigan; Grosse Pointe Shores, Michigan; Grosse Pointe Woods, Michigan; Huntington Woods, Michigan; Winston-Salem, North Carolina; Oakwood, Ohio; Milton-Freewater, Oregon; Sewickley Heights, Pennsylvania; North Augusta, South Carolina; Fox Point, Wisconsin.

The Wild Ones . . .

Most of the members of every organization must be steady, plodding, dependable, path-following people. They are to an organization what the heartwood is to a tree. They give the organization stability.

But the development of an organization into something conspicuous is the work of unpredictable individuals—the ones who do startling, colorful, hitherto-unthought-of acts.

Walter Weir, great advertising copy writer, says that although human beings are inclined to follow the mass habits and beliefs and customs, they are torn from these habits and beliefs and customs by the actions and words of nonconforming individuals.

"The great religions of the world, the great political movements," he says, "did not evolve from the masses but were created and brought into being by gifted and unpredictable individuals—by mavericks."

This "maverick" in your organization may be a pain-in-the-neck at times. You and your associates may want to beat him to a pulp when he gets off the rails and creates disturbances. But, if you are smart enough to handle him, you can change the lightning bolt into controlled electricity. Don't be in too big a hurry to fire the man who does not conform. What's in his mind may be worth more than your entire plant.—Thomas Dreier in *Fitchburg Papers*; reprinted from *Personnel Information Bulletin*, December, 1957.

Development of a Standard Staffing Program

William Brody

An approach which may be applicable to many other programs where a large number of different governmental agencies perform similar functions.

IN VARYING DEGREE every state has recognized a responsibility for some or all of the following activities in connection with the hospitals, nursing homes, and other related institutions located within its borders:

Licensing of hospitals and other medical facilities;

Licensing of nursing homes and similar establishments;

Provision of consultative services in various phases of institutional planning and administration;

Survey of existing and required facilities;

Planning for and supervising construction of needed facilities.

Federal Funds for Hospitals

Impetus for the last two of these programs, and to some extent for the others as well, came from the passage of the Hospital Survey and Construction Act (Public Law 725), familiarly known as the Hill-Burton Law, in 1946. This act and its amendments provided funds on a continuing large-scale basis for the building of needed hospital facilities, both public and non-profit, and, since 1954, nursing homes and other medical facilities and institutions.

These federal funds are allocated through the respective states, each of which was required by the Act to "designate a single state agency as the sole agency for the administration of the plan or designate such agency as the sole agency for supervising the administration of the plan." (The word "state" as used in the legislation and in this article includes "territory" as well.)

As a result each state set out to provide an "agency" to handle this program within its boundaries. In some cases a unit which had been established for other purposes, usually within the Health Department, was assigned this new responsibility. Some juris-

dictions found it necessary—or desirable—to start from scratch to build up the necessary program and staff.

And State Licensing Laws

During the past 12 years, and in most cases in response to the stimulus provided by the need for legislation to implement the Hill-Burton Law, many state legislatures have also concerned themselves with establishing or revising a program for licensing hospitals. In addition, during the same period of time, legislation relative to the licensing of nursing homes and other institutions was adopted by several states, sometimes but not always in conjunction with that pertaining to hospital licensing. These state laws, like those dealing with hospital survey and construction, resulted in the modification of existing organizations or the creation of new ones.

A 2-year research project just completed by the American Hospital Association with the support of a grant from the United States Public Health Service undertook an appraisal of the programs developed across the country in response to federal and state legislation in these areas. This project, designated as "Hospital Planning and License Law Study" and under the direction of Dr. Hilary G. Fry, analyzed the relevant laws, regulations, procedures, staffing, and administrative aspects of these programs and presented appropriate recommendations for the future.

Detailed consideration of the professional program content and its effect on the quality of hospitals and other related institutions is within the province of a companion project, entitled "Future Needs for Hospital Facilities," also under the direction of the American Hospital Association and also under a

Public Health Service grant supplemented by Kellogg Foundation funds.

Staffing Pattern Studied

The present paper is concerned only with those phases of the study which deal with staffing and related personnel considerations. It is believed that the approach described herein may be applicable to many other programs, in municipalities and other jurisdictions as well as at the state level, where a large number of different governmental agencies perform identical or at least similar functions.

The basic objective of the personnel portion of the study was to develop a standard staffing pattern and accompanying class specifications to cover the general needs of the hospital and nursing home services program in all the states. Other goals included the development of recommendations with respect to desirable qualifications and post-appointment training.

Great Variation in Fundamentals

This undertaking was complicated by the great variety among the states in such fundamentals as: scope of program; volume of work; size of staff; organizational structure; delegation of responsibilities to other state agencies, to local governmental units, and even to groups outside of the government; and duties—and titles—assigned to existing positions.

Let us look for a moment at just one of these variables—basic scope of program. Although the vast majority of states provide in some way for all three principal functions (hospital licensing,¹ nursing home licensing, survey and construction), there are notable exceptions, such as the three states which have no hospital licensing program and the one which has no nursing home licensing program.

Where all three functions are provided for, they are not necessarily assigned to the same operating unit. In three states the Hill-Burton (survey and construction) program is assigned to a major administrative unit

different from that handling the two licensing programs; in nine others, the nursing home licensing function is similarly separated organizationally from hospital licensing as well as from survey and construction. Eight of the states in the two groups just referred to emphasize this separation by allocating the functions to different departments.

Where the program is handled entirely within one department it is the Department of Health—except in three states, one of which utilizes the services of its Department of Public Welfare, a second of its Department of Institutions and Agencies, and the third of a Medical Care Commission.

Corresponding variations are found in the other fundamentals cited.

It was recognized that many of these variations were completely valid and unavoidable, and that others were the result of the manner in which the new functions were first assigned. It was also recognized that any staffing pattern which might be developed would have to be flexible, particularly with respect to the size of the agency and the functions assigned to it, and would have to be considered as furnishing an example rather than a blueprint. Ultimately three organizational patterns were developed, for agencies of different sizes.

Before any recommendations could be made with respect to staffing patterns, class specifications, desirable qualifications, sources of recruiting, and staff training, it was necessary to learn something about prevailing practices.

Because of the great variation in these practices among the various states a rather large sampling of information was considered to be essential. Hence it was not practicable to obtain all the basic data by means of personal observation, although it was deemed highly desirable that information secured in written form be supplemented by actual visits to selected jurisdictions.

Questionnaire Supplements Interviews

For these reasons the questionnaire approach was decided on. Visits to state agencies and detailed interviews with program directors and other staff members were scheduled for three stages: to precede the

¹"Licensing" includes all activities of a legally constituted state agency which involve the setting and enforcing of standards for construction, maintenance, and operation of all or designated patient centers.

development of the questionnaires, to coincide with the period during which they were being completed, and to follow the preliminary analysis of the responses. On the basis of the initial visits and discussions, it was decided to develop two basic questionnaires.²

The first of these was very similar to the usual position classification questionnaire. It was intended to be completed by every state employee devoting all or part of his workday to activities relating to one or more of the three enumerated functions (hospital licensing, nursing home licensing, survey and construction.) The program director was requested to have a form completed also for each pertinent position which was vacant or whose incumbent was absent for any reason.

The accompanying instructions stipulated that all state employees engaged in one or more of these specific activities, even if officially assigned to other divisions or even departments, were to be included. Specifically excluded were employees of other jurisdictions (federal, county, or municipal) and private consultants (such as architects, engineers, or hospital consultants), but a summary statement explaining the nature and extent of their participation was requested.

The program director was also requested to supply a copy of the official specification for each class of positions involved, together with appropriate organization and functional charts.

It is obvious that information reported by means of this questionnaire could, at best, give a picture only of the duties and responsibilities of existing positions and of the nature of their interrelationships. This might be a good starting point for the development of a standard staffing pattern, but certainly left something to be desired.

Selection by Happenstance

It must be pointed out that in most states the development of a program to handle one or two or all three of the relevant functions (hospital survey and construction, hospital

licensing, nursing home licensing) was the result of external pressures requiring a quick response. Usually an individual who happened to be on the scene, who seemed to be adequately equipped to function effectively, and who wasn't too busy with indispensable responsibilities was requested to set up the program. He in turn frequently built up an organization on the basis of immediately available or quickly obtainable staff. Except in a few isolated instances there was insufficient time to analyze adequately what had to be done and to develop scientifically the wherewithal to accomplish it.

A detailed study of workers in the field of public health conducted a few years ago by the Yale Public Health Personnel Project led to a series of findings, the first of which was:

"More people enter public health because of chance and as a result of contact with public health workers than for any other reason. Other important motivating factors are work content and working conditions. Education and training are relatively less important. Formal vocational counseling plays a negligible role in recruitment for public health."³

If this is true in public health generally, it is even more so in the newer and less clearly-defined specialized areas with which we are here concerned. In fact, we can rule out almost completely the "other important motivating factors" and conclude that the most important and, in fact, almost the sole basis for the selection of those initially engaged in state programs for administering hospital survey and construction and institutional licensing programs appears to have been chance, usually in the form of association with the agency or with the individual to whom basic responsibility was assigned.

Nor has there been sufficient time since the program began, in most cases, to reflect on the basic needs, to revise the hurriedly-assembled organizational pattern, to establish logical distributions of functions, to determine appropriate combinations of duties and responsibilities, to explore proper qualification requirements in terms of both the

² Samples of these and of other forms, charts and specifications referred to in this report are available on request.

³ "The Yale Study in Public Health Administration," *Public Health Reports*, V. 70 no. 5, May, 1955, p. 446.

job to be done and the availability of necessary skills, to achieve a soundly balanced salary schedule, to evolve a training program on anything other than a catch-as-catch-can basis, to replace any of the original haphazardly selected recruits (except for the most obviously incompetent and for those who left of their own volition), or to explore the best sources for recruiting the most highly qualified potential staff members.

In view of all this, it is gratifying to observe the high quality of program results in some of the states.

Second Questionnaire on Ideal Organization

It was felt that the program directors in these states, as well as others who had done some sound thinking with respect to these problems even though they might not have been able to implement all their desires, should be encouraged to record their progressive ideas by means of a second questionnaire. Since there was no way of identifying all of the "sound thinkers" in advance, it was sent to all states together with the first questionnaire.

The projective questionnaire called for a statement of the duties and responsibilities to be assigned to each position in the ideal organization which the program director considered "essential in order to carry out the program responsibilities with maximum efficiency and effectiveness under a reasonable budget allocation." These positions might be identical with the pattern which had evolved in the particular state, they might be completely different, or they might be a combination of current and projected positions.

Among the recommendations requested for each position were title and salary, minimum and desirable qualifications, best sources of recruiting qualified applicants and training program subsequent to appointment.

Also requested were any available pertinent class specifications in addition to those accompanying the first set of questionnaires, as well as organizational and functional charts for the projected program.

Analyzing the Questionnaires

Although the participants had been requested to submit the completed questionnaires within a 2-week period, fully 2 months were to elapse before returns were in from 75 per cent of the states. Fortunately, it was never deemed necessary that a 100 per cent sample be secured to obtain either information concerning present practices or sound recommendations for the future.

Analysis of the questionnaires was not always a simple matter. For example, one employee responded to the item "Names and titles of employees supervised by incumbent" with the information, "Herb, Frank, Red, and a few others."

Almost every state makes some provision for inspectional visits to institutions by designated staff members. However, more than a dozen different titles are assigned to these employees, depending upon the jurisdiction in which they serve. The most popular titles presently assigned are Inspector, Field Representative, Nurse, Nurse Consultant, and Sanitarian. (Sometimes these titles are preceded by such terms as Hospital, Nursing Home, Medical Facilities, Senior, or Staff.) Other titles for the performance of substantially the same duties include Hospital Consultant, Hospital Administration Technician, Licensing Consultant, Sanitary Engineer, Hospital Analyst, Liaison Officer, and Hospital Standards Representative.

Some of these staff members cover the licensing of hospitals and nursing homes, some only hospitals, and some only nursing homes. Some are involved in full-fledged licensing programs, others in "approval" activities. Some have authority to include certain governmental institutions, others do not. The extent of delegation to these employees to issue, renew, and revoke licenses varies considerably from state to state.

Equal or perhaps even greater differences may be found among those to whom planning responsibilities are assigned.

Furthermore, there is evidence to indicate that, in some instances, illogical combinations of duties or inappropriate titles have been assigned to certain positions, or individuals have been reported as performing

duties for which they have no apparent qualifications.

Despite complications such as these, it was possible to identify the functions actually being performed in connection with the programs under study, as well as the functions which were considered to be of continuing importance by those directors who had given most thought to planning for the future.

These functions were then combined into groups of positions after consideration of combinations actually existing among the 38 states which supplied detailed information, the combinations suggested by those participating, and the combinations which appeared logical from an analysis of the functions.

Class Specifications Set Up

The next step was to develop idealized class specifications for these groups of positions. Seventeen such specifications were prepared for groups of positions which were considered to be unique to these programs. For an additional seven categories, e.g., architect, construction engineer, statistician, it was believed that in every jurisdiction class specifications already existed which would be generally applicable, particularly with respect to statements of duties and responsibilities and desirable qualification requirements; examples of work were provided for clarification. It was also recognized that each program would also include some positions, e.g., architectural draftsman, clerk, typist, for which the usual specification would be completely appropriate.

In connection with the first category of positions referred to above (those considered to be unique to these programs) it was found possible to identify three major types of responsibilities and to develop three corresponding series of classes. Furthermore, these series and the classes comprising each series were provided with titles which (unlike those actually being utilized in many jurisdictions) are descriptive of the responsibilities involved. The basic titles are Patient Center Planning Technician, Patient Center Standards Representative, and Patient Center Consultant.

New Phraseology Aids Clarification

The reader may be struck by the use of the term "patient center." Among the significant contributions of the companion project referred to on page 197 was the compilation of a series of landmark definitions which now have the aura of novelty but which may in time attain universal sanction.

"Patient center" fills a real need as a generic term for general hospitals, special hospitals, medical centers, nursing homes, rehabilitation centers, certain homes for the aged, and "related facilities." It is defined as a "medical establishment with permanent facilities and medical services for inpatients or outpatients or both."

"Medical services," in turn, is defined as "activities pertaining to medicine that are performed in behalf of patients by physician, dental, or parapsychician personnel."

And, finally, for our purposes, "parapsychician services" are "activities characteristic to medicine that are performed in behalf of patients by trained personnel other than physician or dental."

Organization Charts

A subgroup of the research project had developed population and workload criteria on the basis of which the various states could be divided into large, medium-sized, and small. However, it was recognized that this was an arbitrary division and that the states actually constituted a continuum with respect to size. Three sample organization charts were offered as representing states which might fall somewhere near the midpoint in each of the size groupings.

Stress was laid on the fact that both the organization charts and the class specifications were intended to be suggestions and guides rather than inflexible prototypes.

Analysis Submitted for Review

While still in draft form the suggested class specifications and organization charts were submitted to program directors in approximately half of the states for their comments. A selected group of nine of these were subsequently interviewed by telephone and another four were visited in person to secure maximum benefits from their inti-

mate knowledge of the needs of the programs.

The tentative class specifications and organization charts were also circulated among the deans of schools of public health and schools of hospital administration.

Reactions received in response to these contacts, for the most part, reaffirmed the findings and the recommendations; it is not surprising that certain responses were to some extent mutually contradictory. For example, the specifications for the top position in the program (Director of Patient Center Services) called for college education and 7 years of experience in designated specialized fields and accepted certain specified graduate degrees in lieu of part of the experience requirement. In response to the proposal that an M.D. degree be considered equivalent to 3 years of experience each of these two objections was offered in some form by several authorities:

The one fault in your total pattern is the failure to set up the M.D. degree as an absolute requirement for this position. Many situations arise in a hospital services program which require medical direction.

Graduation from a medical school should not be considered as in any way equivalent to experience in the field. There is very little in the average medical school's curriculum that bears upon the subject matter of the program or the skills needed.

Final Recommendations

Although it was obviously impossible to draw up specifications which would be acceptable to all interested parties (and although, in specific instances such as those cited, the final recommendations would probably be found unacceptable by sincere advocates of either extreme position) the comments of the experts (both those in the academic world and those on the firing line of program administration) were extremely helpful in developing final recommendations. They brought to light some inconsistencies and even errors of fact in the preliminary drafts which might not otherwise have been discovered.

The final recommendations with respect to organization charts, class specifications, and post-appointment training programs were distributed to program directors in all

states, several of whom have already indicated their endorsement. The extent to which these recommendations will be found acceptable by the other directors, as well as by department heads, staff agencies, and legislative bodies, and thus reflected in actual program revisions, remains to be seen.

Use by Other Agencies

These recommendations deal with a specific program activity which is a function of every state. There are countless other programs (in public health, in conservation, in utilities regulation, in welfare, and in many more fields) for which it should be feasible to develop standard staffing patterns, model class specifications, consistent statements of desirable qualifications, and basic training programs.

The similarities which exist among these programs justify consideration of this approach despite the obvious difference in such factors as size and scope of program, basic laws, and interrelationships with other programs. The availability of standards, designed to be adapted to local requirements, would greatly reduce the present workload of staff agencies and operating officials in preparing, for example, new or revised class specifications. Without these standards, each state now duplicates to some extent the efforts of all others, usually including the exchange of a great deal of specific information by means of personal correspondence. The problem exists in an even more intensified form among municipalities, counties, and other local governmental units.

If it is granted that there is merit to the promulgation of such standards, the question arises, "Who will undertake the task?" It may well be that the initiative should spring from professional organizations such as the Public Personnel Association, the American Public Health Association, which has already developed some excellent qualifications statements for various professional groups, the American Public Works Association, the American Public Welfare Association, and the American Municipal Association, and that support might be secured from one or more interested foundations. The potential results seem to warrant consideration.

Progress—But From a Firm Foundation

Robert A. Gross

Have merit systems yet reached a state of security that permits lowering the guard against spoils politics infiltration?

IT IS APPROPRIATE, we are constantly told, in the year of the 75th anniversary of civil service to look backwards (a little) to see where we have been and forward (to the far horizon) to see where we are heading. There has been an overwhelming launching of the "progress" theme in the literature and utterances by the leaders in our profession dealing much with the thesis that the reform era, the so-called negative aspects of public personnel administration, are in the past; that the merit principles of government are understood and accepted by the populace; and that we should leave this behind and move forward into the modern, comprehensive, progressive, positive approach. The look forward appears farsighted but the look to the rear and present seems myopic.

There can be no basic disagreement with this idea of advancing our professional standards. We are all in favor of this as professionals and career people. We are undoubtedly all striving toward this goal. We must progress to the utmost of our abilities. The only quarrel that I have is that the firm foundation upon which this progress must be based too often is simply nonexistent.

It is undoubtedly true that in many areas and levels and specific governmental structures it is time or past time when the desirable movement should be made. It should be realized, however, that, where merit principles have not yet been firmly established, this thesis is seized upon by the enemy and used as a potent weapon against the merit infant or adolescent. Untold harm can result with the wholesale discard, under all conditions, of the so-called "negative aspects."

The St. Louis Story

To illustrate this point from my own narrow view, in my community (City of St. Louis), it cannot be said that the solid founda-

tion of basic security is already here. When the proposal was put to the people 16 years ago for the adoption of a merit system amendment to the City Charter, the leading political circles were so confident of its defeat that they did not attempt to seriously oppose the amendment. Everyone was thoroughly surprised when the amendment was adopted.

Once awakened by the election, the political leaders launched upon an all-out effort to retrieve the past. They never have ceased trying and probably never will. Nearly all of the tactics and gambits used under these circumstances was employed, including legislative acts to reduce salaries of the personnel people, ripper legislation, etc.

Since the good citizens who wrote the merit principles in the specific law were well aware of the hostile actions that would be forthcoming if the amendment should unexpectedly be voted, they wisely wrote a very strong, specific, and detailed basic law. This is the only thing that saved the infant. The two indispensable elements for survival were the provisions for the placing of the chief personnel administrator in the classified service with tenure and a guaranteed minimum appropriation for the central personnel agency. Numerous legal actions had to be fought to the Supreme Court on every important issue.

Opposition to the Merit System

Now this original victory does not mean the end of the struggle. In a recent attempt to overhaul the entire Charter, serious recommendations were put forward by our legislative body and the other political chieftains for the simple excision of approximately 2,000 of the lowest-paid unskilled employees from the merit system, and one reason stated for this proposed act was to award these

jobs as patronage to the chief administrator for his use as a weapon or bargaining counter with the state legislature in the course of another struggle. These, of course, are a group of employees who need the merit protection perhaps more than any other group.

The highest-level career positions of division heads, the Commissioner level, were also recently advocated for elimination from merit coverage. Thus the merit system was proposed to be sandwiched by patronage layers at the lowest and highest levels.

Attacks were also made on the cost of merit system operations even though the guaranteed minimum appropriation provides only the bare minimum services, and not once in the history of the agency have the city fathers seen fit to provide funds for the administration of the Department of Personnel, in excess of the minimum, in order to finance movement into the modern "positive" activities. Our successes in this area have been at the expense of other basic functions. A former chief administrator of the City, upon his election to office here, bluntly announced his opposition to the merit system and did not even confer with the personnel director of the merit program more than 2 or 3 times during his 4-year term.

What's Happening in the State

The state merit system, which is also of comparatively recent origin, has since the beginning been confined by the establishing legislative act to minimum services to only a few of the state agencies. Within the past few weeks, the governor and the legislature have been in the process of removing several of the top career positions from merit coverage. The removal of these positions was not even based upon the premise that these were "policy-making" positions. It was simply stated that control of these positions was needed for effective administration. Not one word of opposition has been expressed in print by the practitioners or academicians in public administration in this area.

The Leaders Speak Up

In the face of this climate what do our leading spokesmen provide in the way of service to our professional goals?

At the time of the consideration of our Charter revision a consultant was brought in to speak to the citizens writing the new Charter. This outstanding and frequently published professor of public administration at one of the greatest eastern universities, who is also a practitioner with some experience in public administration, advised the charter writers that the time has come to forget the negative and control features of merit problems and move forward, etc., etc., and that modern concepts embrace the practice of complete control over personnel matters by the chief executive. It is incomprehensible that such a well-informed person could have bothered to understand our local climate when he made such recommendations.

A professor of government at a local university whose chosen field is public personnel administration implied to the same group that there was no longer a need for tenure for a career personnel administrator or for a guaranteed minimum appropriation.

In a very recent speech before career people in government, and university faculty and students in public administration, the new chief executive officer of our largest career system deplored the "part-fish and part-fowl" system in the appointment of postmasters as one of the reasons for lack of high prestige of government service. Thereupon, the acting head of the newly created governmental research bureau of the University of Missouri gratuitously defended these political appointments on the basis of "long tradition" and "the community link of the people with their government." One wonders at the attitude of graduates of this school when they consider making a career in government.

Tenable Without Tenure?

Whether or not the reader is impressed with the current theories of need for full control by the chief executive, including appointment and removal at will of the chief personnel officer as a principle of good management, I personally shudder at the thought of the conditions facing a newly established merit system in a previously long-time patronage area. And with possibly an elected chief executive who believes, as

some in the past have, that civil service is socialism and that spoils appointments are the lifeblood of our democratic system.

The hope that a personnel director appointed without tenure by this type of chief executive will be very effective in the promotion and administration of a true career service seems fairly remote. To believe that a politically elected legislature will provide adequate funds for the operation of a true merit system in this type of climate without a guaranteed minimum of funds provided in the basic law, at least in my area, is being naive to an extreme.

Forward—From a Firm Foundation

No one wishes more than I that we could move forward without a need for protecting our flanks, and that the era of reform should be behind us. Unfortunately, it is not true throughout the nation. There are still more governmental organizations under the spoils

and pseudomerit systems than there are in true merit systems. In this year of perspective, let us face the realities.

I did not mean to be so lengthy in this paper for my own thesis is a simple one. This is: To make sure the foundation is secure before moving on into advanced fields. Our "experts" will be doing far greater service in the future to all of us if they will provide assistance designed to help the embattled troops secure their base as well as to lead the way into the golden age of progress.

The reform movement must be successful in the specific community, at least the older ones, before progressing into the merit era and career service age. You cannot, in my humble opinion, spring immediately from creation in a bloody battle into full maturity without progressing through the intermediate growing stages. Impatient as we may be, a few decades is a very short period in a man's efforts to improve self-government.

Grab Loose . . .

Learning how to let go of authority is one of a manager's trickiest tasks. Managers who have achieved successful delegation agree that there are two essential requirements—a philosophy and a plan.

The philosophy is willing acceptance of a calculated risk. If you cannot bear the thought that somebody may goof, you will never be able to give more than lip service to delegation.

H. E. Humphreys, Jr., president of U.S. Rubber and a leading exponent of decentralization, readily admits that an inexperienced subordinate who is "cut loose from close supervision" may "get his fingers burned."

"So, perhaps, will the company," says Humphreys. "But that is the risk we must take if we want combat-experienced executives."

General Electric's Ralph Cordiner believes that mistakes at lower echelons are a reasonable price to pay for the agility which an organization acquires when effective power is dispersed widely and deeply as it is in his company.

"The decision to place responsibility and authority closer to the scene of the problem," says Mr. Cordiner, "provides the organization with an ability to turn on a dime not possible with earlier centralized arrangements."—From "How To Let Go Of Authority" in *Nation's Business*, March, 1958.

Preretirement Counseling Programs: Six Different Approaches

Maurice F. Ronayne

Methods used by several federal agencies in preparing employees for retirement, and the variations in procedure they found desirable.

A PRIVATE or public organization may spend 20 or 30 years in mapping out every step of a man's employment career. But, strangely enough, these organizations may neglect to prepare the same employee for the difficult and complex years he will have to face after retirement. In some instances, these years may almost equal the time he has spent in his entire employment career.

Fortunately, many farsighted organizations have recognized the need to counsel employees to be ready to face and to resolve the many new problems which may arise after retirement. As a result, preretirement counseling programs have been established to educate the expectant retiree to be economically and psychologically prepared for his golden years.

Several agencies of the federal government have, within the past 5 years, established preretirement counseling programs for their civilian employees on an individual installation basis. Most of the plans are very similar. This is because in most instances they were either based upon successful plans already set up in private industry, or they were established with the guidance of university experts in this field.

But the purpose of this article is not to discuss the general characteristics of good preretirement counseling programs. Instead, the object of this article is to show the variations in approach and some of the reasons for such variations in preretirement counseling programs in the federal service. Many of the differences are extremely interesting and may be of value to personnel officers who already are operating preretirement plans and for those who will establish similar plans in the future.

No Agency-Wide Programs

As mentioned previously, no federal agency has an agency-wide program of preretirement counseling. These programs are generally handled on an individual installation basis. Federal agencies having preretirement counseling programs include the following organizations:

Federal Mediation & Conciliation Service
(FMCS)—Washington, D. C.
General Services Administration
(GSA)—Washington, D. C.
Navy—Bureau of Ships
(BUSHIPS)—Washington, D. C.
Navy—Bureau of Supplies and Accounts
(BUSANDA)—Washington, D. C.
Navy Supply Center
(NSC)—Norfolk, Va.
Veterans Administration—Regional Office
(VA)—Cleveland, Ohio.

To emphasize more clearly the variations between these six preretirement counseling programs, it is convenient to break down preretirement into seven phases for discussion purposes. Then it will be possible to discuss each phase in the light of the variations in the federal agency programs. With the exception of the FMCS program, most of the facts about these federal agency programs were gained from correspondence with personnel officers who set up and operated their agency preretirement counseling programs.

"An Obligation To Counsel"

FMCS—The director of the service, Joseph F. Finnegan, had long been concerned by the large number of mediators facing retirement age. Many had been hired during

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

World War II when they were already in their 60's.

The director became especially interested in a preretirement program when he read a special magazine supplement in *The Christian Science Monitor* in early 1957 which dealt with the Golden Years after retirement. He decided then that the Service needed a program which would alert these older men to the years they must plan for after retirement.

GSA—The Personnel Division had for many years furnished routine facts about the Retirement Act to prospective retirees and to employees asking specifically for figures on annuities. But after a considerable study of the whole program, the director of personnel, H. Richard McCament, said: "The whole matter of retirement is too important for an employee to postpone his thoughts on the subject until the last few months before he retires. In assisting him in this important matter, the agency has an obligation to counsel him on a variety of retirement problems."

BUSHIPS—Here the Employee Relations Section found through regular counseling interviews with employees and supervisors, and from exit interviews with employees already retiring, that those facing retirement had an underlying fear of what awaited them after retirement. Some did not know what they would do with the extra time. Others had family problems, health, or financial ones. All these problems pointed towards the need for a preretirement counseling program to educate the employee to be ready for retirement problems and to be prepared to deal with them.

To further support these findings, in the fall of 1956, about 100 employees who were either 5, 10, or 15 years away from retirement were interviewed to determine their opinions about the need for retirement preparation, any particular areas that were of concern regarding the later years, what plans they were making, and if they personally wanted to participate in a preretirement counseling program. The results were conclusive enough to warrant setting up a program.

NSC—Although the Supply Center had conducted an individual counseling program

for retirees for many years, personnel officers felt that these employees were still misinformed as to their pension rights and privileges, and in general were not prepared for retirement. As a result, questionnaires were sent to all employees ages 55 to 60 with 28 or more years' service, and those 60 years of age or older with 3 or more years of service, to determine whether they were interested in such a program. Of the 350 questioned, 270 desired to attend, with 200 attending all the sessions.

Setting Up the Programs

FMCS—This program was prepared under the over-all direction of the director of administrative management, Lawrence E. Eady, and members of his staff. The existing programs of GSA and BUSANDA were reviewed and certain aspects of each were adapted for FMCS use. At the same time, business firms were queried for information about their plans. No direct outside aid was used except for requests to send written materials. The first course was held in Washington, D. C., January, 1958.

BUSHIPS and BUSANDA—These two organizations based their program largely upon material used by the University of Chicago which helped to train personnel officers from these organizations in conducting preretirement counseling programs.

The general philosophy of the university program is that an understanding of what aging and retirement entail will help to dispel fear and to promote constructive thinking and intelligent planning regarding any future adjustments which may be required.

Publicizing the Programs

FMCS—The director of the service issued a directive to all employees stating the objectives and content of the new service preretirement counseling program. Mention also was made that such a program would be carried out each year. Each of the mediators invited to the first course received individually addressed letters of invitation from the director of the service. Later, after the first course was completed, the employee newsletter carried a group picture of the retirees taken together with top officials of the service; an accompanying news story described the program.

BUSANDA and BUSHIPS—These two Naval organizations announced the programs through the bureau newsletters or daily bulletins because they expected to have large groups attend the course.

GSA—Only a few persons were invited to the first course, so each person invited was sent a personal letter of invitation.

Number Attending, Length of Sessions

FMCS—Six mediators attended the first course which lasted three days. Morning and afternoon sessions were each about three hours in length. This was done because mediators do not generally, because of the nature of their work, have regular office hours. Hence, it was felt best to have the course completed all at once.

GSA—Twenty participants attended one and one-half hour sessions once a week for 5 weeks. Wives were also invited. The time was so arranged that the preretiree spent 45 minutes having his lunch with fellow course members, and the last 45 minutes he listened to a speaker. In this way, both the employee and employer contributed equal time to the course.

BUSANDA—No limitation on the number of participants was set for the course although preference was given to employees approaching the compulsory retirement age. Wives also were invited. Each week a two-hour session was held, totaling eleven in all.

BUSHIPS—Groups were limited to 20 including wives. There were 11 weekly sessions lasting one and one-half hours each.

NSC—No limitation was set on the number of employees to attend each course. Seven meetings were held in all. They were bimonthly and lasted one and one-half hours.

Course Content

FMCS—Perhaps the most important part of the course content was the "Dutch Treat" luncheon held the first day where the director of the service, top FMCS officials, and the mediator course participants all met to reminisce about common service experiences. Because the group consisted only of six course participants plus the top officials, everyone had an excellent chance to "let down their hair" and to air their opinions

on how things could be improved in the service.

During the actual course sessions, the participants were informed about retirement rights and privileges, had their annuities computed, and, most important, they were told of possible part-time job opportunities after retirement. They were alerted to the fact they might offer their services to labor-management disputants as arbitrators, or, in some cases, they might come back to the service as WAE (when actually employed) mediators to handle cases they had special knowledge about or to help cut down on a heavy workload.

This encouragement was in line with the philosophy of the director of the service that these men were too valuable to discard simply because they had left the service. They have services and skills which would always be valuable. This attitude helped considerably to boost morale.

BUSANDA and BUSHIPS—These two organizations followed the pattern set up by the University of Chicago with some modifications. Eleven sessions were devoted to:

Looking Ahead to Maturity;
Nutrition and Health in the Later Years;
The Physical Side of Aging;
Mental Health in Later Life;
Financial Planning for Retirement;
The Meaning of Work and Retirement;
Getting the Most Out of Leisure;
Increasing Your Retirement Income;
Family, Friends, and Living Arrangements in Later Life;
Where to Live When You Retire;
and finally, a Summing Up.

The course is quite comprehensive and should be stretched over a fairly long period of time. There is too much material to be absorbed in one continuous course unless divided at least by a week.

NSC—The Supply Center has two sessions which have unusual topics. At one, the participants are acquainted with the local recreational and social activities sponsored by the City of Norfolk Recreation Bureau. At this session the participants are told how they can be of service to the community by volunteering for duty with the Civil Defense Forces.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

An extremely interesting and useful meeting is one called "What Others Have Done." Twenty-five retired employees of the Supply Center who are named by the course participants are invited in for roundtable discussions. These retired employees give firsthand information on how their own plans have materialized after retirement. In this way, future retirees can be better prepared for making more realistic plans of their own.

Preretirement Kits Prepared

FMCS—The service was able to obtain most of its 20 pamphlets for free by writing to such federal government agencies as the Civil Service Commission; Department of Health, Education, and Welfare; Social Security Administration; Federal Housing Administration; Housing and Home Finance Agency; and the Public Health Service. Free booklets were obtained from the National Association of Retired Civil Employees and the District of Columbia Library. Some large insurance firms supplied the service with various free booklets on retirement. As a result, a complete kit was made up with little or no cost to the service.

GSA—The agency supplies its retirees with a kit which includes a pamphlet entitled "Do You Need A Will?" This important phase of preretirement counseling is sometimes disregarded because of its nature, but, nevertheless, it is important that the family of the retiree be protected in case of his death.

NSC—The Supply Center gives to each retiree its own preretirement book, *Preparation For Retirement Handbook*, which contains very interesting and easy-to-read information about retirement, and how it affects the federal employee as well as the average senior citizen. Many thought-provoking articles have been reprinted in the booklet from leading national magazines on the general subject of retirement.

VA—The regional office approached the construction of a preretirement kit in a very interesting manner. A group of about ten 30-year employees formed a committee which selected the contents for the first preretirement kit from a hundred or more pieces of literature on retirement. Their

wealth of experience and common interests were of direct benefit to the preretirees.

VA plans eventually to give a kit to every employee with 5 years or more of civil service employment. The kits are continually revised, with older material being replaced with more up-to-date leaflets and booklets.

Subject Matter of Speeches

FMCS—Because of the small number of participants attending its course plus the fact that the time was limited to three days, it was decided not to have outside speakers on medical problems of the older person, or on housing needs, etc. Instead, the participants were advised to see their own physician and to read the handouts in the preretirement kits on housing, Social Security, and other subjects.

However, one interesting phase of the FMCS speakers' program was to bring in two outside speakers who represented organizations which the preretiree might be interested in joining after retirement. One speaker was from the National Association of Retired Civil Employees, and the second was from the Senior Citizens of America. Both speakers were retired themselves.

The first organization is composed of retired civil employees at all levels of government, municipal to federal. The second group is composed of retirees from all walks of life. The service felt that the participants should know that such groups do exist for their benefit. Both organizations have local chapters all over the country where the retiree can become a member and enjoy social activities with others having similar backgrounds to his own.

GSA—Speakers presented talks on the general medical problems facing the older person, how housing problems can be solved, and how to develop new interests and hobbies. One speaker, a representative from an investment firm, talked about financial planning for the retiree. Many of the employees wanted to know how they could safely invest their savings to get a supplemental income to their pensions.

BUSHIPS—Generally, a medical doctor speaks about health problems of oldsters. In addition, BUSHIPS tries to tailor its programs to the desires of the participants. For

example, one group was interested in living in Florida after retirement, and, as a result, an expert on retirement areas was brought in to discuss this subject. Another course group, having had some work experience outside of government, wanted information on Social Security coverage. To fill this need, a representative from the Social Security Administration was guest speaker.

Successful Senior Citizenship

Here then are some of the more unusual variations of preretirement counseling programs carried out by federal agencies. Some of them may be adapted to the use of other agencies planning similar programs.

The sponsors of all the programs believe them to be a success and plan to continue to operate them. Although attendance was voluntary, most preretirees attended the courses.

But unfortunately, to the majority of people facing retirement, it is something to be dreaded. This is especially true when they have no one to turn to for advice.

However, these people can be given a helping hand to show them that the golden years of the senior citizen are not to be feared but are to be looked forward to with serenity. The theme of all preretirement pro-

grams should be that the employee will not "retire from" anything but that he will "retire to" a way of life which will be as productive, and as challenging, as any working day of his younger years. Dr. Albert Schweitzer, General Douglas MacArthur, Senator Theodore F. Green, Pablo Casals, Chancellor Konrad Adenauer, Frank Lloyd Wright—these are a few "oldsters" who are mentally and physically leaders of the world in their fields today.

One thing must be recognized. There is a definite need for preretirement counseling as the population of our nation grows older. Medical science has increased the expectant life span to three score and ten. More and more Americans will have to plan for many more years of living after retirement. Some will need help. This is where preretirement counseling will be most valuable.

And remember, planning for retirement should start early. As one participant at a GSA preretirement counseling program said, "These meetings have been very helpful and a wonderful thing for all of us. My only suggestion would be that you arrange to tell 40-year-olds the things we listened to. One should plan early for retirement, not wait until the last minute."

Seven Ways To Track Down a Policeman . . .

San Diego has hired 100 qualified policemen recently, but it took a nationwide search to do it. To recruit enough new policemen to patrol a newly-annexed area and keep the rest of the force up to strength, the city

—Sent an interview team to Chicago where 35 candidates passed the intensive examinations

—Used display ads in the sports section of major local newspapers, as well as daily classified ads

—Released feature stories on the recruiting drive to the major dailies and 60 neighborhood and county papers

—Put spot announcements on local radio and television stations

—Included a recruitment pitch in letters welcoming new residents

—Sent a civil service commission staff member on a recruiting tour of the newly-annexed area

—Posted bulletins in stores and public buildings.—*Public Administration Bulletin*, March 30, 1958.

A Guide for Maintaining Uniform Discipline

Alvin Karp

Widely varying penalties for similar offenses were creating critical personnel problems; how one government department found a satisfactory solution.

THE LOS ANGELES County Department of Charities is responsible for the operation of 6 large hospitals, 6 welfare bureaus, and 2 camps for indigent homeless men. Of the 36,000 persons employed by the County of Los Angeles, 14,000 work for the Department of Charities. This department, like other governmental activities in the Southern California area, has experienced in the last 10 years substantial growth, both in the number of employees and demands for service from the public.

Coincident with this growth, many new personnel problems have arisen and many existing ones have become more complex. One of the most critical personnel problem areas that came to the attention of the Superintendent of Charities was in the field of employee discipline. Comments and complaints were received by this department head from employees, employee organizations, and the civil service staff concerning the need for a uniform disciplinary policy throughout the department. Instances were cited where similar offenses, all within the same department, received widely varying penalties according to the hospital or bureau in which they occurred.

The personnel program of the Los Angeles County Department of Charities is under the jurisdiction of the Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission whose rules cover three specific types of disciplinary actions. The rules provide for suspension without pay for a period up to 30 days, and such suspension is not appealable to the Commission; demotion to a lower level position which may be appealed to the Commission; and discharge from the service which also may be appealed to the Commission. When any of these three disciplinary actions is taken, a copy of the official letter notifying

the employee of such action is sent to the Civil Service Commission. That agency requires detailed justification and explanation in each case to assure that equitable treatment is afforded the employee and to demonstrate that the department has conducted an impartial, thorough investigation prior to taking action.

Difficulties in Developing Guide

There was nothing within civil service rules upon which to develop a disciplinary guide other than the basic rules themselves. It was necessary to develop a set of rules based on the needs of the department, past experiences, and current practices in the public and private employment fields. The development of such a guide was to be quite difficult since its provisions would apply to all employees, from the lowest-paid, non-skilled laborer or hospital employee, to professional persons in the fields of medicine, social work, or rehabilitation. Because of the human element and because of extenuating circumstances, the disciplinary manual was developed as a guide whose use would be tempered with wise administrative discretion. The word "guide" was specifically chosen rather than "code" or any other such word which might denote purely punitive intent and action.

After research of current texts and articles on employee discipline and a review of existing disciplinary procedures of public and private agencies, a draft of a departmental disciplinary guide was developed. The guide was adapted particularly to the needs of the Los Angeles County Department of Charities and designed for use under the Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission rules. Copies of this draft were then distributed to the hospital directors and bureau chiefs for suggestions and comments.

It was interesting to note that these drafts were eagerly analyzed in detail by all of the line officials and returned promptly because, as was indicated in many of their replies, there was a pressing need for such a guide. When all of the comments were in, the final guide was prepared.

As is usual in such cases, the comments of the operating officials were invaluable in preparing the document. These comments highlighted for inclusion certain situations of discipline which are peculiar to specific bureau or hospital environments. No other substantial changes were suggested in the guide, and comments generally pertained to the great need for such a departmental document.

A Sliding Scale of Penalties Indicated

Replies received from line personnel indicated the necessity for having a sliding scale of penalties because of the large number of occupational levels included and the fact that the severity with which an offense should be treated must vary according to the agency and place in which it occurred. A "No Smoking" infraction, for example, would bear a different penalty in an office location than it would in a hospital anesthesia area where explosion hazards are always present. The case of a professional person reporting to duty under the influence of alcohol must be handled differently than an instance where the laborer or laundry worker appears under the same condition.

Sliding-scale penalties were established for use by administrators who would have the responsibility of making the decision as to the exact degree of severity of discipline to be instituted due to circumstances, length of employment of the individual involved, and past employment history. Although some line officials requested specific penalties under a rigid outline of infractions and their related penalties, it was felt that such a code would not properly reflect the disciplinary policy of the department, which is that disciplinary action is not used as a reprisal device or a punitive action but as a corrective measure.

When this disciplinary guide was first contemplated, it was anticipated that there would be perhaps a page of instructions and

a 3- or 4-page list of offenses and related penalties. Surprisingly enough, in its final form, the guide contains only 4 pages listing offenses and penalties preceded by 9 introductory pages which discuss the supervisor's responsibility for discipline, department policy on discipline, and procedures in the use of discipline.

It was felt that the 9-page section was the most important part of the guide since it not only established department policy, but also set the climate under which the personnel program operates. These 9 pages of policy and philosophy are presented attractively in an easy to read manner; 9 pages of single-spaced, dryly-worded "instructions" would never be read by anyone but the author of the guide, and he already was aware of its contents.

Discipline Not a Reprisal Device

The 9-page text portion is composed of 3 subdivisions. The first part outlines the basic disciplinary policy and personnel relations policy of the Department of Charities and discusses the use of the guide. It is at this point the guide firmly establishes the department policy that "disciplinary action is not used as a reprisal device or a punitive action, but as a corrective measure to impress upon the employee and the work group the need for correct behavior and responsibility as a public employee." This basic policy is reflected throughout the guide in the pages of discussion that follow.

It is also noted that the guide is somewhat divorced from the problems of the regular performance evaluation reports, since the performance evaluation is regarded as a supervisory tool pertaining to over-all, long-term employee behavior and development. It is established that the guide is designed to allow for the use of discretion by administrators. Statements made in this first part form the foundation for related discussion on supervisory responsibilities and supervisory policies discussed in pages that follow.

Avoiding Problems of Discipline

The second part, entitled "The Role of the Supervisor," briefly discusses this subject and the importance of the supervisor in

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

maintaining employee morale and guidance so that problems of discipline do not arise. The following basic tenets of good supervision which are the responsibility of each supervisor are listed.

The supervisor who is competently performing his duty observes the following:

SOUND TENETS OF BASIC SUPERVISION

He continually informs each employee:

1. The objectives of his job and of the unit in which he works.
2. The tasks he is to perform.
3. The accepted methods of doing these tasks.
4. The standards of performance for his job.
5. How well he meets these standards of performance.
6. How he can improve his work and develop his capabilities.

The third part discusses the actual disciplinary action, reminding the administrator again of the need for "preventative maintenance" and the cost and value of employee training. An outline is presented to assist the administrator in maintaining a proper program of employee discipline. This outline lists and discusses rules to be observed so that fair discipline may be maintained. The rules listed are:

1. Practice what you preach.
2. Inform the employee in writing what the accepted behavior rules are for his job.
3. Establish reasonable work objectives.
4. Foster a favorable working atmosphere.
5. Consistently maintain firm, impartial control.
6. Without playing psychiatrist, be aware of possible outside causes for employee misconduct.

A discipline checklist follows this which is, in effect, a procedure to follow when handling a disciplinary matter. The checklist raises the following points of which the administrators must be aware.

DISCIPLINE CHECKLIST

- I. Have I Secured the Necessary Facts?
 - A. Did the employee have an oppor-

tunity to tell fully his side of the story?

- B. Did I check with the employee's immediate supervisor?
 - C. Did I investigate all other sources of information?
 - D. Did I hold my interviews privately so as to avoid embarrassing the affected employee or employees?
 - E. Did I exert every possible effort to verify the information?
 - F. Have I shown any discrimination toward an individual or group?
 - G. Have I let personalities affect my decision?
- II. Have I Administered the Corrective Measure in the Proper Manner?
 - A. Did I consider whether it should be done individually or collectively?
 - B. Am I prepared to explain to the employee why the action is necessary?
 1. The effect of the violation on the County, fellow employees, and himself.
 2. To help him improve his efficiency and also that of the Department.
 - C. Am I prepared to tell him how he can prevent a similar offense in the future?
 - D. Am I prepared to deal with any resentment he might show?
 - E. Have I filled out a Personnel Folder Memo describing the incident to be signed by the employee? A copy of this memo should be given to the employee, and he should be informed that that he may respond in writing—for the record.
 - F. Have I considered the seriousness of the employee's conduct in relation to his particular job and his employment record with the County when determining the exact penalty?
 - G. Have I decided on the disciplinary action as a corrective measure and not a reprisal for an offense?

III. Have I Made the Necessary Follow-Up?

- A. Has the measure had the desired effect on the employee?
- B. Have I done everything possible to overcome any resentment?
- C. Have I endeavored to compliment him on his good work?
- D. Has the action had the desired effects on other employees in the Department?

Categories and descriptions of disciplinary actions which are warning, reprimand, suspension, demotion, and discharge, are then listed and described.

Balancing Offenses and Penalties

The final portion of the guide is the list of offenses and penalties. For any given cause, the penalties are divided into first, second, and third offenses. For a certain offense the listed penalties might be a written reprimand for the first offense, 3- to 10-day suspension for the second offense, and discharge for the third offense. In some categories, such as failure to follow established rules and regulations, the first offense may merit action ranging from warning up to discharge, depending upon the circumstances. In many cases, such as insubordination or theft, the first offense will merit a discharge. A sample excerpt from this portion of the guide follows:

Comments on Guide's Effectiveness

The disciplinary guide has been in use approximately 11 months and has proved successful. Among comments received to date on its use are requests for more specific definitions, such as what constitutes excessive absence or excessive tardiness. Such specific definitions are intentionally omitted in order to require the use of proper administrative discretion. However, standard department policies are being developed pertaining to excessive tardiness, absence, and related matters which can be interpreted for use with the disciplinary guide.

One of the most important questions which arose in the distribution of the guide was how far down the line it should go. It was decided that this is basically a management tool and not to be used by first line supervisors as a threat or a club over the employee's head. Copies of the guide went to hospital directors, bureau directors, and their principal division chiefs. It is not a secret document and, if anyone desires to see it, it is available for inspection and discussion.

This guide was developed to meet specific needs of the department. At the present time, the Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission staff is distributing a similar guide on a more general basis for the entire Los Angeles County service. There is no duplication of effort in this case since the County guide is very general, quite similar to the first portion of the Department of

LOS ANGELES COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF CHARITIES UNIFORM DISCIPLINE GUIDE

CAUSES FOR TAKING DISCIPLINARY ACTION AND PENALTIES FOR SUCH CAUSES

<i>Causes</i>	<i>Penalties</i>		
	First Offense	Second Offense	Third Offense
Discourtesy to or failure to work harmoniously with fellow employees.	Warning*		
	Reprimand	3-10 Days Susp.	Discharge
Falsification of timecards of self or other employees.			
	3-15 Days Susp.	Discharge	
Acceptance of gifts or gratuities from the public in connection with performance of duty as a County employee.			
	Discharge		
Failure to follow established rules and regulations.	Warning*	3-30 Days Susp.*	
	Discharge	Discharge	Discharge

* As explained previously, the penalty in these cases may range from a warning, which is the mildest action, to a discharge depending on the circumstances of the case.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Charities disciplinary guide with discussions of discipline and discipline procedure, while implementation and tables of offenses and penalties will be left up to the operating departments.

The hospital directors and bureau chiefs have stated that they are pleased with the existence of this guide since they have a standard from which to work, and a basis upon which to make decisions in disciplinary matters so that they personally feel that action taken was fair and not arbitrary.

Great lack of uniformity no longer exists and employees and their representatives know that they are being judged on a standard basis.

Although the original purpose in the development of this guide was to standardize

offenses and related penalties, distribution of the guide has achieved a much more positive and important result. In addition to assuring a standard discipline code in the department, it is also reinforcing and reinforming operating officials on the role of the supervisor in employee discipline, the use of preventative maintenance to avoid the need for discipline, and the method by which to handle a disciplinary action, including objective investigation and discussion with all concerned.

The Los Angeles County Department of Charities is proud of its achievement in this important field of personal relations. It has emphasized the fact that discipline is not to be invoked as a retaliatory measure but as an instructive device.

Polish Up Your Public Relations . . .

For those of us in the government service, we can:

- Insure that we are providing the very best possible services to the public.
- Increase our activities in participating in community affairs and thereby demonstrate our interest in public affairs.
- Conduct ourselves at all times in a manner that reflects credit to ourselves and the public in general.
- Make the accomplishments of federal workers known to our friends, neighbors, and the government as our employer.
- Accept justified criticism objectively and do something about it.
- Counteract by actions and words, if necessary, unjustified or thoughtless attacks on federal workers.
- Solicit the support and understanding of civic groups such as is in evidence here tonight.

Now let us consider just a few actions that civic groups and the public at large might consider in this respect:

- Take collective action to suppress unwarranted or thoughtless attacks of the federal worker.
- Encourage capable individuals to seek federal employment.
- Include the federal employee in the affairs of the community to the extent that there are no prohibitions.
- Take an active interest in the affairs of government so as to develop an appreciation for the problems, the mission, and the people engaged in operating federal establishments.
- Call to the attention of proper authorities those services or practices that are considered by the public to be substandard. This is especially important at the local level.
- Co-operate in providing recognition for the accomplishments of outstanding federal employees such as is in evidence here this evening.
- From an address by Robert H. Willey, Director of Army Civilian Personnel, to Kansas City Federal Personnel Council and the Kiwanis Council of Greater Kansas City, January 15, 1958; the occasion was in honor of the "Civil Servant of the Year."

Making a Good Recruiting Program Better

Harry P. Petrie and Sid Panush

Co-operation of high school teachers results in 100% increase in number of eligible typist-clerks and stenographers.

THE Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission, like other personnel agencies throughout the United States, has learned that sitting back and waiting for good employees to drop by will result in one sure thing—a long wait. Like many other agencies, the Commission has come to the realization that an aggressive, imaginative recruitment program is essential if departments are to be adequately staffed with capable, efficient employees.

In April, 1955, a special program to recruit graduating high school seniors for difficult-to-fill Typist-Clerk and Stenographer positions was developed (Public Personnel Review, April, 1956). The program was designed with two basic features: (1) examinations on campus for the convenience of student candidates and (2) actual job offers made at time of examination. The procedures developed on the basis of these principles in 1955 were used successfully again in 1956. Many fine new employees were secured for the operating departments as a result of these efforts.

Approaching the 1957 graduating year, the agency was confronted with new problems. A canvass of estimated needs revealed a greater number of vacancies than ever before. In addition, the workload of the staff precluded any large expenditures of time on a special project as in previous years.

This article outlines the resolution of these problems. It reports the Third Annual High School Recruitment Program for June graduates—a program which resulted in a 100% increase in the number of eligibles at a fraction of the cost in man-hours.

These results were important to the departments which filled all vacant positions and to over 400 graduating seniors who secured jobs in the County service. The results should also be significant to other civil

service agencies. They are important because they indicate the benefits to be derived from a positive, total recruitment effort based on an awareness of the labor market realities, an ability and a willingness to change existing procedures—even apparently successful procedures—and a confident positive attitude toward current problems.

The Third Annual High School Recruitment Program for June graduates was developed with two objectives in mind: to secure a larger number of better qualified applicants from all County areas, and to do this with the least possible expense and in a manner requiring the least interruption in regular Civil Service functions.

Both objectives were satisfied. Highly qualified candidates were recruited in large numbers and from all areas of the County. The usual work of the department was not interrupted. During the two-week school recruitment period, 50 regular Civil Service examinations were administered—examinations which in previous years would have been postponed because of the high school program.

Major Modifications in the 1957 Program

1. To insure complete coverage of the high schools and junior colleges in the area, schools were visited personally by technicians of the staff. Each of the 30 technical members of the Recruitment Division was assigned schools to be visited on his way to or from work. The schools were assigned on the basis of proximity to the residence of the technician. A few hours time resulted in a 100% coverage of schools with but little interference with regular work schedules.

2. The testing and scoring procedures were modified so that teachers could ad-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

minister and score the written part of the examination. In former years, teams of clerks and examiners visited the schools and administered and scored the tests. The new procedure resulted in considerable savings in time and expense.

3. The written test was shortened so that it could be administered in one class period.

4. Ratings of personal qualifications were made by teachers; interviews were eliminated. It was felt that ratings by teachers would be as good or better than ratings in an interview since the teachers had observed behavior over a long period of time.

5. Funds were secured for payment of teachers.

6. The tour of County installations for those who passed the examination was eliminated and a one-day orientation for those who were appointed was substituted.

It should be noted that the above modifications were made following analyses of previous programs and consultations with teachers, school boards, students, department heads, and members of the Civil Service staff.

Essential Steps in the Total Recruitment Program

Preparation

1. Complete instruction sheets for teachers, covering step-by-step the recruiting, testing, scoring, and reporting, were prepared for each school.

2. Information sheets were prepared for use by each technician visiting the schools.

3. Kits of materials were assembled for each school. These campus kits contained the instruction sheets for teachers, the publicity material, tests, scoring stencils, and reporting forms.

4. The complete kits and instruction sheets for teachers were distributed to the technical staff at meetings during which the general plan for the program and the contents of the kits were fully reviewed. At this time the technicians were also notified of the schools they were to visit.

Presentation

5. Preliminary publicity material and a personal letter announcing the new program

was sent to each school two weeks prior to the visit by the Civil Service technician.

6. Each of the high schools and junior colleges was visited during a selected 1-week period. Technicians were permitted to make their visits at times best suited to their individual schedules. The technicians explained the program, the contents of the kits, and answered questions. Each acted as liaison with his schools and reported results to the project coordinator.

7. The schools publicized the examination by means of notices in the school papers, announcements posted on bulletin boards, and through official notices read in class periods. These materials were all available in the kits.

8. The students notified their teachers of their desire to participate in the examinations and the teachers set their own date of administration for any day in a prescribed 2-week period.

9. Tests were scored by the teachers and names of successful students were entered on the rating sheets provided.

10. Teachers rated the successful students according to their judgment of the student's ability to adjust to the job environment.

11. Teachers telephoned their liaison technician and reported the number of successful students.

12. All materials were returned to the Civil Service Commission either by mail or by the liaison technician.

Employment

13. Vacancies had been previously determined and tabulated according to geographic area. After teachers called in their results, departmental personnel officers with vacancies in the area near the school were notified and appointments made for them by the teacher for employment interviews with the students who achieved the highest ratings. Over 250 positions were filled in this manner in a 2-week period.

14. On the final day of the program (Saturday, May 18), all eligibles not already appointed were called to the Civil Service Commission offices for placement interviews with representatives of departments with current or anticipated vacancies. All

remaining and many anticipated vacancies were filled with highly qualified eligibles.

The results of the 1957 program exceeded expectations. Every known Typist-Clerk and Stenographer vacancy in the County service was filled. Over 1200 names appeared on our eligible lists. More than 400 appointments were made within the first few weeks of the employment period. Most significant of all, however, is the enthusiastic response of the departments to the program. The results of the 1957 program—compared with those of previous years—are presented in the following chart.

RESULTS

SCHOOL RECRUITMENT PROGRAMS

	1955	1956	1957
Number taking written test	784	1245	3000
Number passing written test	355	606	1416
Number of vacancies to be filled by July 1	159	225	300
Number appointed by July 1			
Typist-Clerk	110	119	200
Stenographer	36	55	100
Total	146	174	300
Number of County departments making appointments	23	27	35
Number of participating schools	25	31	85
Number of test administrations by Civil Service	13	32	5

Orientation of the New Employees

Securing and placing the new graduate on the job was just the first part of the story. Another important aspect of the program was to keep the newly employed students as satisfied, efficient workers. Letters of wel-

come, with orientation materials, were sent to each new appointee soon after the appointments were made. Departmental policies and procedures were explained in orientation sessions conducted within each department.

To aid in this part of the program, the Employee Development Division of the Civil Service Commission planned and conducted a series of 1-day institutes. Over a period of 2 weeks, small groups of newly appointed Typist-Clerks and Stenographers were brought to a central location for a 1-day orientation program. The program consisted of lectures, discussions, and films on the County and its government, its history, management, organization, and services. Information regarding personnel practices, payroll matters, promotional opportunities, telephone usage, and office procedures was included.

Conclusion

The schools, the students, the departments, and the Civil Service Department were all pleased with the results of the 1957 program. These results may be attributed to two fundamental factors: an awareness and concern for the personnel needs and a willingness and ability to establish a program and procedures to insure satisfying those needs. The procedures and techniques utilized in the 1957 program proved satisfactory for that time under conditions then existing. At another time and with different conditions other procedures will be needed. The fundamental approach based on needs, however, will not be changed. The application of this concept to personnel problems has been beneficial in the past. It is firmly believed it will continue to produce good results in the future.

To Be or Not To Be—Independent

(Editorial continued from page 174)

sponsible for bringing into being the dream of taking spoils out of public office.

Opinions Differ Sharply

There are sharp differences of opinion among members of this Association and other competent authorities in public administration as to whether, now or in the future, the personnel function should be wholly independent of management; partially independent; or actually shared by an independent watchdog agency and an operating personnel department in the executive branch. William W. Shaw, currently president of the Public Personnel Association, presented the case for the independent commission in the July, 1953, issue of this *Review*. As a personnel practitioner and also a professor of political science at Tulane University, Mr. Shaw believes individual rights of employees will best be served through an independent on-the-scene watchdog of executive action; a set of procedures and policies with which operating officials must comply serve as a check on their unfettered judgment. He declares that . . . "an independent civil service commission can do much to provide a bureaucracy with the climate in which it can apply the rule of law when excesses of executive power may be contemplated."

A contrary view on this controversial subject comes from Wallace S. Sayre, professor of public administration at Columbia University, and himself a former civil service commissioner in New York City as well as a Washington official. In the March-April, 1954, issue of *Good Government*, the organ of the National Civil Service League, Mr. Sayre states: "In the traditional civil service system you have a plan which can protect the employee and the public service against certain things which we do not want to happen, but not a system which will produce a positive personnel program. . . . The judgment of most people is that we will not make any further progress with the kind of

personnel system we have had in the past; that we are likely to get less patronage under the principle of executive responsibility (for personnel) than under the present system."

Above you have opposing views about how the personnel function should be organized. They give vitality to the question posed in the first paragraph of this editorial, namely, should the civil service system be based upon the principle of an independent civil service or personnel agency?

Several other questions flow from this basic one. Is there a single best way to organize the personnel function in public business? Under what circumstances should or could one type of organization operate more effectively than another? What evidence and experience do we have to guide us in making a determination about how to organize the personnel function in modern-day governments?

Diversity Is Great

Let us examine some of the considerations that bear upon these knotty questions. It seems to me that one basic point deserves mention at the outset: If public personnel administration is viewed broadly there is a great diversity in the present manner of organizing the personnel function. Indeed the diversity is so sharp that one has difficulty in determining precisely what the prevailing practice is, unless it is simply diverse.

In terms of numbers there are probably more independent agencies than any other single type. Throughout local and state governments the pattern of independence prevails.

Still there are many hundreds of public agencies in which the personnel function has been taken over by, and made part of, management. This situation exists in most public school personnel departments, in most public college and university personnel departments, and in many independent agencies and authorities such as the Port of New York Authority, and in many hospitals and institutions.

Another important evidence of the goal of integrating personnel appears in the philosophy of city managers, who, by and large, probably prefer to manage their own personnel departments rather than to complicate their daily operations by having to work with or through an independent personnel agency. Since there are now more than 1,500 council-manager governments in this country, the viewpoint of city managers must be reckoned with.

A second consideration: To date, no one has developed a technique which will objectively evaluate the effectiveness of various types of personnel organization. Such an evaluation involves agreement on the value system inherent in a personnel organization. Is its chief value the "good government, spare the spoils concept"? Is it efficiency and economy? Is it service to management? Is it protection of employees, the public, or elected officials? Is it balancing the interests of the public, the present and prospective employee, and administrative officials (either elected or appointed)? Is it serving the interests of special groups such as veterans, minorities, or professions? Or is the chief value a combination of one or more of these? Whatever be the answer to such questions I doubt that the advantages of one or another form of personnel organization can be weighed accurately without giving thought to what should be achieved through a personnel system.

Which Functions Best?

Actually there has been much talk, some writing, but little general agreement on how to measure the effectiveness of a personnel program. A former president of the Public Personnel Association, Albert H. Aronson, has written a thoughtful article which appears in the May-June issue of *Personnel Administration*, under the title of "Evaluation of Personnel Operations." Little has been done to determine objectively whether one or another type of personnel organization functions best, and, if so, under what circumstances.

A third consideration in getting a balanced view about the independent and/or the integrated type of personnel organization, based on the observation of a number of competent authorities, runs like this:

There is some evidence that the form of organization itself does not necessarily determine whether a program will be effective.

Stated another way, one can cite examples of quite satisfactory programs being carried out by the independent type agencies. In such cases, governing boards and staff members have found ways of achieving the concept of service to operating departments without becoming subservient to the executive branch.

On the other hand, one can cite examples of integrated personnel departments which have not prostituted the merit principle and have not become tainted with the fungus of spoils politics.

A final consideration: Up to this time we have had very little opportunity to determine whether the recently constituted "watchdog" type of agency, working alongside an operating personnel department in the executive branch, will accomplish the objectives of both the proponents of the independent civil service agency and those who espouse the principle of an integrated personnel department. We just have not yet had enough experience with personnel systems such as the one recently inaugurated in the state of Illinois, and the one proposed for the federal government.

Points To Be Considered

Where does all this lead us? It seems to me that the following viewpoints offer an intelligent approach to gaining more understanding about the crucial issue of the independent civil service commission:

1. On the basis of present practice and our experience to date, one cannot categorically say that any single type of organization for the personnel function is *the only right one*.
2. Time, place, and circumstance may well dictate which type of organization will work effectively. For example, in a locality where long-entrenched, spoils-run political machines have grudgingly yielded ground in the face of militant civil service reform, it is naive to mistake their retreat for surrender. In such situations it may take years—even a generation—before the top echelons of the government are staffed with management-minded administrators who put positive emphasis on personnel administration.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Similarly, in some other places, such as a number of small and medium-sized council-manager cities, there is considerable evidence that the degree of sophistication and maturity of voters, public officials, and employees, and well-established local traditions, make it possible for the integrated type of organization to work satisfactorily.

3. In the present state of knowledge, personnel officials and board members who want to take a professional attitude toward their tasks should keep an open mind about desirable means of accomplishing their objectives and also be willing to sponsor new and experimental approaches.

4. Above all, we sorely need to continue the gathering of facts and to analyze the accumulated evidence objectively. For this reason, I believe the PPA Committee on the Organization of the Personnel Function—if it could achieve its purposes—would render a great service to the field of personnel and public management as a whole. When the Committee was appointed, its purposes were described by the President of this Association as follows:

- a. To identify the major types of organization of the personnel function in a central personnel office or agency.
- b. To provide, so far as possible, documentation about experience with organization of the personnel function to indicate how, in

actual practice, various types of organization have worked out.

- c. To evaluate the experience in the public personnel field with different types of personnel organization to determine (1) whether success or failure can be attributed to organizational factions, and (2) the extent to which the political climate, governmental traditions, public attitudes, or other factors make one or another form of organization desirable in a specific type of situation.
- d. To prepare a statement of the advantages or disadvantages of each major type of organization generally or in a specific situation.
- e. To the extent that divergent views are held, to reach agreement if possible as to an adequate statement of such divergent views.

While discussion and study continue, let us not overlook one background fact that casts a long shadow over this whole arena of debate. It is this: The quality and effectiveness of democratic government rests both on law—good law—and on the capacity of the citizenry to select and support candidates for public office who are willing and able to “deliver the goods.” The “goods” to which we refer are in the form of sound, businesslike government operated for the benefit of all the people—not good jobs for the “good” voters.

KENNETH O. WARNER, *Editor*

BARRINGTON ASSOCIATES

INC.

230 Park Avenue, N.Y.C.

Mu 4-0141

Established 1926

Consultation with government in—

- Salary and Classification Studies
- Organization Analysis and Planning
- Records Administration
- Systems and Procedures
- Performance Budgeting

We welcome the opportunity to review your administrative problems with you.

*Member, Association of Consulting
Management Engineers*

EDWARD N. HAY & ASSOCIATES, INC.

*Member, Association of Consulting
Management Engineers*

121 South Broad Street 521 Fifth Ave., Room 1610
Philadelphia 7, Penna. New York 17, New York

- The Guide Chart-Profile Method of Job Evaluation
- Psychological Appraisal of Executives and Key Men
- Organization Reviews

The Guide Chart-Profile Method of Job Evaluation has been very widely used in industry including some of the best-known corporations in America. It has also been used in a number of municipal situations.

Write for brochure and other information.



research and results

edited by Cecil E. Goode

DO-IT-YOURSELF RESEARCH

THE CURRENT "DO-IT-YOURSELF" fad does not apply to personnel research. We do not hesitate to leave that to someone else—to some organization with more staff and money than we, with more time on its hands, and with some Ph.D.'s on its staff. Unfortunately, this passive willingness to let the other fellow do our research is not conducive to getting important research done.

The recent survey of personnel research conducted by the author showed that public personnel jurisdictions are doing very little—practically no—research.¹ Out of the total annual personnel research budget that approaches something like \$20 million, 22 per cent goes for research performed by the federal government, with an insignificant amount by state and local governments. Most of the federal government's personnel research dollar is for military personnel.

Bearing out the statement above that we expect someone else to do our research, 39 per cent is performed by private research institutions and 34 per cent by universities. On the other hand, the federal government pays for the lion's share of this research, 67 per cent. State and local governments pay for a very small fraction, only 4 per cent, and most of this is at state universities.

Extent of Personnel Research by Governmental Agencies

United States Civil Service Commission. The research effort of the U. S. Civil Service Commission is embarrassingly small, considering that it is the personnel authority for the largest force of civilian employees in the country—more than 2 million. A budget of \$135,000 and 20 man-years of effort are provided for this purpose. This small amount

of research is all done by the research staff of the Commission. None of it is contracted out, as is common with the military departments.

The Canadian Civil Service Commission, likewise, performs a very small amount of research, to the extent of \$10,000 a year. The research in both of these programs is confined largely to psychometrics and rating devices.

Federal Departments. The departments of the federal government perform little or no personnel research for their own staffs, with the exception of the military departments' uniformed personnel. The Department of the Air Force is the only executive department reporting a research program for its civilian personnel. This program, at present, has a budget of \$54,000 and a staff of 7 man-years. The Air Force program is concerned predominantly with psychometrics for selection purposes; but, in addition, is doing work on attitude measurement, productivity, and the adjustment of employees to conditions in other countries.

Military Departments. Of course, the greatest amount of research in the federal government is done by the military departments. An even greater amount is contracted to universities and other research organizations. An indication of the magnitude of military personnel research is that the fiscal year 1958 budget of the Army for personnel research is estimated at \$3 million, including the Human Resources Research Office at George Washington University. The expenditure of the Air Force for personnel research is probably much greater—if the Rand Corporation is included, which works almost entirely for the Air Force.

Military personnel research is in all areas.

¹ *Personnel Research Frontiers*, Public Personnel Association, Chicago, 1958, 177 pp.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

A large segment of effort goes into the development of psychometric instruments, but, in addition, it is concerned with improving training techniques and finding out what motivates people to do a good job.

State Governments. The state governments are doing very little personnel research. In fact, only four states reported any programs at all—Michigan, New Jersey, New York, and Kansas. The Michigan Civil Service Commission reports a research budget of \$52,400. They are fortunate in that 7 per cent of their budget is routinely allocated to research. Most of their effort is the development and improvement of examining and rating processes. The budget for New Jersey was reported as \$24,000.

Local Governments. Personnel research in municipal and county governments is practically nonexistent. Only two jurisdictions reported a personnel research budget—Detroit Civil Service Commission, with a budget of \$15,000, and one municipal utility district, with only one-sixth of a man-year.

Business Is Becoming Interested

Business organizations are not doing much personnel research, either, but they are becoming aware that social progress in general and the effectiveness of the work force in particular must keep pace with science and technological progress, even though at best it will be several paces behind.

Some of the largest corporations in the country are embarking on scientific personnel research programs. The General Electric Company supports such a program with an annual budget of \$400,000. A large portion of this budget is used in contracting for research by such organizations as the Survey Research Center at the University of Michigan, the Bureau of Applied Social Research at Columbia University, the American Institute for Research, and the Educational Testing Service.

Some company spokesmen indicated that they are finding it desirable to do more of their own research so as to meet real and immediate organizational problems. Some of them are raiding the university and other research organizations for their research personnel.

New Research Techniques Emerging

Most selection tests and rating devices must be developed to fit the actual conditions and needs of the organization that will use them. These are readily seen as a proper research function of the using organization, even though relatively few agencies actually conduct research in connection with them. Too often they proceed to develop and use psychometric devices without any thought of whether they actually do what they are supposed to do; or they buy ready-made tests without attempting to find out whether they meet the specific purposes for which bought. Very little, even, of this research is done by public personnel agencies; and they do practically no fundamental research.

There is emerging a technique developed by such social science organizations as the Institute for Social Research at the University of Michigan which involves actual experiments with "live" organizations as contrasted with the usual surveys or observations. Recent years have seen an important growth in controlled field experimentation in which work groups, departments, or entire organizations are subjected to purposeful change with measurement of results. This development reflects a needed transition from the use of college sophomores as research subjects to the use of "real life" organizational units to solve actual problems and to make improvements that can be tested. Public personnel organizations can and should participate in research of this type. By its nature, this research uses actual people and organizations as its laboratory.

What Personnel Agencies Can Do

Public personnel organizations, federal, state, local, and international, can do more personnel research than the paltry amount they now do. They don't necessarily need a well-heeled or highly skilled research staff. Research skill can be used on a co-operative basis from other organizations; and with a little skillful planning, considerable research can be done by existing personnel staffs. Some things a personnel organization can do are:

1. It can organize its own research staff—

the size depending on the research program outlined and the resources that can be made available for this purpose.

2. It can pool its modest resources with one or more organizations to accomplish mutually planned research programs. The Public Personnel Association might well serve as a focal point for this type of program. Research projects can be turned over to an outside organization supported by the co-operating personnel agencies; and each agency can proceed with agreed-upon segments to be merged later with the results of research done by the other co-operating organizations.

3. One or more agencies can engage such

research organizations as the Bureau of Governmental Research or the Industrial Relations Institute of the state university to carry out needed research projects.

4. Some very inexpensive research can be obtained easily by cooperating with graduate departments of nearby universities so that graduate students can use research problems and material of the personnel agency as part of the requirement for advanced degrees.

5. The least that can be done is to designate various staff members to keep informed on research in specific areas and to brief each other so that research that has been carried on elsewhere can be applied locally.

How To Teach Adults . . .

A training program for adults must have an adult approach. The process of aging alone develops various natural barriers to learning and, hence, hurdles to teaching or training. Let's briefly examine some adult characteristics that affect training techniques.

An adult has acquired experience. The adult has been exposed to varying amounts of formal education, and, due to advances in communications such as newspapers, radio, and television, the adult is worldly wise. He has acquired a certain amount of status and security on his job and in his community. He has learned to conform, but resents regimentation.

It may generally be assumed that an adult is more interested in protecting his "status quo" than in learning. Thus, an adult training group will consist of those who are resentful and consider training a waste of time, those who accept it as part of the routine or "all in a day's work," and a few who will consider it an opportunity for self-development. The leader's job is to find the key to each individual and to make the training a meaningful experience.

An adult is more prone to sensory impairments. Hearing, sight, and coordination decrease with age.

The adult may be expected to have lost some of his mental curiosity, his mental appetite. He is no longer confident of his ability to learn.

The adult is more sensitive to physical comforts or discomforts.

An adult prefers activities where he competes with himself rather than with a group. In competition the adult has "face" and is sensitive about "loss of face," defensive about ideas, suggestions, his work, etc.

The average adult is impatient to learn what he needs, and resents delays, learning basics, and histrionics. His impatience to learn is related to the fact that other distractions compete for his time, concentration, and energy.

In a training program involving adults, attention to the following will aid greatly in overcoming potential obstacles: Create desire to learn; safeguard trainee's status and ego; encourage participation; do not assume knowledge; avoid overloading the schedule; and seek a universal speech level (find the comfortable verbal level between technical jargon and patronizing simplification).—*Training Newsletter*, Pennsylvania Department of Welfare, March, 1958.



around the personnel world

● LATIN AMERICA

Civil Service and the National Psyche.

What is now happening in this young man's country? Something very curious is taking place: they are seriously considering the possibility of establishing a civil service system.

.....

Latin Americans themselves are wont to say that the concept of civil service is hardly harmonious with the traditions and habits of their peoples. There is no doubt that the Latin American environment is very different from that of the United States and England. In contemplating a reform of such sweeping breadth as civil service, it is indispensable to take into account the national psychology, for the latter is a powerful factor. More than 30 years ago, the well-known Spanish author, Salvador de Madariaga, wrote an excellent book, *Englishmen, Frenchmen and Spaniards*, in which he compares the national psychology of these three countries. Although this book was published in 1925, in my opinion it is still the best comparative study of its kind that has been written. . . .

Family Is First

According to De Madariaga, the English are models of self-control; they subordinate their personal interests to the good of the community. From a very early age, English youth is trained in the desirability of serving the public and in the art of co-operation. Accordingly, civil service in that country is nothing more than the reflection of the disciplined character of the people.

With the Spaniards, the picture is quite different. Above all, asserts the great author, they are very individualistic and approach problems in a different way than do the English.

To the Spaniards, first in importance is the family; next, one's friends; after that, the Church; and, finally, the State. In other words, the collectivity is much less important to him. Far from training himself in the art of co-operation and in the virtues of serving the public, according to this analysis the Spaniard puts his "yo" (own desires) ahead of the interests of the State. His attachment to his family and friends logically leads to nepotism and to doing things on a personal basis in the government.

Will Collective Discipline Work?

In citing De Madariaga's views, I don't pretend to say that no difference exists between the psychology of Spaniards and of Latin Americans. We know that certain differences of this type in part provoked the Wars of Independence, and I know very well that the Latin American thinks of himself as very different in certain respects. Nevertheless, the Spanish tradition is still very strong, which is a phenomenon as natural as it is healthy.

In his attitude towards the State, the average Latin American is quite similar to the Spaniard. . . .

Shall we conclude that civil service is incompatible with the character of Latin America? No, because De Madariaga himself does not think this with respect to Spaniards. All he says is that collective discipline turns out to be more difficult for people with such individualistic tendencies; impossible, not by any means. (Adapted from "Personnel Administration in Latin America," by Felix A. Nigro in *Personnel Administration*, November-December, 1957.)

● FRANCE

Recruiting by Competition for the French Civil Service.

It is not always easy to distinguish between the two methods of recruiting for the French Civil Service, by pass or competitive examinations. The point is, however, important in a number of legal circumstances. For instance, all those who have taken part in a competition are entitled to appeal against the results, but only those who have failed may do so in the case of a pass examination.

.....

If a candidate has been wrongly admitted to a competitive examination, and has been consequently placed on the roll of prospective appointees, the examination must be declared null and void, unless the authorities have rectified their error, even while the examination is in progress. If this has not been done, all the ensuing appointments are irregular. No changes made in the required qualifications, after the list of candidates has been closed, are valid.

.....

The regulations on the conduct of competitive examinations vary from case to case. On this subject, the Conseil d'Etat has adopted the rule of considering whether any irregularity is substantive and deciding accordingly, the criterion being whether the result of the competition might have been different. The fact that the candidates failed to protest, or even consented, at the time, does not vindicate an irregularity. Instances of these are non-attendance of the chairman of the board; arbitrary limitation by the examiners, before the examination opens, of the number of successful candidates; and calling in outside persons to mark the papers.

Annulment of Examinations

Every competitive examination must be considered as a unit, and failure to complete it cancels the entire procedure.

Irregularities are sanctioned by the annulment of the examination and the resulting appointments, and possibly by administrative action against the candidates or other persons who may be at fault.

.....

The only exception to the general rule by which an irregular examination must be annulled and the entire procedure begun anew occurs when a candidate should not have been admitted to the examination. It may be sufficient to strike him off the list, letting the following candidates all go up one step. But this is allowable only if the regulations for that particular examination have not laid down a fixed ratio between the number of vacancies, e.g. a roll of two or three candidates per vacancy.

The Right of Appeal

When an annulled competitive examination leads to a candidate not being appointed or promoted, and the annulment is later rescinded, the unsuccessful candidate must be reinstated, and granted all the advantages of seniority, further promotion, etc., which he would have normally acquired if the original decision had been allowed to stand. The Conseil d'Etat is, however, averse to recognising claims for compensation.

Speaking generally, all candidates, but only they, may appeal against the examiners' decisions. In a limited number of cases, appeal may be lodged only by candidates who would personally be affected by the result of the appeal. The judge who hears an appeal may only rule on the legality of the decision: he may not review the candidates' professional qualifications.

Successful candidates are suitable for appointment, but not entitled to it. Appointments must be made in the order of the successive examinations and, within each, in the order of the final ranking. Conversely, the candidate must be willing to accept appointment wherever he may be posted.

Criticism of the System

Criticism has been levelled against various aspects of competitive examination, especially under the Third Republic. Jèze wrote that the academic requirements for entrance into the Civil Service were too high, and that the selection of the examiners left much to be desired. Chalandon commented unfavourably on the fact that no less than 22 competitive State examinations were open every year to holders of a university entrance degree (*bacheliers*) and 53 to holders of a final degree (*licenciés*). Some of these 75 examinations were twice-yearly events, and all occurred at variable times. Thus, candidates were never fully informed about career opportunities. The position has been somewhat improved since the establishment of the Ecole Nationale d'Administration. (Excerpts from an article by Marcel Waline, professor of Public Law at the University of Paris, in the *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, No. 3, 1957.)

● YUGOSLAVIA

Annual Round Table Discussion on Rating.

The consensus of the meeting was that a rating system should be simple. After having tried complicated systems, on the United States pattern, with extreme codification and subdivisions, the general trend is towards less involved systems, which show up, at least as well, the effective value of the employees rated.

.....

The conclusion to be drawn from the debate is, first of all, that no rating system can possibly be successful, i.e. useful, unless it is generally approved, especially by the persons concerned and their trade unions and its advantages are effective. In fact, the best results of rating, by the simplest methods, are found where personal contact exists between supervisors and their immediate assistants, and where the civil service establishment is small and homogeneous.

Eight Factors to Consider

The following factual remarks were added to the general report:

- (1) Rating, as applied to promotion, should be combined with examinations, showing the knowledge and ability of the employees concerned, and with personality tests.
- (2) The efforts made by the employees to improve their standards should be taken into account.
- (3) Rating procedures should form the subject of detailed regulations drawn up, if pos-

- sible, in agreement with personnel representatives. The regulations should list the rating factors, as well as the terms in which rating should be formulated.
- (4) In practice, the method to be preferred would appear to be a combination of quantitative marks and qualitative appraisal. The abstract character of marks implies some major drawbacks which preclude its exclusive use. For instance, it does not show what defects the employees should strive to correct, and it makes review difficult where the facts to which the rating refers are inaccurate.
 - (5) Rating should take place at fixed intervals, and not only on the occasion of promotions. Yearly rating reports are not sufficient, as employees should be informed at closer intervals of their supervisors' appraisal of their work, so that errors may be remedied at once. Similarly, employees should be commended and encouraged for good work at the time it is performed.
 - (6) The tendency of some supervisors to appraise their subordinates too favourably, and consequently gloss over their defects, should be thoroughly discouraged. This practice is the result of the rule, in many countries, that the supervisor's report must be shown to the employee concerned. The Turkish delegate alone informed the meeting that in his country non-communication of the reports was strictly enforced. A method utilized in some countries appears to give satisfaction in this respect: unfavorable reports only are shown to the employee. Supervisors thus are freed from the temptation to stress their employees' good points unduly, while the latter still have the opportunity of being informed of their weak points and of remedying them and are not precluded from appealing against possible injustice.
 - (7) Interviews can play a not inconsiderable part as a factor of fair appraisal and of greater chances of promotion. This method is extensively used in the United Kingdom.
 - (8) In order to remedy idiosyncrasies or erroneous standards of appraisal, it may be found useful to submit ratings by the immediate supervisors for review to a senior official, who assumes responsibility. This is a standard practice in the United Kingdom, where the Promotion Board, whose decision is final, may also, and in practice often does, interview candidates for promotion, and thus reaches conclusions which modify or supersede the original reports.

Should the Whole Man Be Ignored?

One question was debated without any agreement being reached: Should the man be rated or, exclusively, the official? The French speakers, in particular, advocated the limitation of rating to the employee's behaviour as an official, in order to make the appraisal more objective, by excluding any consideration of his private life, and religious or philosophical opinions, insofar as activity in these fields did not influence the performance of his professional duties.

U.S.A. and U.S.S.R. say "Nyet!"

It was noted with interest that the United States and USSR delegates, Mr. William F. Larsen and Mrs. T. A. Yampolskaya, both held the opposite view. They were supported by the Portuguese delegate in their opinion that it was not feasible to differentiate strictly between the behavior of an individual in his private and his official capacities. The United States delegate pointed out that to insist officially upon such an artificial distinction would mean that certain activities contrary to the security of the State, and subversive opinions, might be protected or, at least, allowed immunity. (Part of report from 1957 Annual Round Table of the International Institute of Administrative Sciences held at Opatija, Yugoslavia. The session was attended by 160 participants representing 33 countries or international organizations.)

● ITALY

Training and Preparation of Members of the Police Force

The wide range and delicate nature of the tasks entrusted to the police administration, and, more especially, the constabulary and special branches, require, necessarily, personnel with particular physical and moral qualifications and specific technical training.

The sphere of activity of the police services, as set out in Article I of the Public Security Regulations in force today, is extremely wide and, besides the basic duties of preserving law and order, the safeguarding of public and private property, and guaranteeing the observance of laws and regulations, is also responsible for tasks connected with the assistance and protection of the civilian population, within the framework of a wide preventive and rescue service, which must be ready to meet all emergencies that occur, as well as the suppression of crime.

Careful Selection, Careful Training

Every situation which arises involving danger, need, or emergency, disturbing the normal run of community life, requires the intervention of the police: this intervention at times goes unrecognized, at times is misunderstood, but deserves to be seen in the true perspective of its social utility.

The first necessity, if the police are to carry out their tasks efficiently, is that the Force shall be fully staffed, and the police administration's first concern is the careful selection of candidates, so that each member is endowed with the required physical and moral qualifications.

The police staff consists of *civilian staff*, which includes officials, police employees, and office employees, and of *military personnel*, or members of the police Guards, comprising officers, non-commissioned officers, and guards. Once the selection is completed, the administration is faced with the no less serious problem of the training of the new forces, whether civilian or military, required for police work in the new democratic State.

Putting Theory Into Practice

In the first place, the members must be instilled with the sense of their calling, and for this it was necessary to reorganize (and rebuild) the schools destroyed in the war; to enable the civil and military personnel (officials and officers) to see how, after passing the competitive examinations for admission to the permanent staff, the juridical subjects they had studied in theory could be applied in practice to the tasks they were to undertake. It was necessary to ensure that all the personnel, whether officials, officers, non-commissioned officers or guards, had the necessary technical knowledge for the performance of their duties which require, in fact, some technical training.

These highly responsible ends have been achieved by means of constant activity, which began immediately after the end of the war, to improve the already existing study centres, to open new ones to cope with the more and more specific needs to be met, and to improve syllabuses and teaching methods.

.....

Particular mention should be made of the valuable work done by the *Psychotechnic Centre* which was founded in May, 1952, as a department of the School for Police Officers and Non-Commissioned Officers. The Centre applies the new science of psychotechnics, with the most modern scientific equipment, to appraise the suitability of members of the police force for their work and to indicate the rational employment for each member in the various service sectors, according to his natural aptitudes. (From *Italian Affairs*, November, 1957.)

● ISRAEL

The Training of Senior Civil Servants.

The training of Israeli senior civil servants is being carried out through both University and Government training schemes.

The University training scheme was inaugurated in the academic year 1956/1957 with the introduction of a two-year course in Public Administration at the Eliezer Kaplan School of Economics and Social Sciences of the Hebrew University at Jerusalem.

UN Experts Help Plan Curriculum

The curriculum was planned by the Kaplan School in co-operation with the Civil Service Commission and with the assistance of UN experts. The Lectures comprise eight hours a week during a two-year period. The compulsory subjects are: Fundamentals of Public Administration; the Regime of the State of Israel; Public Law; Introduction to Organization and Methods; Personnel Management or Fiscal Administration and Accounting; Introduction to Economics or Introduction to Statistics.

The optional subjects include: the History of Public Administration; Government Policy and National Economics; Local Government and Administration. In addition to eight lessons a week in class, every student is required to study in his free time at least an equal period at home.

Students Outside Service May Attend

Civil servants with secondary education, and students who are not civil servants but possess a bachelor's degree, have been admitted to this course. Civil servants were nominated by the Civil Service Commission and were approved by a joint committee of representatives of the Kaplan School and the Commission. They are between 27 and 45 years of age and belong to the senior levels of the service. Students who successfully complete the course will receive an appropriate certificate. The number of civil servants in the class during the first semester was eighteen. The combination of experienced civil servants with young students from outside the Service has proved successful.

The Government continues seminars for senior officials on specific problems of administration; the courses on Law and Administration established several years ago continue to be held.

Two Weeks in the Country

In June, 1957, the Civil Service Commission opened a two-weeks' course on the Principles of Administration for senior civil servants concentrating 60 officials of all ministries in quiet rural surroundings for lectures and group discussions on the following subjects: the Nature of Administration; Central Administrative Institutions; Drafting Government Policies; the Budget as an Instrument of Planning; the Basic Principles and Basic Problems of Organization; and Public Personnel Management. The course was divided into two periods of six days each separated by an interval of one month. The lecturers and discussion leaders were teachers of the Hebrew University and senior civil servants. (From *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, No. 3, 1957.)

● THE PHILIPPINES

Personnel Officers' First National Conference.

The first national conference of the recently organized Personnel Officers Association of the Philippines was held in Manila on March 18-20, 1958. Philippine government officers and employees were authorized to attend on official time.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Speeches and symposiums had as their subject matter "Better Personnel Administration and Stronger Merit System," "The Role of Public Opinion in Strengthening the Merit System," and "Legislation and the Merit System." Workshop groups discussed "Staffing the Personnel Office," "Selling Your Personnel Program," "The Complementary Role of the Central Personnel Agency and the Line Agencies," "Creating an Inter-Agency Personnel Council," "Vitalizing the Merit System," and "Problems in Philippine Public Personnel Administration."

President Vicente Sinco, Senator Francisco Rodrigo, and Congressman Vicente Peralta were among the participants in one of the symposium-forums. (From information sent in by MacDonald Salter, Public Administration Advisor for Europe and Far East.)

PPA Tests Pay Their Way!

IT PAYS to use a PPA Ready-to-Use Test to assist you in selecting any of the following employees:

- Policemen • Office Workers • Truck Drivers
- Firefighters • Engineering Aides

PPA also publishes a Classification Test for use in selecting employees for other public service jobs where ability to learn to do the job is required.

Write NOW to the Public Personnel Association for a descriptive folder on any or all of these tests that will save you TIME and MONEY!

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION
1313 East 60th Street Chicago 37, Illinois

IMPORTANT QUESTIONS of personnel policy and practice seldom yield "cut-and-dried" answers. The editors have posed the question below to several persons representing different points of view to give readers guidelines in formulating their own policies.

THE QUESTION

"In drafting personnel legislation, what are the pertinent factors to be considered in deciding whether the position of personnel director should or should not be in the classified service?"

Says LYMAN H. COZAD . . .

City Manager, Colton, California.

I suggest the following pertinent factors:

1. To whom does the personnel director report?
2. Is this person or body partisan or non-partisan?
3. Is this person or body professional or political?
4. What are the discharge provisions of the classified service?
 - a. Who hears appeals?
 - b. Can this body reverse a discharge by its own action?
 - c. If it only recommends, to whom does it recommend?
5. What is the status of the other department heads served?
6. Is "civil service" new or traditional?

The personnel director needs statutory protection most where he reports to a legislative body. The need is greater when this is a partisan body, but nearly as great when it is nonpartisan. Either legislative body's objectives in connection with personnel actions may vary from those of a professional director.

Where the personnel director reports to a chief executive, protection is less needed. In this category, the need for classified status is

greater if that executive is political. Should a personnel director be in the classified service if he reports to a professional administrator, such as a city manager? This question requires answers to further questions.

Next to be considered are regulations governing discharges. If we have a classified service, it can be assumed that there are such provisions. Normally, there would be rights of appeal. To whom are these appeals directed? There is a difference between a hearing conducted by a nonpartisan body charged with the maintenance of a merit system and a hearing by a political body.

The next question concerns the authority of this body to reverse an administrator's action. With appeal boards, we have the distinction between reversal on the board's own authority and the authority to recommend reversal or modification. Finally, we face the question as to whether a recommendation is to the chief executive, himself, or to the legislative body for whom he works.

Using city managers as examples, the manager is in one position if he receives a recommendation concerning a discharge. He is in a weaker position if the body he works for receives recommendations both from an appeal board and from him. He is in an impossible position if the appeal board can order a reinstatement without the approval of the legislative body.

Some administrators object to either of the latter systems. I see no objection to hav-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

ing to explain a discharge to the legislature, which has before it a recommendation of an appeal board. The entire relationship of the legislature and the manager is involved. If the manager is over-ruled, he must decide whether he can remain as an effective part of the council-manager team.

Good administrators do not object to being required to follow proper procedures in discharges, including prior warnings, specific reasons, and, perhaps, a review upon appeal by the highest authority, the legislature. They will, however, insist upon the right to make their own recommendations to that legislative body. This would be useless if final authority lay with an independent board.

The status of the other department heads whom the personnel director assists is also important. If none of them were in the classified service, his ability to work closely with them might be weakened if he were the only one so protected. The reverse situation is even more ridiculous.

It would also seem true that this type of protection is more useful during the installation and early phases of the merit system.

Certainly the personnel director should be selected in accordance with merit system provisions. An orderly removal procedure is proper so long as it does not reduce an administrator's authority below his responsibility.

Says FRANK P. ZEIDLER . . .

Mayor, City of Milwaukee.

Some of the factors to be considered in drafting personnel legislation to give the personnel director civil service status are these:

1. Protection of the personnel director from the political spoils system. Civil service directors ought to be protected from the spoils system and should be given civil service status.
2. Insuring that the personnel director doesn't build up a spoils system or a controlled hierarchy himself by stepping into a vacuum left by removal of political controls. Some civil service directors who are very adept at the game make a shambles of civil service rules by interpreting them as they please to advance their

friends and sycophants and to punish those whom they dislike. A politician would be foolish if he were to give up control over hiring and firing public employees only to have a civil service director assume the same role of rewarding friends and punishing enemies. This unfortunately is not too rare in public service.

3. Setting a publicly appointed board over the civil service director to set the policy in the public interest and making sure the director doesn't play favorites and that he does carry out his assignment.

4. Having all board meetings open to the public so that all decisions are publicly known.

5. Providing statutory methods for removing incompetent personnel directors.

6. Providing proper channels for administrative officials and elected officials to exchange views so that feuding between them is not carried on and so that the personnel director does not frustrate policies which he doesn't want, even though they are sound and workable.

7. Providing the proper method of selecting a personnel director in which the factors of ability, general intelligence, and integrity are given weight along with administrative experience. Experience and length of service are scarcely enough for filling the top positions in personnel.

Says I. J. BROWDER . . .

Superintendent of Schools, Gadsden, Alabama, and formerly Personnel Director, State of Alabama.

The main point for consideration in making this determination is the character of the position to be filled. Is the incumbent to be a policy-making official? Or is he to be employed by a board or commission that actually exercises sovereign power, i.e., in formation of policy?

If the personnel director is employed by a policy-making body to administer a program, and in actuality his job is purely administrative, it seems that he should have security in his position and should not be subject to the cross-winds of politics. How-

ever, this arrangement may result in a somewhat weakened office. The director's job, if in the classified service, would undoubtedly have indicated lines of promotion from that of principal personnel technician and very probably from other positions requiring the same or similar qualifications. The very finest technician may not be the type of individual that would make a successful director.

The successful personnel director must be a versatile individual. First, he must have a thorough understanding of the basic philosophy of a sound personnel program. He must understand and fully appreciate the technical aspects of the program, although he need not be a practitioner in one of the fields. He must have an abundance of commonsense to protect him from sentimentality on the one hand and cold-blooded adherence to the tenets of administrative efficiency on the other. He must possess those qualities of personality that will invite the confidence and friendship of both administrators and employees.

If the position of personnel director is to be strong, he will necessarily have some part in policymaking. In this case, it is generally conceded that his position should be subject to some extent to shifts by mandate of the people. If, in planning legislation to provide for a personnel program, this second concept prevails, provision should be made for somewhat higher compensation to offset the disadvantages of lack of job security. Vacancies would more likely be filled through differential recruitment. This would not mean, however, that very comprehensive examinations could not be used, nor that those desiring promotions would not be considered. It would mean, rather, that examinations should be designed to evaluate the over-all suitability for the job, as set out above.

Says O. W. CAMPBELL . . .

County Manager, Dade County, Florida.

The position of personnel director is one of the most critical and sensitive posts in any organization, and particularly so in government. Upon him, in large part, rests the quality, morale, and productiveness of the

entire agency. Consequently, the rules surrounding his selection and appointment are especially significant.

No system or formalized procedure can guarantee the selection of the best available person for the job. This is abundantly demonstrated in many civil service recruitment procedures which are controlled by stilted, inflexible methods seeming by design to retard and obstruct rather than assist in getting the best possible public employees. If inclusion in the classified service involves any restrictive, or happenstance elements, the position of personnel director should be excluded.

The same is true in those circumstances where the classified service is characterized by extraordinary protective features. The "civil service machine," developed and dominated by an ambitious personnel executive, too frequently is found under such a pattern.

Some method should be provided, however, to assure as precisely as possible the impartial seeking out and employment of an able, professional, experienced person for the job. Protection should also be set up to prevent political interference and manipulation. At the same time, the personnel director must be established as an active, responsive, participating part of the organization's management structure. If the governmental organization is politically oriented and confuses legislative and administrative responsibilities at the executive level, the personnel director should probably be included in the classified service, or preferably be given a special status as to selection and tenure. If the organization is built around professional leadership, divorced of political and legislative responsibilities, the personnel director should have a staff or cabinet status directly responsible to the chief executive.

Modern personnel systems are tending to be sufficiently flexible, realistic, and technically skilled, however, so that the question of inclusion or exclusion is all but moot. Similarly, as governmental agencies clarify political and technical function and purpose, and create structure accordingly, the issue of an independent civil service versus the political machine becomes more and more academic. Legalistic controls and restrictions are giving way in public service to more concern with training, safety education,

proper salary and benefit programs, and a positive interest in morale and motivation much as private industry has converted from the negative boss-worker relationship toward a worker participation approach.

Another factor that was introduced during the war and has tended to persist is the relative scarcity of skilled personnel and their ability to find jobs of their liking almost at will. This has compelled not only the utilization of manpower as efficiently as possible, but also has changed significantly the attitude toward and methods of recruitment. Any legislation relating to public personnel administration should recognize these facts and be directed toward flexibility and a positive approach rather than concern itself with doubtful detail or precise formula.

Says JOHN W. MACY, JR. . . .

Executive Vice President, Wesleyan University, Middletown, Connecticut; formerly Executive Director, U.S. Civil Service Commission.

I have very firm and decided views on this question. In my judgment, the position of personnel director should be initially established and continually maintained in the classified service.

When a new agency or program is created by legislative action in response to a public need, the creating statute should provide as much administrative flexibility for the responsible executive directing the program as public opinion will permit. It may appear to be an abridgement of such administrative discretion to prescribe that the personnel director be appointed through merit processes. It is my conviction, however, that the proper workings of a merit system can provide warranted discretion of selection within the framework of competitive examination.

The appointing executive should be permitted to consider eligible candidates in personnel career systems operating within merit standards. Likewise, if wide competition is called for, including persons outside of the governmental jurisdiction, this executive should be permitted to participate significantly in the development of examination specifications, recruiting procedures, and rating techniques.

This merit entry to a career personnel staff position assures to the administrator the necessary expertise and continuity for the successful staffing of the new program. Such an appointment under the classified service produces an immediate drive toward the creation of a career staff within the new organization. The image of the organization possessed by the general public will be formed in merit terms and will enhance the employment prestige of the enterprise.

The objective of continuity is particularly important in a new program where the executive leadership may be changing or expendable as the provisions of the statute become a reality through the struggles of administrative action. The career personnel director serving in a nonpartisan professional capacity can materially assist in the development of a career work force which may competently respond to shifting policy direction.

The only situation which I can imagine, out of my experience, where the personnel director might be established as an exempted position would be in the instance where the newly enacted program was clearly created to serve for a temporary or emergency period. If a specific terminal date is written into the law to assure that the governmental functions authorized do not continue indefinitely, there is serious question as to whether a program of such a limited duration can be or should be staffed with personnel in the classified service. This question could be raised with special validity in connection with the personnel director's position. An exception from the classified service might well be justified in such a situation for the protection of the career service as well as for rapid action in filling the position and responsiveness to the program director.

Even in the creation of agencies with such a short existence, the demand for experience and knowledge in governmental practices and relationships has led to the assignment of career personnel, under merit system provisions, to personnel director positions. Such emergency agencies in the federal government during the past 25 years have been initially staffed and organized by career personnel directors, detailed on a loan basis and for a temporary period from old-line organizations to the new agency. A prime example

of such a practice is the career of Francis Brassor, who retired March 31, 1958, from the U.S. Civil Service Commission, but who had served with more than a half a dozen different agencies of an emergency character during their period of organization and limited life.

In summary, I am unable to justify, except in the instance described immediately above, the exception of *any* personnel director position from the classified service. Exceptions of this kind may be rationalized in terms of service to executive responsibility, closer relationship to the political executive, or need for speedy action; but rationalization does not serve the public interest and, in the long run, defeats the sound and orderly creation of a competent and long-term career service in the organization.

A personnel director selected and serving within the merit system framework can and will effectively support and respond to the policy leadership in public programs to the betterment of the administration of such programs.

Says HARRY P. PETRIE . . .

Secretary and Chief Examiner, Los Angeles County Civil Service Commission.

It is assumed that at the time a legislative body is faced with this question, other decisions about organizational relationships have already been made. This is the first factor which must be considered, for the organizational pattern may well have controlling influence over the subsequent decision about the placement of the position of Personnel Director.

Generally it is believed that a classified position is indicated if technical competence and administrative ability are of major importance. In contrast, if the public relations and political aspects of the position are of greater significance, exclusion from the classified service may be indicated.

Obviously, in either case we want to select, utilize, and retain the best person available. Placing the position in the classified service generally implies that there must be merit selection through examination. With reasonable requirements and appropriate examining procedures, the merit selection can eliminate much of the chance

from the choice. There are no inherent or unavoidable disadvantages in merit selection. On the other hand, selection with no restriction as to principle or procedure can easily become haphazard and influenced by undesirable pressures.

As the title implies, a personnel director is primarily a director or leader of personnel activities or services. A director or leader must not only know in which direction he should lead, but he must understand, coordinate, and work effectively with the many pressures brought to bear upon him and his organization.

A personnel director is continually under many pressures from many individuals and groups. These pressures are attempting to influence policy and decisions and to move the personnel activities in many different directions. Unless some order, influence, and control are maintained over these pressures, chaos results. The director must be in a position to resist and redirect undesirable pressures and to influence and coordinate desirable pressures in such a way as to move the personnel activities in the proper direction.

What does this have to do with classified vs. unclassified? Using this concept of the personnel director's job, it can be seen that its placement in the classified service or unclassified service will have fundamental influence on the pressure pattern which will likely develop.

In other words, the direction in which the personnel system or program will move will be influenced by the pressure pattern that is encouraged or allowed to develop around the personnel director. After the most desirable direction of movement is decided upon, the most suitable pattern of pressures to encourage this movement should be estimated, and then, on this basis, the decision regarding placement of the personnel director position in the classified or unclassified service may be made.

In any specific case, the decision must depend on a thorough evaluation of the local conditions in relation to the pressure pattern which is likely to develop. In general, however, it appears that placement of the position in the classified service will encourage a favorable pattern of pressure and provide the director with suitable protection to resist undesirable pressures.

the

bookshelf

Constructing Evaluation Instruments. By Edward J. Furst. Longmans, Green and Co., Inc., New York 3, New York, 1958. 334 pp. \$4.75.

Reviewed by

LOYD HUNT

Personnel Officer,

Chicago Civil Service Commission

As is patently indicated by the title, this is a book on constructing evaluation instruments; what is not so patently indicated is that the author, who is a psychologist, has turned out a functional book that is stimulating and authoritative and primarily oriented to the educational situation and the teacher or instructor. Of the approximately half-dozen books written in recent years on the subject of test construction and evaluation, this is one of the best, both in terms of the sophisticated way the author develops and ties together primary concepts in a step-by-step Euclidean manner, and in terms of the obvious contribution to the field; not so much a contribution of new knowledge, as a codification of ideas and principles, tied down to empirical data.

This is not a cookbook text on test construction nor is it one of the cryptic, highly theoretical type of treatise dealing with ideal situations and abstract problems; essentially this is a text on basic problems and fundamentals in constructing evaluation instruments.

The *raison d'être* of the book is elucidated by this observed paradox, to wit: many instructors, teachers, et al., lack a grasp of the basic principles of evaluation and lack the skill necessary to produce a good classroom test notwithstanding the fact that at the same time the fields of evaluation and test construction show a rather high state of development, replete with a substantial body of theoretical and technical literature along with thinking from older and contiguous disciplines. In essence, how to bridge the gap

between this rather cogent need and the potential resources is the prime mover in this book, and, more specifically, the desire to isolate from a variety of techniques and "really fundamental problems" and subject these to intense study. The results of these efforts constitute Part I of the book.

In Part I the author analyzes some of the basic problems met in developing an evaluation technique, i.e., determining what to evaluate and defining goals in terms of behavior, selecting appropriate situations, making a proper record, and summarizing the evidence. The analysis cuts across a variety of techniques, thus emphasizing many widely applicable principles.

In Part II the author comes to grips with the somewhat more pragmatic and discusses the specialized problems of test construction, such as planning technique, writing items to fit specifications, assembly and reproduction, administration and scoring, and analysis and revision.

Dr. Furst is eminently qualified, academically and experientially, to write in this field. After obtaining his doctorate in psychology at the University of Chicago, he served for 7 years as Chief of the Evaluation and Examination Division, Bureau of Psychological Services, University of Michigan. In this capacity he acted as consultant to faculty members on the definition of educational goals, the development and use of tests, the evaluation of instruction, and similar problems. He has also been a member (Chairman, 1954-1956) of the Committee of University Examiners. Since 1956 the author has been a full-time member of the Department of Psychology, University of Idaho.

It is refreshing, and I think propitious, to find a book on this subject, wherein the author is a psychologist, thoroughly grounded in psychological fundamentals. Indubitably there is no magic in the word or title "psychologist," but certainly psychological fundamentals form a very satisfactory foundation upon which to predicate some of the

basic concepts in the book. Some of the otherwise fine books in the area of test construction and evaluation have been weak because the author was not well-grounded in basic and fundamental psychological principles.

Although this book is oriented toward the educational institution it is recommended especially for the beginning technician or test constructor regardless of the area in which he works (academic, industrial, governmental) because of the depth and thoroughness with which the author covers the field and because of the clear, concise, and readable manner in which he writes.

Modular Management and Human Leadership. By Frank Pieper. Methods Press, Minneapolis, Minnesota, 1958. 288 Pages. \$6.50.

Reviewed by

EARL R. CHAMBERS

Personnel Director, Civil Service Commission, St. Louis County, Missouri

It is good to find a balanced book in the field of human relations. So much has been written in this area in the past which leans toward sentimentalism that one could very well lose sight of the real purpose of "work."

This book has been aimed at the working leader, that first-line supervisor on whom we depend so much for leadership. It is both a book and a sort of manual but without the typical manual's formalistic style.

Modular management means simply scientific management or management by measurement. The employee of our day finds himself and his work being measured by others—cost accountants, production men, methods engineers, personnel people. Throughout all these efforts to measure men and their output, how can the employee keep from thinking of himself as a "tool" instead of a person, and what can the supervisor do about it?

The author maintains that management by measurement can be human as well as scientific. A supervisor should not forget that workers produce according to their psychological attitudes, emotions, and needs. Surveys show workers want to be productive, and it is the supervisor's job to provide a climate for accomplishing this. As such, the main task of the supervisor is to help workers "work."

Workers want psychological pay too: all

those things that satisfy the need for recognition, understanding, security, and new experience. For most employees it is the first-line supervisor who passes out the psychological pay.

Now, what about the "lead" in leadership? Should it be authoritarian or democratic, restrictive or permissive? The author feels there are two kinds of lead: "directive" and "creative." In "directive" lead the supervisor tells employees what to do, and in "creative" lead the supervisor helps his employees themselves arrive at what to do.

Actually, the good supervisor will usually use both types of lead. As the author demonstrates, the essence of real leadership is to use that lead appropriate to the situation. There are some situations when the boss must use a "directive" lead in order to get something done. This is certainly true in emergency situations and in cases where only the supervisor has the essential information on which to base a decision, and the worker lacks the background or experience to be of help. Further, some workers simply need "directive" lead for they are much more effective with someone telling them what to do.

Then there are times when a "creative" lead is the best to use. The supervisor will certainly rely on "creative" lead, for example, in finding answers to work problems about which the workers have more direct or different information than he has and also in situations where the worker can add something to the solution of a problem. There are, of course, those workers who must have a lot of "creative" lead to be productive, for too much direction acts as a stumbling block.

The real problem for the supervisor is to get the right balance of lead. The author makes an interesting note by pointing out studies have shown that a constant use of one type of lead may result in worker dissatisfaction.

If a supervisor wishes to know the extent to which his leadership is directive or creative, the author has included a partial list of the many gradations of lead, from the extremely directive to the exceptionally creative. There is also, as an idea to aid the supervisor in his daily task, an explanation of the HOW-TO method of developing and using standard work methods. Inclusion of the HOW-TO method springs from the author's conviction that for training new employees each operation must be broken down into simple learning steps; the super-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

visor should show the worker how to do each operation step by step, and let the worker practice the entire task until he can do it.

A HOW-TO is a standard work method sheet explaining the reason why the worker does the particular task, a list of the basic work steps the employee has to perform, and special information about each of the operations including any cautionary measures which should be taken by the employee. Human relations skills can be taught just as any other skill, the author states, and the human relations steps can be written into the HOW-TO in their proper sequence with the mental or physical steps.

The author gives supervisors a worthwhile reminder. No matter how much the supervisor tries to meet the psychological needs of his employees, he cannot meet them all. Family, social, and other environmental factors affect the work situation, and no matter how well the supervisor does his job of human leadership, he cannot overcome an employee's unsatisfactory personal life and its influence on the employee's job performance.

It is so important in this area of human relations to keep on solid ground. The author has done this. The need of workers for human leadership is fully underscored within a framework of reason. There is an easy style to the book and it is organized in an inviting manner. While there is some repetition in content, this is understandable in a book which serves also as a manual. I can readily see that a book like this would be especially valuable in course work for the working supervisor.

Prolonged Illness—Absenteeism, Summary Report. Leon Werch, Research Director. Research Council for Economic Security, Chicago, Illinois, 1957. 237 pp. \$10.00.

Reviewed by

HARRY ALBERT

*Assistant Personnel Director,
Civil Service Commission of San Francisco*

The Research Council for Economic Security was established in 1945. Its trustees, in the main, represent major concerns in private industry as do also the sponsors of this survey. The director of the council is Gerhard Hirschfield, and the research director is Leon Werch; Mr. Werch was responsible for the direction of the work that resulted in this survey report. Included in the

groups which assisted in securing participation in the project were a number of personnel management associations.

The Research Council for Economic Security starts with the following basic premise: "In its broad and powerful impact the growth of insecurity for the individual has become as significant a problem in our society as was the development of the machine 50 and 100 years ago."

The Council, concerned as it is with the problem of insecurity of the individual, has prepared over 100 publications seeking to contribute "through research and education to a better understanding of the total problem and its many manifestations."

If insecurity of the individual is a problem to be so studied, then the Council believes that the possibility of disability is one of the causes of insecurity which stimulates the largest measure of fear. It was decided to make a study of disability and, for a number of reasons, to begin with employed persons in private nonagricultural industries who were absent for more than four consecutive weeks because of nonoccupational disability. The results of the study, 5 years and \$250,000 later, is the "Summary Report."

The final survey data were based on reports from 145 reporting units, and the average employment converted to a man-year (12-month) basis, represented 193,856 persons. It is the Council's hope that the study will provide information necessary for the development of programs for prevention, treatment, rehabilitation, and for meeting the medical care costs and wage losses.

The major contributions which were anticipated from the study were: to provide data to insurance companies to assist in the preparation of prepaid medical care plans for catastrophic illnesses, to provide information and to develop guides for industrial medical programs, and to provide a common set of data for all those who may be interested in this subject matter.

Among the specific aims of the project were: to determine the frequency and severity of prolonged illness-absences; to establish the relationships (if any) of the frequency and duration of illness-absences with such factors as age, sex, occupation, length of employment, type of industry, geographic location, and type of benefit plan; to identify the types of disabilities responsible for prolonged absences; to ascertain the costs, including wage losses; to determine the extent to which the various insurance plans might meet the costs; and to note the economic

impact of the absences. The study is replete with statistical tables (85), charts (32), and appendices (21).

Some of the specific findings of the study and some of the conclusions drawn are unexpected; others might have been anticipated. Prolonged illness, as defined in this study, is not overwhelmingly frequent. The over-all adjusted rate for all private non-agricultural industries is 39 per 1000 man-years, with an average prolonged illness absence of a little over 10.8 weeks. The national loss is, in round figures, 453,000 man-years. The authors, assuming an average annual wage at \$3900, arrive at a total productive time loss equivalent to \$1,777,000,000 per year.

The rate of prolonged illness-absences is greater among women workers than among men. It is greater among productive workers than among salaried personnel. It rises markedly by age, though half of the absentees are well under 50 years of age. The frequency rates of the various types of disabilities suggest, according to the authors, that it would be practical to consider preventative medicine as one of the answers to this problem.

The survey finds that a variation in the provisions of medical care programs, insofar as type of service is concerned, is strongly indicated. The heavy emphasis in present benefit provisions is for hospitalization and surgical care. The record shows that 75% of the absentees have hospital care. However, the average hospital stay was but 2.5 weeks and represented only one-fourth of the average period of absence. The present benefit plans succeed in meeting 80% of the hospital charges and 61% of the surgeons' fees, but only 16% of all the other charges.

Group medical plans and sick leave programs do bring down the cost to the workers. More than one-third of the absentees had no net medical costs after the payment of benefits under group plans and other insurance programs. Another 30.5% had net medical costs of less than \$100. Compensation under sick leave with pay programs was equivalent on the average to 55% of the wages that would have been earned during the period of absence.

In spite of all of the benefit provisions, the authors conclude that the total cost of prolonged illness-absences for the average worker remains substantial. For the average absentee in the study the total net cost after payment of insurance benefits and sick leave was equivalent to 13% of his normal earn-

ings; whereas the authors suggest that if the cost is more than 8% it must be considered burdensome.

The Council feels that the survey findings leave no doubt that action can be taken to meet the problems of prolonged illness. The question remains: Will such action be taken?

Leader Behavior: Its Description and Measurement. By Ralph M. Stogdill and Alvin E. Coons. The Bureau of Business Research, The Ohio State University, Columbus 10, Ohio, 1957. 168 pp. No price indicated.

Reviewed by

CAREY SHAW, JR.

*Deputy Chief, Civilian Personnel Office,
Office, Chief of Staff,
Department of the Army*

This monograph is one of the Ohio State Leadership Studies which represent an attempt to examine and describe leadership performance—the ways a leader exercises leadership—instead of the personal traits which distinguish him as a leader. The major contributors were psychologists, sociologists and economists.

When these studies were initiated in 1945, no satisfactory definition of leadership was available. It was decided, however, that within the context of this research leadership would not be regarded as synonymous with "good leadership." An agreed-upon definition was that leadership "is the behavior of an individual when he is directing the activities of a group toward a shared goal." It was also decided as a ground rule that description and evaluation of leadership would be two separate steps but the description would come first.

The nature and scope of these studies are succinctly stated as follows: "The papers in this monograph are thus largely concerned with methods of describing leader behavior or at least the behavior of persons placed in positions of high leadership potential. Criteria of relative goodness or poorness are reported in some cases. However, within the framework of the studies these evaluations are not the major consideration."

The first task of the scholars who participated in these studies was to prepare a leader-behavior description questionnaire. The objective was to find answers to: "(1) What does an individual do while he operates as a leader, and (2) How does he go about what he does?"

The dimensions or characteristics of leader

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

behavior finally agreed upon were: initiation, membership, representation, integration, organization, domination, communication, recognition, and production. Out of nearly 2000 items considered in the context of these dimensions, 150 were selected for the Leader Behavior Description Questionnaire.

It was decided to use a multiple choice format for the questionnaire. During the process by which the questionnaire was tested it was completed by approximately 357 persons, representing 29 different groups or group situations, ranging from informal social groups to military organizations. Those who were leaders described their own leadership, and others described their supervisors' leader behavior.

The pretesting process revealed that the questionnaire was easy to use and that it produced a wide range of responses to most items. Uncertainty existed, however, as to the validity of the results. There was the question as to whether the respondents were describing the leader's real behavior. There was an observable variance between a leader's description of himself and the descriptions prepared by his subordinates. It was also observed that there was a large range of difference among leaders as to how they do their jobs. The major ways of accomplishing the leadership job were found to be as follows:

1. A leader may stress being a socially acceptable individual in his interactions with other group members.
2. A leader may stress "getting the job done." This would involve emphasis upon group production and concern with problems relative to obtaining the group's objectives.
3. A leader may stress making it possible for members of a group or organization to work together. Emphasis would be on the leader's job as one of a "group catalyst."

After the questionnaire was tested it was applied in several different work situations. In some instances it was used in conjunction with other questionnaires. Either in its original or modified form it was used to: (1) evaluate the leadership traits of Air Force personnel manning bombardment aircraft. (2) Ascertain what aspects of leader behavior are most important for the effective combat performance of aircraft commanders. (3) Determine the relation between a leader's

ideal (how he thinks he should behave as a leader) and his actual leadership behavior as observed by his subordinates. The sample consisted of two groups of subjects, 64 educational administrators and 132 aircraft commanders. (4) Determine the relationship between leader behavior and certain characteristics of the group. To what extent is the leader influenced by the group in exercising leadership? Bomber crews were studied in this instance. (5) Explore the relationship between the leader behavior of the departmental administrator and the reputation of his department for being well managed. College personnel participated. (6) Compare general and specific leader behavior characteristics reflected by secondary school personnel.

Three additional studies are also reported. These relate to the evaluation and description of leader behavior in industry, the assessment of leadership attitudes, and a study relating to leader behavior of salesmen and salesmanagers.

Authors of the experiments described in this volume have performed a worthy service. They have developed a basic questionnaire, revised and adopted it to several different types of research problems, and recorded at the end of each project a summary of accomplishments. These studies have brought us considerably closer to a precise definition and description of the elusive quality called leadership. This book should be of obvious interest to colleges and universities and to researchers who are interested in the testing technique used. Psychologists and personnel technicians in both government and industry should examine it.

There are three appendices to the book. One contains the 150 items in the Leadership Behavior Description Questionnaire, one contains item analysis data for the 150 items, and the third contains brief descriptions of 11 monographs in the Leadership Series in Ohio Studies in Personnel.

Ideal and Practice in Public Administration.

By Emmette S. Redford. University of Alabama Press, University, Alabama, 1958. 155 pp. \$2.50.

Reviewed by

WAYNE L. HIGBEE

*Personnel Director, City of Santa Monica,
Santa Monica, California*

Does public administration have a philosophy?

Do the people who make up the executive branches of local, state, and federal government share common ideals? If so, are these ideals clearly stated, realistic, and effective in the operations of public administration? Or have we created a blind behemoth which is driven by outward circumstances toward no end at all?

Mr. Redford raises these questions not as an indictment against public administration but to explore the idea of the possibility of public administration meriting the trust the judiciary has earned.

In a series of six lectures, he then takes a thoughtful look at the practices and practitioners of the art of public administration and offers some answers to the questions. In choosing to accept the challenge of answering these questions, the author has approached the problem in a calm, steady, yet perceptive and informed manner. Many of the conclusions are beyond absolute proof, and there are some things with which students of government with good judgment will want to disagree. However, his answers have contributed to the philosophy and literature of progressive administration.

Professor Redford finds that there are ideals in administration which are rooted in our national heritage. He defines them as efficiency, the rule of law versus the discretion of men, administration by competent and responsible men, democracy, and the public interest. He elaborates on the meaning of each, finding its place in the American tradition, and shows how each is embodied, or may be effectively embodied, in administrative practice.

Efficiency, being the axiom of good administration, has been represented by some authors as similar and complimentary in business and public administration. Professor Redford challenges this concept and points out that the impact of supremacy of law, public interest, and democracy are distinctly different from the effect of the same ideals in business.

The difficulty of defining and measuring efficiency is discussed. The greatest deficiency is not that efficiency is nonmeasurable, but that the goal itself is inadequate. The efficiency goal has a value concept, and the measure of efficiency must often take into account the complex interaction of multiple forces and institutional factors. Efficiency is measurable in terms of the attain-

ment of all community ideals, yet there is no guide for measuring these ideals.

The rule of law, like the maxim of efficiency, is an important goal for administration and an essential test of it. The rule of law manifests itself in so many ways that its full impact upon administration is great indeed. Yet discretion remains a significant attribute of administration at its higher levels. The rule of law, again like the maxim of efficiency, becomes inadequate as a full measure of and guide for administration, primarily because of the importance of policy-making functions.

If all administration were like that of the old age and survivors' insurance program, where men's rights are set forth in detail and administration is largely operations, then efficiency and the rule of law would be adequate tests and guides. Since administration has responsibility for policymaking and program development, we must seek still other ideals which may govern its practice.

Service by competent and responsible men is one of the great ideals for administration. Attainment of this ideal in our complex society requires professionalization of the public service. Professionalization, in turn, brings problems. These problems can be met in part by policies designed to keep the public service flexible and fluid in its operations and open to ideas from outside. They can be further met by developing within the public service a full range of competences—from the technical and functional to the super-functional, from the specialist to the generalist. These things will not, however, fully solve the problems of inertia, separatism, and specialization within the bureaucracy.

It is the author's opinion that democracy in state and local government will follow the lines of the national pattern, the essential features of which are professionalization of the public service, integration in the executive department, an increasing workload for the legislative body, and the correlation of work of the chief executive and the legislative body.

The definition of public interest is a flexible thing, and we cannot expect a full measure of consistency in public policy. This is a natural result in a dynamic, free, pluralistic society for the balance of forces which play upon government constantly shift and interact. Yet creative intelligence and broad sympathies working through institutional organizations and practices will yield a continuing measure of public good.

For a broad view of public administrative

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

philosophy, this book should be on your library shelf.

Assessing Managerial Potential. The Foundation for Research on Human Behavior, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1958. 83 pp. \$3.00.

Reviewed by

LARRY C. WHITE, PERSONNEL ANALYST
*Personnel Commission,
Los Angeles City School Districts*

Three distinct groups of people should have a special interest in this report and derive special value from it—those in top management, those responsible for personnel selection, and those engaged in personnel research.

Of special significance to top management will be the emphasis on the importance of an organization clearly defining all its goals. The goals of most organizations are varied and interrelated. The relative values of these goals fluctuate with times and conditions. The goal that is not being achieved at any given time often appears to be the most important goal. Summarized in this report for top management's consideration are illustrations of this point and examples of ways to improve the criteria for measuring managerial effectiveness.

Persons whose primary interest is in personnel selection will probably derive value from studying the examples of problem situations that have been developed by some organizations to study relevant managerial behavior. The consideration of problems of this type may enable civil service testing units to develop better methods for supervisory selection.

Problems encountered in the validation of the measures of effectiveness of managers will interest researchers. The report illustrates that the practical problems in behavioral research cannot be minimized.

What are the characteristics of an effective supervisor? How can these characteristics be measured? These are questions that receive answers that are probably as complete as can be given at the present stage of knowledge of the social and behavioral sciences.

There are varied reasons for appraising supervisors. Management's interest in appraising supervisors may be for the purpose of salary review. It may be to improve the current organizational structure. It may be to select, place, or develop men. The under-

lying purpose of any appraisal is to determine what effect the manager has or will have upon the organization.

This report contains concise but valuable summaries of all the better known techniques of assessment and evaluation and the value of these techniques. Individual, group, and stress interviews are discussed; psychological, interest, and personality tests are reviewed; performance appraisals and reviews are examined; various significant areas of research being conducted on the matter of assessing managerial potential are summarized; the practical applications of the techniques used by various firms are explained and evaluated.

Perhaps the chief values contained in this report are the following:

1. The importance of supervisors and managers to the success of an enterprise is reaffirmed.
2. Attention is focused on gaps in our knowledge in the social and behavioral sciences.
3. Questions are asked to which answers must be provided before anyone interested in personnel management can be complacent about his work.

It is disturbing to note that participants in the seminar which led to this report came primarily from industry. Only one governmental agency, the United States Civil Service Commission, was represented. Perhaps this is indicative of the fact that governmental agencies have not made a significant contribution to the evaluation of managerial positions or managerial personnel.

If this is true, it is unfortunate, for government on the whole utilizes standardized testing techniques for selection purposes for rank and file employees perhaps more than does industry. Certainly the managerial jobs in most governmental agencies are as complex and demanding as the managerial jobs in our corporate giants.

Those of us in government, however, should ask ourselves if we really know what constitutes managerial effectiveness and if we really know how to measure it. Do we really know how to select the best possible candidate for an executive job? If we can not answer with a firm "yes", then we clearly have our work cut out for us because executive selection and development in governmental agencies is of crucial importance in an era when big government continues to get bigger.

1958 PPA Book Reviewers

The following members of the Public Personnel Association have accepted the editor's invitation to serve as book reviewers for *Public Personnel Review* during 1958.

Harry Albert, Assistant Personnel Director, San Francisco City and County Civil Service Commission, San Francisco, California

Paul W. Bigbee, Chief, Personnel Division, Pan American Union, Washington, D. C.

Earl R. Chambers, Personnel Director, St. Louis County, Missouri, Civil Service Commission, Clayton, Missouri

Donald E. Dickason, Director, Office of Nonacademic Personnel, University of Illinois, Urbana, Illinois

Martin B. Dworkis, Professor of Public Administration, Graduate School of Public Administration and Social Service, New York University, New York, New York

Robert Fisher, Personnel Director, Personnel

Commission of Los Angeles City Schools, Los Angeles, California

Charles S. Gardiner, Director, Texas Merit System Council, Austin, Texas

Wayne L. Higbee, Personnel Director, City of Santa Monica, California

Lloyd Hunt, Personnel Officer, Civil Service Commission, Chicago, Illinois

John W. Jackson, Director, Minnesota Civil Service Department, St. Paul, Minnesota

William M. McDougall, Director of Personnel, Louisiana Department of Civil Service, Baton Rouge, Louisiana

C. R. Patterson, Assistant Director of Personnel Selection, Civil Service Commission of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

Carey Shaw, Jr., Deputy Chief, Civilian Personnel Office, Office, Chief of Staff, Department of the Army, Washington, D. C.

John A. Watts, Director of Civilian Personnel, Department of the Air Force, Washington, D. C.

New 1958 PPA Publications

—to add to your personal personnel library

Manpower for Government—A Decade's Forecast. Eli Ginzberg and James K. Anderson. How government agencies can more effectively develop and use the nation's manpower resources.

List price, \$2.00—PPA members, \$1.50

Public Personnel Councils. Theodore H. Lang. Procedures involved in setting up a personnel council, its composition, functions and purposes, and its operation.

List price, \$2.00—PPA members, \$1.50

Personnel Research Frontiers. Cecil E. Goode. Why are governmental personnel research needs lagging? The answers, given here, are of vital importance to personnel executives and their staffs.

List price, \$3.50—PPA members, \$2.50

Write for new 1958 PPA Publications Catalog, listing 40 personnel publications.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois

BOOK AND PAMPHLET NOTES

Manpower for Government—A Decade's Forecast. Eli Ginzberg and James K. Anderson. Public Personnel Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois, 1958. 33 pp. \$2.00 list price, \$1.50 to PPA members.

Can we estimate the size of the 1965 labor force? It is possible to make reasonable estimates especially if the forecast is for the near future; much more difficult to foresee is the level of demand for labor, and even more difficult to anticipate is the specific structure of this demand. The manpower situation of 1965 will be a function of demographic and other basic social trends and the manpower policies, broadly defined, which will be decided upon and implemented in the years ahead. The first section of "Manpower for Government" sets out these basic trends, while the second section suggests the range of actions available to government to secure the manpower resources required to discharge its responsibilities and contribute to the more effective development and utilization of the nation's manpower resources.

High-Talent Manpower for Science and Industry. J. Douglas Brown and Frederick Harbison. Industrial Relations Section, P.O. Box 248, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey, 1958. 97 pp. \$3.00.

In the two essays contained in this volume, the authors develop the proposition that men of high talent—which they call "seed-corn" human resources—are always the initiators of change and the agents of progress in advanced and underdeveloped countries alike. But "seed-corn" talent cannot be mass-produced either at home or abroad. Everywhere it must be tailor-made. The two essays explore the appropriate role of the corporation, the university, and the state in development of such talent.

Discussion Leader's Manual for Training Program in Employment Interviewing. Prepared by Milton M. Mandell and Sally H. Greenberg. U. S. Civil Service Commission, Assembled Test Technical Series No. 29, Standards Division, Washington 25, D. C. 34 pp. No price indicated.

A person can have expert knowledge of every interviewing practice and still be a poor interviewer, while there are effective interviewers who might not make a very high score on a test of knowledge of interviewing techniques and theory. This point is recognized in this handbook by emphasizing practice rather than merely discussion. Mr. Mandell and Miss Greenberg are frank in warning the discussion leaders that many unskillful interviewers will still be unskillful after they receive this training. The trainer will have to assume that ordinarily his group will include persons with all levels of aptitude, from those who can probably do as well without the training to those who would still do a poor job if the training session were extended over a much longer period. The appendices include itemization of equipment, materials, and special arrangements needed for the training program; background information and rating forms for the prepared interviews; and a blank rating form for practice interviews.

Public Personnel Councils. Theodore H. Lang. Public Personnel Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois, 1958. 30 pp. \$2.00 list price, \$1.50 to PPA members.

The need for public personnel councils develops from the nature of personnel management. The policies, standards, and some of the works of personnel management may be in the hands of the central personnel agency, but much of the effectiveness of personnel management rests on the personnel men and the line officials of the operating agencies of government. It follows that there is need for a two-way communication system between central and line agencies, else the central policies, standards, and efforts tend to become unrealistic and a handicap rather than an aid to government. This publication is useful not only to personnel councils "in being" but also to personnel officers in localities where the establishment of such organizations is under consideration.

The Book of the States, 1958-1959. The Council of State Governments, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois, 1958. 538 pp. \$9.00; with supplements, \$12.00.

As in previous editions, the present book contains comprehensive material in texts and tables on the organization, administration, financing, functions, and services of all the state governments. For many subjects it carries the coverage to a later period preceding publication than has been feasible heretofore. A supplement at the beginning of 1959—as in past odd-numbered years—will list elective administrative officials and legislators of all the states. A new supplement, replacing rosters previously included in the major book, will appear in mid-1959, with comprehensive lists of state administrative officials, whether appointed or elected, classified by functions. This will permit naming the current administrative officials soon after most of the 1959 appointments are made—following the beginning of new elective terms early in the year. Section IV of the present book contains a section on Personnel Systems with the subheadings "Developments in State Personnel Systems"; "State Employment in 1956"; and "Current Trends in Pension Policy for State Government Employees."

Readability, An Appraisal of Research and Application. Jeanne S. Chall. Bureau of Educational Research and Service, Ohio State University, Columbus 10, Ohio, 1958. 202 pp. \$4.00, cloth; \$3.00, paper.

In the words of the preface "With the publication of *Readability: An Appraisal of Research and Application*, a long first step in the development of the field of readability is completed. Readability is a new field, very active, and rich both in research and in potential application. As a new field, it requires some form, as early as possible, if further development is to be orderly. In this early compilation, Mrs. Chall has picked up many specifics that would otherwise go unrecorded. At the same time, she has attempted to take into account whatever can now be shown to affect comprehension of materials and to be useful in predicting and controlling the level of difficulty of such materials. This is a reference book. Its extensive index, the most comprehensive yet attempted, is of value particularly to those who would try to grasp this rapidly developing field of inquiry."

Institute for Social Research, 1946-1956. Survey Research Center and Research Center for Group Dynamics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan. 61 pp. No publication date or price indicated.

The Institute, on the occasion of completing its first decade of operations at Michigan, presents this descriptive report so that scientific colleagues, collaborators in research, and friends may be informed of its activities and objectives. Established in 1946, its intent was to have within the University a staff and facilities for social science research that could not readily be accommodated within the existing branches of the University. The new organization was to be administratively separate from the teaching departments and schools, but closely allied with them through mutual research interests and through sharing of some teaching and other professional activities. The aim of the Institute is to increase our understanding of social behavior through the utilization of scientific methods. During the year 1955-1956 about 50 major research projects were in progress. This is a handsome publication; its appearance indicates that some fine research was done on typography and design.

Michigan Municipal Wages, Salaries and Fringe Benefits. Compiled by the Michigan Municipal League, 205 South State Street, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1958. 148 pp. \$3.50.

This is the fifteenth of a continuing series of compilations of Michigan municipal salaries and wages. Wage and salary data are presented in Part I; fringe benefits and other employee pay practices are presented in Part II. Director John H. Huss cautions that in comparing rates of pay, the work assignments, duties, and responsibilities will vary considerably among municipalities for almost all job titles.

PERSONNEL BIBLIOGRAPHY

This feature is possible through the cooperation of the U.S. Civil Service Commission. It was prepared by the staff of the Commission's Library under the direction of Mrs. Elaine Woodruff, Librarian. Selections are made on the basis of (1) general availability, (2) pertinence to the public service generally, and (3) recency of material.

Communicating Personnel Policy

American management association.

How to prepare and maintain a supervisors' policy manual. New York, 1947. 71 pp. (Research report no. 11)

While this report deals primarily with the development and contents of the supervisors' policy manual, it demonstrates the extent to which such a publication insures the systematic circulation of policies and greater consistency in policy application.

Baker, Helen.

Company-wide understanding of industrial relations policies; a study in communications. Princeton, N. J., Princeton university, Department of economics and social institutions, Industrial relations section, 1948. 78 pp. (Research report series no. 78)

Surveys 84 companies to find out to what extent and by what methods they were attempting to secure understanding of their industrial relations policies, and whether their goals and methods were different for members of management and for employees. "It appeared that successful communication on policy matters required a communications program broad enough to include any subject of interest to employees."

Breth, Robert D.

Employee publications for interpreting the personnel program. Personnel journal, vol. 26, no. 2, June 1947, pp. 54-61.

Describes various means of communication used to interpret the personnel program together with the advantages and disadvantages of each.

Brown, David S.

Sharing "policy in prospect": ECA's weekly digest. Public administration review, vol. 17, no. 1, Winter 1957, pp. 31-35.

Describes the Weekly Digest issued from 1950 to 1953 by the Economic Cooperation Administration and its successor, the Mutual Security Agency, which was an attempt "to keep its field offices informed of something beyond established policy: policy in prospect." Examines content and evaluates the publication. Points out possibilities of using a pre-policy digest in other administrative areas.

Cooper, Joseph D.

How to communicate policy and procedure. New London, Conn., National foremen's institute, 1956.

Deals with the important management tools for transfer of thought between people. Demonstrates how to coordinate the mass and multiplicity of instructions within loose-leaf manuals and systems.

Corson, John J.

The role of communication in the process of administration. *Public administration review*, vol. 4, no. 1, Winter 1944, pp. 7-15.

Examines significance of communications in conveying instructions and policy decisions down the line and as an illustration describes means of communication used by Bureau of Old-age and Survivors Insurance.

Dandeneau, Richard J.

Better employee relations through an improved communications system. Urbana, University of Illinois, College of commerce and business administration, Bureau of business management, n.d. 7 pp. (Management case study no. 6)

Demonstrates how one company launched and now maintains an effective method of communicating with its people. Discusses motivation of the management team, education and training of supervisors as communicators, and available communication media.

Davis, Keith.

What you should know about administrative communication. Bloomington, University of Indiana, School of business, Bureau of business research, 1954. 15 pp.

First objective of administrative communication is to provide information and understanding necessary for coordination and job performance. Discusses organizational and technical framework of communication as well as the two major classes of communication techniques, visual and aural.

Dooher, M. Joseph and Vivienne Marquis.

Effective communication on the job; a guide to employee communication for supervisors and executives. New York, American management association, 1956. 294 pp.

Selected papers on all aspects of communication: Person to person; Bridges and barriers to good communication; The day to day job; as well as other types of communication.

Eberle, John P.

The personnel office interprets. *Personnel administration*, vol. 19, no. 1, January-February 1956, pp. 34-38.

Comments on responsibility which personnel office often has for communicating personnel policies to operating staff through directives, memoranda, or manuals.

Gerdel, J. K.

S-s-sh! It's confidential. *Personnel journal*, vol. 27, no. 1, May 1948, pp. 2-28.

Treats of four general classes of personnel information which are considered confidential by many companies, and points out why an attitude of secrecy is detrimental to employer-employee relations.

Hayes, Elinor G. and Edward B. McMenamin.

Personnel instructions for the person who uses them. *Personnel administration*, vol. 10, no. 3, January 1948, pp. 19-22.

Describes how the Federal Security Agency developed a manual system as a flexible medium of communication and as a "convenient means for reducing to workable form the complex matrix of rules, regulations, laws, policies, and principles within which any large Federal organization must operate its personnel management program."

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Heron, Alexander R.

Sharing information with employees. Stanford, Stanford university press, 1942. 204 pp.

Keynote of the book is not only conveying information but sharing it through effective employee understanding and acceptance. Discusses kinds of information to share and methods to be used in communication.

Hook, Charles R.

Improved motivation through published personnel policies. Management record, vol. 19, no. 9, September 1957, pp. 314-316, 336-338.

Emphasizes value of written and published personnel policies as ideals and principles to guide those making day-to-day decisions.

Jucius, Michael J.

Personnel management. 3rd ed. Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, inc., 1955. 722 pp.

Chapter 16: The Educational Program. Discusses briefly means of communicating personnel objectives, policies, and practices and points out that the supervisor is the best channel through which to convey this type of information.

Municipal finance officers association of the United States and Canada.

The value of manuals. Chicago, 1953. 10 pp. (Special bulletin 1953)

Indicates how much easier it is for employees to abide by regulations, observe rules of conduct, and apply policies and methods in their daily work if they have written instructions to follow.

National association of manufacturers. Industrial relations division.

Satisfying the salaried employee. New York, 1957. 64 pp.

Chapter on communications stresses importance of good communications in gaining support for specific management action, and in interpreting policies and practices of management. Most important channels of communication are outlined.

National industrial conference board, inc.

Preparing the company organization manual. New York, 1957. 88 pp. (Studies in personnel policy no. 157)

Points out the function which administrative manuals serve in letting people know about company policies and objectives and in improving personnel administration.

National industrial conference board, inc.

Written statements of personnel policy. New York, 1947. 36 pp. (Studies in personnel policy no. 79)

Includes a section on how personnel policies are publicized.

Pigors, Paul.

Effective communication in industry. New York, National association of manufacturers, 1949. 88 pp.

Communication depends on understanding of three kinds: people and their feelings, technical facts, plans and principles. Emphasizes the importance of communicating organization and personnel policies and comments on difficulties involved in the process.

Redfield, Charles E.

Communication in management; a guide to administrative communication. Chicago, University of Chicago press, 1953. 290 pp.

Covers in an orderly and systematic way the fundamentals of communication for the executive. Part two deals specifically with downward and outward communications including order-giving, oral or written instructions, manuals, and employee handbooks.

Willson, R. A.

Written downward communications. *In* Minnesota. University. Industrial relations center. Communications in employment relations. Dubuque, Iowa, Wm. C. Brown Co., 1954. pp. 5-12. (Research and technical report no. 14)

Examines types of messages management should initiate for the organization expecting leadership. Discusses sharing primary policies and objectives and relaying day-to-day decisions made by management which have policy significance.

Zelko, Harold P. and Harold J. O'Brien.

Management-employee communications in action. Cleveland, Howard Allen inc., 1957. 177 pp.

Analyzes place of communications in management, the total process of communication, and presents a communication action program. Stresses great importance of communication in all phases as a management tool. Emphasis is on internal media which exchange information, ideals, plans, policies, and procedures among all segments and all individuals of the organization structure.

KAPLAN'S LAW OF CIVIL SERVICE

Until now, precise court tested information covering all phases of Municipal, State and Federal Civil Service Law has not been available. Questions answered include Appointments, Promotions, Examinations, Dismissals, Pay Plans, Veteran Preferences, Political Activities, etc., etc. 2 weeks' Free Examination. \$11.

MATTHEW BENDER & CO., INC.
ALBANY 1 NEW YORK

personnel literature

abstracts of current articles

Administration

Outer Spaces: Advanced Planning for Reduction in Force. Jack Pockrass. *Personnel Administration*. March-April, 1958.

Management is essentially a conglomerate of arts and skills. Scientific method has made some improvements, but much of this insight is enjoyed more by researchers than by practitioners of management. The effective allocation of manpower to a new or an expanding organization is aided by organization charts, but much of the process is still dependent on seances and crystal gazing.

The logical way to determine manpower needs is to ascertain continuing requirements, establish production rates, and then derive the number of personnel needed.

While it is reasonable to assume that the same process would be used if an organization is to operate with fewer personnel, the problem is no longer the same. Now we are dealing with people: individuals with pride and with specific retention rights. Cutbacks may be met by the "meat-axe approach", lopping off a certain number or percentage of employees from each division, but primary consideration still must be the required job to be done.

Objective data is needed to equate manpower needs with workloads. Questions which will help to point out needed cuts are:

1. Where is there fat which can be cut without damage? Which sections have greater "overhead" personnel?
2. Can essential functions be established and priorities found for remaining programs?
3. What savings can be effected through management improvements?
4. What research projects can be eliminated?
5. Are any offices rendering nonessential functions?

Once decisions have been made as to which positions are to be eliminated, the

timing becomes important. Marginal employees can be encouraged to seek employment elsewhere. Outside hiring may be "frozen." Employees eligible for retirement may be encouraged to do so. The human factors must be considered; the adjustments of those who go and of those who stay must be taken into account.—HENRY E. HALL.

The Give and Take in Personnel Management. Walter Emmerling. *Office Executive*. October, 1957.

A happy relationship between personnel and management involves a delicate balance between the amount of leeway given an employee to carry out his duties in a manner most agreeable to himself, and the amount of regimentation necessary to get work done in a manner most acceptable to management.

The number one problem of an office manager seems to be office staffing. Procter and Gamble tries to follow a policy of building staff at a time when the proper employee is available for training.

Any forward-looking personnel administration should include a program of hiring good personnel and then training them when business is slack. Good employees are then obtainable and the facilities and time are available.

The office manager must be able to retain those who are trained and secure himself against the inroads of other organizations that are bidding for the services of his employees. Every turnover causes a company a minimum debit of \$300—at the key personnel level it is \$1,000 or more.

When hiring, Procter and Gamble uses a series of tests which record mental alertness and abilities along certain lines. Testing programs are available from many sources and in many categories. A carefully studied plan can have many benefits, but it must be remembered that any testing program has limitations, for many factors can-

not be measured by testing. The use of a testing program justifies expert advice.

Naturally the problem of office staffing is tied in closely with proper and adequate salary administration. Without such a program it is impossible to attract satisfactory candidates and to keep present employees in a happy frame of mind.

Let us assume that we have a proper starting salary in keeping with the going rates of the community for comparable work. Then, the important thing to do is to develop a fair wage scale and provide for the reviewing of salaries at regular intervals. Each job within the office should be graded or classed, taking into consideration the background or experience needed to perform the work.

At Procter and Gamble all clerical jobs, outside of the supervisory, are included in one of four broad classes: (1) Routine work requiring little or no experience and performed under immediate supervision, (2) work requiring at least one year's training and experience, performed under immediate supervision, with little latitude for independent judgment, (3) work requiring considerable training and experience, probably more than two years, and performed under very general supervision, and with some latitude for the exercise of independent judgment, and (4) work requiring thorough training, practically no supervision, and possibly the supervision or direction of the work of others.

Experience has shown that a program of this nature provides the salary administration with considerable latitude. Many salary scales provide for automatic increases based on length of service without regard for the quality and quantity of work. To be fair in the administration of salaries, we should consider both factors.

Proper selection, compensation, and classification are not the only problems of personnel administration. Absenteeism, training, equitable administration of programs offering the employee rest and smoking privileges, eating facilities, etc., are all personnel problems which will always be present. These problems are human problems, built around the psychological and physical worries of people. They never end, and they never are completely solved. But they can be reduced to a minimum by an intelligent give-and-take attitude on the part of management.—JERRY C. RILEY.

Employee Relations

"Summer-Employment Programs: A Student's-Eye View." William Collins. *Personnel*, March-April, 1958.

Basically, these programs have two aims. One to enable the company to assess the capabilities of a student, and the other to give the student a favorable impression of the company. The student's reactions to the program are therefore a key factor in its effectiveness, and the suggestions that follow are based on considerable personal experience as well as on discussions with, and observations of, many fellow-students.

The student's requirements in a summer job are as follows:

Experience—Work assignments must be satisfying and productive. The student may fill in for vacationing workers in a particular department or work continuously on a special necessary project. Effective supervision is important and distinct lines of authority are necessary.

Pay—The plan of paying salaries on the basis of the number of years of college completed, rather than the subjects studied or the job offered, is readily acceptable, as it should be remembered these summer employees are being hired primarily as students, not professionals.

Knowledge of the company—There should be continuous orientation throughout the summer through brief lectures, pamphlets, tours of the plant, demonstrations of product uses, and interviews with high-level managers.

Recreation—The most information it is possible to obtain should be provided about leisure-time activities, and a special effort should be made to integrate students into the athletic and social programs. A pleasant social life with opportunities for students to meet girls (or boys) of their own age should not be underestimated.—ORVILLE M. MITCHELL.

Placement

Is There a Defense Manpower Crisis? Lem F. Thom. *Personnel Administration*. November-December, 1957.

The concept that all military functions must be performed by persons in uniform is outmoded today. Modern warfare is total and the entire economy and populace must be geared toward the support of the national cause. The military today is a virtual economy in itself, duplicating in its organ-

ization and functions many of the operations found in private enterprise.

Yet, the present military personnel standards limit service to the young and physically fit and to those with military training. The military personnel system does not provide personnel who are adequately trained and experienced to staff the support activities which are more akin to our nonmilitary economy than to military science. The present personnel system results in ineffective use of trained manpower.

The country is handicapped by an acute shortage of skilled personnel. It is further complicated by the military producing far fewer combat troops than our enemies. It is a well-known fact that the military has squandered the time and talent of thousands of its most skilled personnel; it has closed the door to persons otherwise qualified for assignments in the support activities; it has fostered the concept that military men with combat skills must be developed for all types of positions.

A few simple changes in personnel policies could alleviate the situation. One is to stop the waste of trained personnel through a revision of present personnel practices. Another is the elimination of all unqualified persons from positions of responsibility in the support activities.

Commissions and enlistments should be offered to persons direct from civilian life who qualify except for the military requirements of age, physical limitation, and military training. Much-needed skills and new blood would thus be introduced into the services. The Cordiner Pay Plan has shown one way to cope with the problem. The recommendations of the various special groups commissioned to study the manpower situation indicate other ways.

But all of these methods cannot solve the problem unless the need for changing the personnel system is fully recognized by military leaders. Unless the job is done now, the military is merely perpetuating its own manpower crisis.—ROBERT A. EARLE.

Recruitment and Selection

Recruitment and Selection Practices in Four Government Agencies. Gregorio A. Francisco, Jr. *Philippine Journal of Public Administration*. October, 1957.

After considerable adverse publicity regarding recruitment and selection practices in Philippine government agencies, a survey of four representative agencies was under-

taken to discover the extent and nature of current hiring practices. Several areas were surveyed through questionnaires distributed to a sample of agency employees. It was found that employees had generally located their jobs through friends or personal inquiries rather than recruitment publicity.

Job openings were seldom formally publicized by the central personnel agency since, due to a high rate of unemployment, active recruitment often produced floods of applicants for the few available openings. Such factors as security and more liberal fringe benefits were reasons most frequently mentioned when respondents were asked why they had chosen a government job.

The agencies surveyed relied on a number of selection techniques, both formal and informal. Although some use was made of eligibles certified by the Bureau of Civil Service, more frequently agencies carried on their own selection process with the knowledge and consent of the central personnel agency. Failure to rely on the Bureau was explained by one agency as due to insufficient budget allowance to pay the minimum salaries specified by the Bureau or unwillingness of those certified by the Bureau to travel on field assignments.

When agencies conducted their own hiring, heavy reliance was placed on candidates' eligibility for jobs as determined by previous civil service examinations taken. However, the concept of eligibility was found to be extremely broad. Some examinations conferred a permanent general eligibility to hold many types of jobs within a single grade, while other examinations conferred eligibility for one specific position but it was possible to "convert" such eligibility to eligibility for another position not necessarily closely related to the first. Thus many incumbents held only general eligibility for their positions or had secured their positions on the strength of a "converted" eligibility.

In addition to considering the eligibility of applicants, agencies reported the use of other appraisals of the candidate such as written tests, the group oral interview, and ratings of education and experience.

Pressures for patronage appointments were an important factor leading agencies to devise some formal selection procedures for themselves. Under conditions of high unemployment there seems to be a need not for more extensive formal recruitment but for more refined selection utilizing the most recent testing methods. Also the probation

period might be more effectively used to determine proper job placement inasmuch as many of the employees surveyed seemed overqualified for their jobs. Such informal agency procedures, properly developed, could do much to restore public confidence in the government's personnel management. —JANE PUGH.

Geographical Distribution of Personnel in the United Nations. Anand K. Srivastava. *The Indian Journal of Public Administration*. October-November, 1957.

The geographical quota system of the United Nations may appear, to the superficial observer, to be somewhat at odds with the merit principle in personnel selection. Actually a review of the practical operation of this system reveals no such conflict.

The quota for each member nation is determined generally by its financial contribution. However, the quota figure is quite flexible with a strong emphasis on selection of the best available personnel within the general limitations of the quota figure. This balance between merit on the one hand and geography on the other is a prerequisite for any international administration which is based upon voluntary co-operation of member nations. Unless each member nation, especially the smaller ones, can be assured that their interests carry equal weight within the secretariat, a basis for nonco-operation on larger issues is created.

The quota system also contributes to the development of the international, rather than a narrow national, view of world affairs within the United Nations secretariat. Even on the lowest operational level of the United Nations such a spirit of internationalism is an important factor in the functioning of critical international programs.

However, the quota system is not generally applicable to national personnel systems because the more advanced political status of national states does not require such a clear-cut recognition of any regional or cultural differences that may exist. Even where these differences do exist they do not generally need to be converted into personnel quotas. The fact that quota systems still exist within some national states is probably an indication that the political leadership of those states is not aware of the high level of political sophistication generally present in the citizenry of most modern states.—CHARLES J. SETZER.

Supervision

How To Prevent Job Failures. Lawrence G. Lindahl. *Personnel Journal*. November, 1957.

Job failures result primarily from human failures rather than lack of job skills. Instead of letting employees fail on the job, management should recognize that its real problems are with human frailties and try to control them.

One of the best means of control is enlightened supervision. This means more than trained supervision; it means supervision fortified with a knowledge of human behavior and not simply trained in rule-of-thumb methods.

The supervisor's attitude is important since it influences the way he will see and interpret the behavior of his employees. He may, for example, interpret certain behavior as loafing, insubordination, failure to cooperate, disregard of company property, and unwillingness to do a full day's work. The employee may think of this same behavior as resting, face saving, lack of skill, an accident, and reluctance to begin a job that cannot be completed.

Four of the most common human failings in relation to job failures are carelessness, absenteeism, nonco-operation, and laziness.

Carelessness is a personal matter. The fault does not develop overnight but is frequently a result of inadequate training during the formative years.

Although absenteeism has no single cause, employees usually name physical illness as the reason because they know it is an acceptable one.

Nonco-operation or negativism shows up in many ways—slowdowns, disagreeable attitudes, quality of workmanship below standard, declination of responsibility—"passing the buck," and failure to assist others.

Laziness may be due to either a physical or mental condition.

All causes of failures such as the above have their sources. If the source of the failing can be uncovered, the supervisor can take the necessary steps to salvage the employee and prevent the discharge.—GEORGE F. STARK.

Testing

Pitfalls in the Use of Psychological Tests. Daniel M. Goodacre III. *Personnel*. March-April, 1958.

A selection test may be just as good as the publisher claims it is—for some other

company. There are no good or bad psychological tests—there are only good or bad test users.

Every test should have a manual that thoroughly describes how to interpret the test and its practical applicability. The manual should either indicate the specific correlation between the test scores and job performance measures or state that there is no such known relationship. By following these two recommendations alone, most mail-order tests can be eliminated from further consideration.

A validation study can always be made to determine statistically how well the test can select specific groups of employees. Smaller companies without personnel research facilities of their own can obtain such studies inexpensively by using outside facilities. Most state employment services are equipped to conduct test validation studies at no cost to the employer. Other excellent sources of help in validating tests are the psychology departments of local universities, industrial psychology graduate students, and consulting firms. The only way for the individual company to be sure that a selection test suits its particular needs is to have it validated against a performance criterion in its own situation.

Studies show that it is easier to develop valid psychological tests for skilled workers than for supervisory or managerial people. The situational test, although still in the experimental stage, may prove useful in selecting higher-level employees. In this type of test the applicant is subjected to a situation requiring similar behavior to that demanded by the job. These tests have not yet appeared in commercial form for supervisory selection. Situational testing merits extensive investigation and may produce the results hoped for but not achieved in psychological testing for the selection of sales, supervisory, and managerial personnel.—MILDRED PERLMAN.

1958 PPA Abstracters

The following members of the Public Personnel Association have accepted the editor's invitation to serve as abstracters of articles for the "Personnel Literature" section of *Public Personnel Review* in 1958.

Robert A. Earle, Director of Personnel, City of Fort Lauderdale, Fort Lauderdale, Florida

Henry E. Hall, Senior Test Technician, Texas Merit System Council, Austin, Texas

Harry C. Martin, Merit System Director, Commonwealth of Kentucky, Personnel Council, Frankfort, Kentucky

Orville M. Mitchell, Personnel Officer, Ontario Department of Public Works, Toronto, Canada

Mildred Perlman, Office of the Chairman, City Civil Service Commission, New York, New York

Jane Pugh, Supervising Examiner, Civil Service Commission, Chicago, Illinois

Jerry C. Riley, Personnel Analyst, California State Personnel Board, Los Angeles, California

Edward Scheinkman, Assistant Personnel Examiner, Department of Personnel, New York, New York

Charles J. Setzer, Assistant Personnel Examiner, New York City Personnel Department, New York, New York

George F. Stark, Regional Representative, State Merit Systems, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Kansas City, Missouri

J. L. JACOBS & COMPANY

*Counselors in Personnel Administration
Since 1915*

POSITION CLASSIFICATION—SALARY PLANS
RECRUITING AND EXAMINATION
STANDARDS

EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE RATINGS

PERSONNEL RECORDS SIMPLIFICATION

RULES AND REGULATIONS

PERSONNEL MANUALS

53 West Jackson Blvd. Chicago 4, Ill.

LESTER B. KNIGHT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

*Member, Association of Consulting
Management Engineers, Inc.*

Standard Personnel Techniques
Classification & Salary Plans
Personnel Records, Procedures, Regulations

Organization and Methods
General Organization Studies
Paperwork Management
Advanced Systems Work

Staff Development
Work Simplification
Executive Development
Organization of Staff Facilities

CHICAGO NEW YORK
WASHINGTON, D. C.

LOUIS J. KROEGER and ASSOCIATES

A complete staff of public personnel
specialists available for personnel in-
stallations, reviews, test preparation,
and related services.

64 Pine Street, San Francisco

426 S. Spring Street, Los Angeles

826 DuPont Circle Bldg.
Washington, D. C.

LEE ASSOCIATES INC.

Established 1946

FR 7-2718

An experienced staff of public person-
nel specialists available for surveys
and installations.

The Johnston Building
Charlotte 2, N. C.

MANAGEMENT SERVICES ASSOCIATES, INC.

* * * *

Management Consultants
to
Government & Business

* * * *

H. Elliot Kaplan, President
Richard S. Austin Edward J. McGrew, Jr.
William Jansen Albert H. Morgan
Albert Pleydell Arthur W. Wallander

* * * *

93 Worth Street, New York 13, N. Y.

McDOWELL-MITCHELL Associates

Consultants

IN PUBLIC RELATIONS AND
MANAGEMENT PROBLEMS
INCLUDING RECORDS MANAGEMENT
919 Washington St., Wilmington, Del.

Affiliate: Chas. P. Messick & Associates
Specialists in Personnel Management

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION SERVICE

CONSULTING • RESEARCH
PUBLISHING

A unique record of more than three
hundred successful personnel surveys
and installations.

1313 East 60th Street
Chicago 37, Illinois

JAMES O. YARGER AND ASSOCIATES

PERSONNEL AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES

Services for all units of government:
Position Classification and Salary Plans
Retirement Systems
Personnel Ordinances and Regulations
Employee Selection and Evaluation
Administrative and Fiscal Surveys

An experienced senior staff for your use

309 Walnut St., Falls Church, Virginia

Extraordinarily Important

*First history of the United States civil service
in more than fifty years*

HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES CIVIL SERVICE

by Paul P. Van Riper, Cornell University

The only modern history of the United States civil service. Lucidly written and amply documented. Indispensable for personnel administrators and other government officials, for teachers of public personnel administration, and for students of political institutions. The book interrelates the growth of public and private personnel administration, and therefore is of value to personnelists in business as well.

The growth of the civil service since 1789 is traced, with major emphases given to the period since World War II and to developments in the Eisenhower administration. The book places the national civil service in the broadest social and political perspective, relating its development to that of the country, the constitution, the political parties, and public administration in general.

xvii + 588 pp.

\$7.50

SPECIAL OFFER TO MEMBERS OF PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION. Fifteen percent discount or a net price of \$6.38 postpaid if check accompanies order.

ROW, PETERSON AND COMPANY

Evanston, Illinois

White Plains, New York

PERSONNEL READINGS

LEAFLETS

BETTER STAFF MEETINGS— AND YOU

By John Hader. Leaflet No. 5. Price: 20 cents.

YOU ARE A BETTER SPEAKER THAN YOU THINK

By William Oncken, Jr. Leaflet No. 4. Price: 20 cents.

DON'T DO IT YOURSELF!—

New ideas on delegation as a training tool

By Julius E. Eittington. Leaflet No. 3. Price: 10 cents.

THE PROBLEM EMPLOYEE—

An Answer for Management

By Albert Kransdorf. Leaflet No. 2. Price: 20 cents.

SO YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT FIRING SOMEBODY!

By R. G. Beers. Leaflet No. 1. Price: 10 cents.

PAMPHLETS

STIMULATING THE WILL TO LEARN—

Employee Training Incentives

By Homer T. Rosenberger. Pamphlet No. 16. Price: \$1.00; Member price: 50 cents.

JOB DESIGN—

Meeting the Manpower Challenge

By George H. Hieronymus. Pamphlet No. 15. Price: \$1.00; Member price: 50 cents.

THE CASE METHOD—

**A Technique of Management
Development**

Pamphlet No. 14. Price: 75 cents; Member price: 50 cents.

PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS FOR PERSONNEL WORK

Pamphlet No. 13. Price: 50 cents; Member price: 25 cents.

A GUIDE TO COLLEGE RECRUITMENT

Pamphlet No. 12. Price: 50 cents; Member price: 25 cents.

HOW TO ORGANIZE AND ADMINISTER AN EMPLOYEE TRAINING PROGRAM

By Homer T. Rosenberger. Pamphlet No. 11. Price: \$1.00; Member price: 50 cents.

POSITION-EVALUATION TECHNIQUES—

A Discussion and Appraisal

Pamphlet No. 10. Price: 50 cents; Member price: 25 cents.

EXECUTIVE DEVELOPMENT IN ACTION—

Patterns and Techniques

By Raymond L. Randall. Pamphlet No. 9. Price: \$1.00; Member price: 50 cents.

FEDERAL CAREER SERVICE—

A Look Ahead

Pamphlet No. 8. Price: \$1.50; Member price: 75 cents.

SUPERVISION AND SUPERVISORY TRAINING

Pamphlet No. 7. Price: \$1.00; Member price: 50 cents.

WAYS TO SPEED UP REMOVAL OF UNSATISFACTORY EMPLOYEES

Pamphlet No. 6. Price: 50 cents; Member price: 25 cents.

PROPOSAL FOR A FEDERAL ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF COLLEGE

Pamphlet No. 5. Price: \$1.00; Member price: 25 cents.

TRAINING YOUR EMPLOYEES—

**Suggestions to Executives and
Supervisors**

By Milton Hall. Pamphlet No. 3. Price: 50 cents; 5 to 9 copies: 35 cents; 10 or more copies: 25 cents; Member price: 25 cents.

Quantity prices (except for Pamphlet No. 3) 1 to 9 copies: full price; 10 to 24 copies: 20% off; 25 to 99 copies: 30% off; 100 or more copies: 40% off.

SOCIETY FOR PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

5506 Connecticut Avenue N.W., Washington, D. C.